

**T.C.
KOCAELİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
BATI DİLLERİ VE EDEBİYATI ANABİLİM DALI
İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI BİLİM DALI**

**A STUDY ON *BILDUNGSROMAN* WITH THE ANALYSES OF
JAMES JOYCE'S *A PORTRAIT OF THE ARTIST AS A YOUNG
MAN* AND THOMAS MANN'S *DEATH IN VENICE***

MASTER'S THESIS

MELİSA İNAL

KOCAELİ, 2019

**T.C.
KOCAELİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
BATI DİLLERİ VE EDEBİYATI ANABİLİM DALI
İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI BİLİM DALI**

**A STUDY ON *BILDUNGSROMAN* WITH THE ANALYSES OF
JAMES JOYCE'S *A PORTRAIT OF THE ARTIST AS A YOUNG
MAN* AND THOMAS MANN'S *DEATH IN VENICE***

MASTER'S THESIS

MELİSA İNAL

DANIŞMAN: PROF. DR. METİN TOPRAK

KOCAELİ, 2019

T.C.
KOCAELİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
BATI DİLLERİ VE EDEBİYATI ANABİLİM DALI
İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI BİLİM DALI

A STUDY ON *BILDUNGSROMAN* WITH THE ANALYSES OF JAMES
JOYCE'S *A PORTRAIT OF THE ARTIST AS A YOUNG MAN* AND
THOMAS MANN'S *DEATH IN VENICE*

MASTER'S THESIS

Tez Hazırlayan: Melisa İNAL

Tezin Kabul Edildiği Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu Karar ve No: 26.06.2019/18

Jüri Başkanı: Prof. Dr. Metin TOPRAK

(İmza)

Jüri Üyesi: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Seda ÇOŞAR ÇELİK

(İmza)

Jüri Üyesi: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Berna KÖSEOĞLU

(İmza)

KOCAELİ, 2019

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Metin TOPRAK for his advice, criticism, encouragements and insight throughout this dissertation. Without his great support and immediate feedbacks, it would not be possible to finish this study in a short period. I also would like to offer my special thanks to his beloved daughter, Helin Rana TOPRAK who makes various important sources reachable for this study. I really appreciate their voluntarily help and support.

I also would like to express my very great appreciation to my lecturers at Kocaeli University, English Language and Literature Department. I am really indebted to them for widening my horizon and knowledge in literature and criticism.

I also owe much to my family, especially my mother, Hübriye İNAL and father, Yavuz İNAL for their invaluable patience, love and support. I would also like to thank my colleagues and friends especially Barış ERGÜN, Pınar YÜKSEL and Selin ARMAĞAN who have supported me with their invaluable help and friendship throughout my writing process. I would not be able to complete this study without their unrequited support and continuous guidance.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ÖZET.....	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
INTRODUCTION.....	1
CHAPTER ONE	
1. THE <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i>	10
1.1.THE DEFINITION OF <i>BILD</i> AND <i>BILDUNG</i>	10
1.2.HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i>	14
1.3.THE LITERARY THEORIES ON THE <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i> AND ITS GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS AND THEMES	23
CHAPTER TWO	
2. MODERNISM AND THE <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i>	37
2.1. MODERNISM AND THE <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i>	37
2.1.1. Modernist Impact on <i>A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man</i> and <i>Death in Venice</i>	43
2.2. THE <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i> IN GERMAN AND ENGLISH CULTURES ..	47
2.3. <i>KUNSTLERROMAN</i>	52
2.3.1. <i>A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man</i> and <i>Death in Venice</i> as <i>Künstlerromane</i>	52
2.4. <i>ANTI-BILDUNGSROMAN</i>	56
CHAPTER THREE	
3. AN ANALYSIS OF <i>A PORTRAIT OF THE ARTIST AS A YOUNG MAN</i> ...	60
3.1. A DETAILED INTRODUCTION TO THE NOVEL.....	60
3.2. JOYCE AND STEPHEN.....	64
3.3. FROM CHILDHOOD TO MATURITY	68
3.4. STEPHEN’S ARTISTIC GROWTH	75
3.5. PARENTAL IMPACTS ON STEPHEN’S DEVELOPMENT	80

3.6. THE INFLUENCE OF IRISH NATIONALISM AND RELIGION ON STEPHEN'S DEVELOPMENT.....	85
3.7. SELF-IMPOSED EXILE THROUGH EPIPHANIES	90
CHAPTER FOUR	
4. AN ANALYSIS OF <i>DEATH IN VENICE</i>.....	94
4.1. A DETAILED INTRODUCTION TO THE NOVELLA.....	94
4.2. APOLLO VERSUS DIONYSUS.....	100
4.3. MANN AND ASCHENBACH.....	102
4.4. CHARACTERISTICS OF <i>BILDUNGSROMAN</i> IN <i>DEATH IN VENICE</i>	104
4.5. CHARACTERISTICS OF <i>ANTI-BILDUNGSROMAN</i> IN <i>DEATH IN VENICE</i>.....	107
4.5.1. The Issue of Maturity and Artistic Growth.....	108
4.5.2. The Issue of Homosexual Love.....	112
4.5.3. The Unconventional Ending.....	118
CONCLUSION.....	121
WORKS CITED.....	127
CURRICULUM VITAE.....	138

ÖZET

Bu tezin amacı genellikle talihsiz olaylarca sınırdığı süreç içerisinde kimlik arayışına, eğitimine, aile ve toplumun diğer üyeleri ile olan ilişkilerine, aşk maceralarına ve sanat uğraşına odaklanan gelişim sürecindeki genç bir insanın hikâyesini anlatan *Bildungsroman* geleneğinin alt türlerinin belirli tanımlarını, özelliklerini ve temalarını ele almak ve incelemektir. Geleneksel *Bildungsroman*'ın kahramanı uyumlu bir birey olmak için özellikle evlenerek ya da toplumun ihtiyaçlarını tatmin eden bir işe girerek kendini o toplumun bir parçası haline getirebilmek adına etrafını saran koşulları anlamaya çaba gösterir.

Fakat modernist, post-modernist ve post kolonyal dönemlerle birlikte *Bildungsroman* geleneği de büyüyen ve gelişen bir tür olarak değişmeye başlamıştır. James Joyce ve Thomas Mann, geleceğin sanatçıların ya da varolan sanatçıların sanatlarında ustalaşma süreçlerini konu alan *Bildungsroman*'ın ve alt türü *Künstlerroman* türüne ait *Sanatçının Bir Genç Adam Olarak Portesi* ve *Venedik'te Ölüm* eserlerini modernist bir anlayış ile biçimlendirerek yaratmışlardır. Bahsedilen *Bildungsroman* ve *Künstlerroman* türlerinin tema ve konularının açığa kavuşturulması için bu tezde bu iki roman detaylı bir şekilde analiz edilmiştir. Odak ise, işlediği homoseksüellik gibi post-modern ya da post-kolonyal konular nedeniyle zamanının çok ötesinde olan *Venedik'te Ölüm*'ü, geleneksel ve modernist *Bildungsroman* için yaygın olmayan saptırılmış ve alışılmamış temalar açısından, *Anti-Bildungsroman* olarak tanımlamakta olacaktır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Bildungsroman, Künstlerroman, Anti-Bildungsroman, modernism, post-modernism, post-kolonyal, James Joyce, Thomas Mann

ABSTRACT

The general aim of this dissertation is demonstrating the certain definitions, characteristics, themes, and sub-genres of the *Bildungsroman* tradition, which tells the story of a young person in his development process by focusing on his quest for identity, schooling, relationship with his family and other members of the society, love affairs, and search for vocation while being tested by misfortunate events. The traditional hero of the *Bildungsroman* tries to complete his apprenticeship and be a master of his own life after achieving self-actualisation and cultivation in a way. He spends his efforts on understanding the circumstances which surround him to be able to be a part of the society as a compatible individual by especially getting married or starting a proper job that satisfies the need of society.

However, with the arrival of modernist, post-modernist, and post-colonial periods, the *Bildungsroman* tradition has started to change as a flourishing genre. By gaining modernist insights and styles, writers, James Joyce and Thomas Mann, have created their literary works, *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and *Death in Venice*, which are going to be analysed in a detailed way in this thesis to enlighten the themes and subjects of modernist *Bildungsroman* and *Künstlerroman* as a sub-genre that portrays the artists-to-be or artists in their development process while mastering in their arts. The focus also is going to be on the definition of *Anti-Bildungsroman* since *Death in Venice* is going to be analysed in terms of its subverted and unconventional themes which is not common for traditional and modernist *Bildungsroman* as a novella ahead of its time by concentration on the post-modernist or post-colonial themes such as homosexuality.

Key words: Bildungsroman, Künstlerroman, Anti-Bildungsroman, modernism, post-modernism, post-colonial, James Joyce, Thomas Mann

INTRODUCTION

The novel tradition, which is considered a work of prose fiction, has been an important part of every nation's literature since the early 18th century. With the rise of this literary narrative style, it has become inevitable not to witness the rise of other types of fiction. The *Bildungsroman*, which is also known as the novel of formation, is one of the most popular ones among these literary types of fiction (Golban, 2017:111). As claimed by Sarah Graham, it is so popular that "[a]nyone who reads fiction will eventually encounter a Bildungsroman- a novel about a young person facing the challenges of growing up- because it is one of the most popular and enduring genres in literary history" (Graham, 2019:1). Consequently, its popularity has caused a great deal of debates around the world due to its being a "slippery category". Literary critics sometimes call it as

...it "a phantom genre" (Sammons 239), comment on the difficulty of translating it into English (Buckley viii), volunteer their own terms of definition such as "novel of formation" (Hirsch 293) or "African American narratives of Bildung" (Kester 8), question the existence of "a separate female Bildungsroman" (Lazarro-Weis 34), and worry that by examining revisions of the genre in a non-Western context they might "run the risk of inflicting yet another Eurocentric body of thought" onto texts which have a life and history of their own (Stein 23) (Bolaki, 2011:10).

As a genre the *Bildungsroman*, which was born in the early 18th century Germany, "is structurally founded upon the contradiction between the ideals of humanism and Germany's concrete historical situation" (Ever, 2013:12). It has found its way in other countries and developed in a great deal. As Golban mentions in his essay "An Attempt to Establish a Bildungsroman Development History: Nurturing the Rise of a Subgenre from Ancient Beginnings to Romanticism" (2017), despite being a part of German culture, emerging in German national literature, and having a German origin,

...the Bildungsroman, or the novel of formation, has certainly developed to the present day as an international and multi-national novelistic category, extremely rich and complex within the English-language literary production in Britain as well as America, Canada, and Australia (Golban, 2017: 112).

Most probably being “the first type of novel allowing the hero and the heroine to speak “(112), the *Bildungsroman*, which has derived from the German words *Bild* and *Bildung*, has helped its protagonist experience a quest/journey through which the reader can gain “a greater enrichment as the protagonist journeys from youth to psychological or emotional maturity” (Thamarana, 2015:22). The protagonist has been tested throughout his journey by experiencing failures in love, family, career, and many other fields and after dealing with all these misfortunes, he understands the importance and meaning of life. He compromises with the society and becomes a wiser person by achieving cultivation of mind, spiritual and mental development and self-realisation after his epiphany. While in most *Bildungsroman* novels, the journey of the protagonist helps him/her experience a positive development or gain a broad insight, there are some other literary works which can also be a part of *Bildungsroman* tradition, however, they end up with a negative and destructive way for the protagonist. These types of works can be classified under the name “*Anti-Bildungsroman*” which subverts the characteristics of classical *Bildungsroman* by embodying misfit characters who cannot compromise with the society and the era they live in. These anti-heroes can fail to reach a happy ending and not able to complete their cultivation and formation unlike the heroes of the *Bildungsroman* who educate themselves with the unfortunate circumstances. Under the effect of movements such as modernism, post-modernism, or post-colonial literature, even if they complete the development process, they prefer to leave their society behind instead of having a vocation and reconciling with them especially by establishing a social contract like marriage or their fates lead them through their inevitable or volunteer deaths since there is no place for them in the society and time they live in.

In this study, the main focus is going to be analysing the novella *Death in Venice* (1912) by Thomas Mann as an *Anti-Bildungsroman* in the light of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* (1916) by James Joyce which is accepted as a well-known modern *Bildungsroman*. Chapter 1 will be enlightening the sub-genre *Bildungsroman*, its development over the years, characteristics, and most-used themes by touching on some influential examples of the *Bildungsroman* genre in especially German and English literature by significant writers and scholars.

In chapter 2, along with these points, the crucial reason why these two modernist works of literature had been chosen is going to be mentioned with a broader definition of modernism and its effect on the genre since it is impossible for a flourishing genre like *Bildungsroman* not to be affected by modernist movement as “an exemplary genre for the representation of subjectivity, subject formation, and the relation of the subject to modern social formation” (Castle, 2006: 249). Following that, the modernist influences on the chosen works, *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* by James Joyce and *Death in Venice* by Thomas Mann, will be portrayed as Joyce’s use of stream-of-consciousness and their mutual representation of free indirect speech, inner monologues and subjects, which deal with modern individual problems, turn these outstanding novels into modernist *Bildungsromane* despite still having some traditional characteristics. In other words, these writers make it possible for readers to apprehend the reason why their heroes cannot reconcile with the society and be compatible individuals thanks to their styles which are ahead of their times.

Additionally, a place will be given the development of German and English *Bildungsroman* since *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* is a product of British literature and *Death in Venice* a German prose fiction. The *Bildungsroman*, which has changed his meaning and form under the influence of German Mysticism, Enlightenment, and the Romantic period by gaining a more secular meaning like “cultivation of an individual” instead of “moulding oneself in the image of God”, finds its way through European literature after being originated by German writers especially by Goethe with his *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjare* (*Wilhelm Meister’s Apprenticeship*) (1795) (Boes, 2012: 48). In the light of this change, the differences between German and British contexts, such as German’s dealing with inner conflicts and British’s putting emphasis on outer forces like politics and religion more, are going to be enlightened.

The chapter is going to continue with the definitions of sub-genres of the *Bildungsroman* by focusing more on *Künstlerroman*, the literary type which deals with the artistic growth and development of the sensitive artist in the process of mastering through his art, and *Anti-Bildungsroman* that touches upon subversions and unconventional themes instead of letting his heroes experience the same

successful development processes like in the case of traditional *Bildungsroman*. The reason why these two sub-genres are analysed in particular lies in the fact that both of the books are actually can also be called as *Künstlerroman* since *A Portrait* tells the story of young Stephen, who cannot find it possible to flourish his artistic side and become a writer in his restricted country Ireland, while Aschenbach, the well-known and famous writer of Thomas Mann in *Death in Venice* creates great works thanks to his distinguished views on aestheticism, art, and beauty. As for *Anti-Bildungsroman*, it is necessary to illuminate the definition and themes of this sub-genre since *Death in Venice* displays characteristics of this literary type with its reverse development of the quite old protagonist rather than a young man and its dealing with unconventional and unusual topics like homosexuality and unexpected death of Aschenbach who cannot reconcile with the society.

As for analysis chapters, In Chapter Three, the focus is going to be on *A Portrait of the Artist a Young Man*. This modernist novel of James Joyce, which is written in 1916, actually forms the basis of various literary articles, dissertations, and books with its interesting and distinguishing themes and new literary techniques. To exemplify, Tobias Boes in his article, " 'A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man' and the 'Individuating Rhythm' of Modernity" (2008), discusses the modern techniques and literary means, especially epiphany and leitmotifs that Joyce uses to reveal his protagonist, Stephen Dadaus's inner conflicts as he comes to conclusion that

Epiphany and leitmotif represent the antagonistic- yet closely intertwined- extremes of this development. By switching back and forth between them, Joyce creates not only a "polyrhythmic" texture previously unknown to Anglophone fiction, but also moves the time-honored novel of development firmly into the age of empire and towards an engagement with many of the historical traumata that would come to define the twentieth century (Boes, 2008: 782).

In addition to Boes, who appreciates the use of modernist literary instruments in *A Portrait*, E. Delores Betts Stephens gives place to another modernist narrative technique in her dissertation "The Stream of Consciousness Technique in The Novels of James Joyce" in 1962. She believes that it will not be possible to acquire a full understanding of James Joyce's works if this modernist technique is not understood completely. After giving a detailed description on the subject, she analyses three

different books, *Ulysses*, *Finnegans Wake*, and *A Portrait of the Artist as A Young Man* in this respect. However, he gives a great place to *A Portrait* since it

...was quite conventional. It is important because it gives autobiographical information and because it contains the statement of his aesthetic beliefs. It also can be said to mark the beginning of his use of the stream of consciousness technique. Between this novel and the next, he had exiled himself from Ireland and from conventional literary genres (Stephens, 1962: 69).

This statement on modernist scope of the novel by Stephen is followed by another modernist reading with emphasising on the narrative style that is used. A. Faridpour and H. Ouliaeinia analyse the book under the title of “The Ordering Process of Narrative in James Joyce's *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*” in 2011. They aim at approaching “the problem of narrative and history and the role of narrative in the representation of reality in this novel” since one of the major concerns of modern historiography is how to represent the concept of reality in a narrative framework coherently (1). Therefore, they show how Joyce deals with the projection of the reality by means of literary devices that he uses.

Apart from modernist literary techniques, the themes that Joyce chooses to handle in his book, are also discussed by several scholars. To illustrate, Mikael Sewerin writes his work with the title of “The Deconstruction of Maturity in Joyce's *Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*” in 2014. Even if he touches upon the field of this dissertation by dealing with the book as a *Bildungsroman*, his main focus is “the use of irony in Joyce's *Portrait*, claiming that it has the effect of deconstructing common notions of maturity” (i). Another critic, who gives place to analysis of the book as both *Bildungsroman* and *Künstlerroman* shortly, is Ida Brenden Engholt in his “Tales of Truth and Imagination Generic ambiguity in James Joyce's *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and Virginia Woolf's *Orlando*” in 2010. Similarly, she also mentions some characteristics of the book as *Bildungsroman*, while also claiming that the work is pseudo-autobiographical because of the similarities between Joyce and Stephen. Additionally, she reveals the themes and characteristics which makes *A Portrait* a *Künstlerroman* with his artist-protagonist Stephen. However, the difference between this dissertation and Engholt's work lies in the fact that while she only gives limited places to prove that the book can be read as an

example of these genres, this dissertation solely focuses on the parts which makes the novel a true *Bildungsroman* with a modernist approach.

Mentioning *Künstlerroman*, which is also analysed in this dissertation and as the protagonist of the novel tries to accomplish his artistic growth, Jolanta Wawrzycka discusses what makes *A Portrait* a *Künstlerroman* in her “‘Tell Us, Aren’t You an Artist?’ (sh 26) –Revisiting Joyce’s *Künstlerroman*” in 2017. By giving place to different opinions from different scholars, she discloses the positive and negative criticisms on the matter of the artist in the book. She herself finds the self-imposed exile of Stephen necessary in order to achieve artistic freedom like Joyce. The only difference between her article and this dissertation is that while this one does not only handle the topic of *Künstlerroman*, and not give a broader definition of the sub-genre, she spends almost fifteen pages to the analysis of the book in accordance with the characteristics of the *Künstlerroman*. Another critic, who analyses the book with the scope of *Künstlerroman*, is Whitney Standlee in her “George Egerton, James Joyce and the Irish *Künstlerroman*” in 2010. However, her aim is very different from the previous article that mentioned and this dissertation since she tries to reach conclusion that Egerton’s works can also be valuable as Joyce’s works of art and she “deserves to be revalued and reclaimed as a writer of significance to the Irish literary tradition” (Standlee, 2010: 450).

Along with these studies, there are some other articles and dissertations which share the same purpose and basis with this dissertation. In this study, after giving a detailed introduction of the novel, the resemblances and differences between James Joyce and his protagonist, Stephen Dedalus are going to be presented with a brief synopsis of the book. Following this, the themes, which make *A Portrait* a modernist *Bildungsroman*, are going to be shown from childhood to maturity by emphasising on Stephen’s artistic growth and search for identity which ends up with his self-imposed exile after leaving his family, friends, and country behind. Similarly, Jerome Hamilton Buckley gives a place to the analysis of *A Portrait* in his book *Season of Youth: The Bildungsroman from Dickens to Golding* under the chapter of “Portrait of James Joyce as a Young Aesthete” in 1974. He especially emphasises the autobiographical side of the book with the role of the family, nation, and religion on Stephen’s development. In addition to Buckley’s book, Conor Small’s dissertation

also carries similar concerns with this study. With the title of “*Bildungsroman*, Print culture, and the Multiple Versions of *A Portrait of the Artist As A Young Man*: ‘In the Smithy of My Soul’”, Small mostly enlightens the origins of the book which is actually derived from Joyce’s another novel, *Stephen Hero*. He emphasises more on how the book gains recognition in the media while also mentioning some themes of the *Bildungsroman*. However, it differentiates with this dissertation with its main concern which is print culture and different versions of the book. This study is more like Buckley’s version which only deals with scope of *Bildungsroman* which makes mentioning modernism and *Künstlerroman* necessary since Joyce tries to portray a young man who leaves his own country for the sake of being a successful artist with using different modernist literary techniques. Furthermore, rather than only dealing with narrative styles and literary devices, in this study, the major themes of *Bildungsroman* such as childhood, maturity, impact of the family, alienation, and self-imposed exile are going to be analysed and shown in *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* since it is a modernist example of this genre.

As for Chapter 4, *Death in Venice* by Thomas Mann is analysed again in the light of *Bildungsroman*. However, apart from any other articles or studies, this dissertation approaches to the novella from a very different respect. While there are not almost any references to *Death in Venice* as a *Bildungsroman*, this study embraces the book as an example of *Anti-Bildungsroman*. The existing studies range from the use of mythology to stylistic devices in Mann’s novella. To exemplify, John G. Root discusses the use of irony in the novella in his “Stylistic Irony in Thomas Mann” in 1960. He believes that Mann uses different ironical devices in his works including *Death in Venice* such as the device of digression, recurrence, oscillation or leitmotifs. With his major concern of irony, he uncovers a very different perspective from the purpose of this dissertation since this study only mentions irony to reveal the distance between Mann and his homosexual protagonist, Gustav von Aschenbach. In other words, rather than other types of ironical devices, ironical distance of the writer is taken into consideration.

As far as mythology concerned, it is possible to find a great deal of studies on the subject. For example, John T. Sizemore Jr. mentions mythological references and characters in his article “An Analysis of Art Represented in Classical Mythology in

Mann's *Death in Venice*" in 2014. She "examines the references to classical Greek and Roman mythology as the foundation for the artistic conflict in Mann's *Death in Venice*" (235). Even though there is no connection between *Bildungsroman* and *Anti-Bildungsroman* and Sizemore's article, it has been benefited from this study to reveal the symbolism that Mann uses throughout the book which has been necessary since it would not be possible to show the connection between characteristics of these genres and mythological figures. In addition to Sizemore, Gary Astrachan has also discussed the book on a mythological basis with the title "Dionysus in Thomas Mann's Novella, 'Death in Venice'" in 1990. Likewise, even though Astrachan does not directly link the novella with the *Bildungsroman* tradition, it also becomes a great help as understanding Aschenbach will not be possible without knowing the influence of Nietzsche's dichotomy on his character. Nietzsche believes that to be able to create the highest art of tragedy, a play must include the conflict between Apollonian and Dionysian forces (Nietzsche, 1999: 14). Therefore, Astrachan's study is beneficial since he mentions how the Dionysian urges lead Aschenbach to his demise which also makes the novella an *Anti-Bildungsroman* with its unconventional ending, death. Similarly, another critic A. E. Dyson writes an article with the name of "The Stranger God: 'Death in Venice'" which also describes what "the stranger God" stands for in the novella by explaining its Dionysian symbolism, as well.

Another topic is studied in a great deal, is "homosexuality" which is another theme that makes *Death in Venice* an *Anti-Bildungsroman*. By contrast with this dissertation, the articles and studies on the subject are usually interested in defining what homosexuality is, why a person starts to have homosexual tendency, or whether Mann is a homosexual or not like his protagonist. To illustrate, Cathrin Winkelmann writes her dissertation on "Distance and Desire: Homoeroticism in Thomas Mann's *Death in Venice*" in 1995. Although this study does not entirely is about homosexuality, it still benefits from her "Distance and Desire" since Mann's handling this unconventional subject is important to establish a link between *Anti-Bildungsroman*, which is different from traditional and modernist *Bildungsroman* with its subverted themes such as homosexuality, and homoeroticism. Winkelmann states that he creates this work

to examine how homosexuality is represented in Thomas Mann's 1913 novella *Death in Venice*, and to demonstrate how Mann was able to incorporate such a taboo issue in a story that Wilhelmine Germany would come to embrace (i).

However, by touching upon similar elements, this thesis mostly deals with untraditional tendency of Aschenbach, who unlike any other *Bildungsroman* hero, cannot develop because of his homosexual urges and shows a degradation of personality rather than gaining a deserved and respected place in the society. Indeed, as an already respected and loved writer, he experiences a reverse development process by acting like a child in a state of Dionysian frenzy. Furthermore, this study also gets help from G.A. Schuiling's "Death in Venice: The homosexuality enigma" (2004). However, rather than analysing the theme of homosexuality in a detailed way, he tries to define the term and reasons behind it by focusing more the genetic and biological factors that homosexuality has sprung up. In contrast to these studies above, this thesis, after introductory part, will give a place to Nietzsche's Apollonian and Dionysian dichotomy since Mann bases his character, Aschenbach, upon the conflict between these destructive forces. In addition to this part, a compare and contrast are going to be made between Mann and Aschenbach with a brief summary of the novella following the characteristics of *Bildungsroman* and *Anti-Bildungsroman* such as use of epiphanies, lust for journey, the issue of maturity and artistic growth, the theme of homosexuality and unconventional ending.

CHAPTER ONE

1. THE *BILDUNGSROMAN*

1.1. THE DEFINITION OF *BILD* AND *BILDUNG*

Bildungsroman, as one of the most popular and crucial fictional literary types of the history, has always been found difficult to be described. To understand the scope of this well-known literary genre, one should first be familiar with the origin of the German words *Bild* and *Bildung* which are defined by so many scholars and authors in order to give a comprehensive and far-reaching description.

The word *Bild*, which is derived from the German verb *bilden*, can be translated as “image”, “painting”, “figure” or “trope” (qtd. in Graham 2019:2). With the suffix *-ung*, the word implies “an act, a process or an occurrence, by which somebody or something becomes an image, *or* with the image that emerges at the end of, or as a result of, an act, a process or an occurrence” (Nordenbo, 2002:341). This newly derived word *Bildung* mentions a “formation” or a kind of “transformation” and it has a religious connotation which can be traced back to the 14th century “medieval mysticism (*Bild* as the image of God) and its transformation through the Enlightenment into a neo-humanism.” (qtd.in Fulford and Hodgson 2016:122). Srinivasan claims that religious people of the late Middle Ages believe in “Biblical doctrine that man has God’s image imprinted within him” and one should

...mould oneself into God’s image or *Bild* (type) by imitating the divine *Urbild* (archetype), on the one hand by directing one’s attention to it, and, on the other hand, by removing the contingent impurities arising out of the bodily material existence. German mystics like Meister Eckhart provide an example: he believed that the Universal Spirit that emerged from the Creator and was present in every being became impure through its contact with bodily matter and had to be purified before it could merge with the Creator. The process itself was ‘described as an “odyssey”, during which an individual must “sculpt away impurities” until the soul becomes a “a work of art” or virtuous...Referring to this

sculpting metaphor, the mystics called such introspection *bilden*’ (qtd. in Srinivasan, 2019).

From medieval era to the period of Reformation, thanks to Martin Luther, this idea of “odyssey” turns into “a larger education process”. By giving interpretation of Bible liberty, Luther enabled to eliminate the priest as a means of messenger between God and ordinary people. “Thus, the form of self-cultivation with a focus on the purification of one’s inner life and scriptural study which was earlier restricted to Christian mystics and monastic orders gets laicised and becomes obligatory for all.” and people started to “be responsible for their own salvation through their direct, personal relationship to God.” By reintroducing the Augustine doctrine, Luther made the “outer”, “material” world and the “inner”, “spiritual” world possible to be cultivated together by the individuals themselves (Srinivasan, 2019).

The 18th century German Pietism is affected by this idea of self-cultivation. In the centre of this “religious phenomenon” lies “the idea of a personal spiritual rebirth, with a high sense of community” (Summerfield and Downward, 2010:13). Pietists believed that *Bildung* refers to “the restoration of the image of God”. After the First Sin and the Fall, Man, who “was created in God’s image (Vorbild), became “deformed”. The only way to save himself and have a redemption is re-building himself “through self-examination and meditation” (Gohlman, 1990:17). The same idea was explained by Todd Kontje as

...to God’s active transformation of the passive Christian. Since human beings have fallen out of their unity with God, and have become deformed through the Original Sin, they must prepare to receive God’s grace. The believer remains passive, as God impresses his image onto the fallen individual, and affets a redemptive transformation of the disfigured sinner back into the image of God (qtd.in Summerfield and Downward, 2010: 1-2).

In the core of this notion, as one can see, a “transformation” of man with the help of God, can be found. According to Gadamer, Man, by carrying the image of God in his soul, “must cultivate” himself because “he is fashioned” after God (Redfield, 1996:50).

During the Enlightenment, this theological definition of *Bildung* had changed and it gained a more secularized meaning. There was a semantic shift in the origin of the word. It moved from “its original mystical-Pietist context into a moral and aesthetic one; put differently, it was pried loose from the grasp of theology and rescued for philosophy, the new “queen of the sciences” during the Enlightenment” (Boes, 2012:48). This change in its meaning gave way to more religious-free definitions by emphasizing “epigenesis (self-generation) particularly in the works of Herder, Humboldt, Blumenbach, Goethe, Kant, and Schiller” (Ever, 2017: 395). Ever asserts two main reasons behind this shift

The first one has to do with the growing dissatisfaction with the mechanical account of nature put forward by Newton... Herder, for instance, delineates an organic trajectory behind the rise and fall of cultures in his *Ideas on the Philosophy of the History of Humanity* (1784-1791), and similarly Humboldt mobilizes organic metaphors to describe the development of human beings in *Limits of State Action* (1792). Around the same time, Goethe publishes his *Botanical Writings* (1790), as Kant puts forward an epigenetic model of rational development in his *Critiques*. Thus, in the course of the eighteenth century, Cartesian mistrust in the world and the rigid rationality of cogito seems to be partly mitigated by *bildung*'s more optimistic affirmation of life and a dynamic, developmental model of rationality. Consequently, organicism becomes the master narrative of modernity, as well as its aesthetic model (395-396).

To illustrate, Hans-Georg Gadamer (1900-2002), writes in his book *Truth and Method* (1975) Enlightenment rationalism paved the way for “a fundamentally new content”. Scholars like Herder, with the help of Enlightenment perfectionism developed the idea of “cultivating the human” (*Bildung zum Menschen*). Gadamer asserts that “*the concept of self-formation, education, or cultivation (Bildung) was “the greatest idea of the eighteenth century”* (Gadamer, 2004:8). This newly-defined *Bildung*, started to be associated with “the idea of culture” and “properly human way of developing one’s natural talents and capacities.” (9) Additionally, Kant, without using the the word *Bildung*, mentioned ““cultivating’ a capacity (or ‘natural talent’)”. With the impact of “Kantian idea”, Hegel came up with “*Sichbilden* (educating or cultivating oneself) and *Bildung*” (9).

As for another scholar Wilhelm von Humboldt (1767-1835), he claims that *Bildung* is an individual process through which one can achieve self-formation “if

external influences are not allowed to interfere with its impure material and impose demands from the outside” (Nordenbo, 2002:345). Man, who has to endow a meaning to his life, should develop his skills and abilities while connecting and creating a “harmonic whole” by gaining experience through life. He puts forward that

The ultimate task of life is to endow the concept ‘humanity’—in our person, both in our lifetime and beyond it through the traces we leave behind by our activity—with as rich a content as possible: this is only done by associating with the world in the most comprehensive, lively and freest interplay possible (qtd. in Nordenbo, 2002:348)

Influenced by Johann Gottfried Herder (1744-1803), who assumes that “*Bildung* refers to the products not of God’s handiwork, but of an impersonal genetic force that...drives human beings towards ever higher cultural achievements.”, Humboldt also refers that *Bildung* is “a spiritual and aesthetic education, a form of pedagogy divorced from the realm of means and ends” in his work *Ideen zu einem Versuch, die Grenzen der Wirksamkeit des Staates zu bestimmen* (1792) [*Ideas to Determine the Limits of State Authority*] (Boes, 2008:275). In addition to these ideas, he makes a difference between the words *Kultur* and *Bildung*. He thinks that the word *Bildung*, means “something both higher and more inward, namely the disposition of mind which, from the knowledge and the feeling of the total intellectual and moral endeavour, flows harmoniously into sensibility and character” (qtd. in Gadamer, 2004:9). This definition differentiates it from the word “culture” because it has a higher purpose which comes from ancient mystical tradition like cultivating oneself in image of God (10).

Even if he is not a philosopher, Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832), whose work, *Wilhelm Meister Lehrjahre* (1795-96) [*Wilhelm Meister’s Apprenticeship*], is accepted as a prototype of *Bildungsroman*, had his own ideas on *Bildung*. Having revealed his peculiar thoughts on individual development, he was influenced by philosophers like Spinoza, Kant, and Schelling.

He regarded himself as a pantheist, but it was irrelevant to him whether God was actually present in nature... As one writer puts it, “Nothing is more characteristic, more fundamental, in Goethe than this dynamism of his. Nature is everywhere alive and at work. There is no rest, no death, in the sense of final extinction or stagnation.” This Heraclitan view of

nature is modified by his belief in the above-mentioned process of reciprocity, i.e., the Bildungsprozess. To his Goethe added Schelling's idea of the evolution of the world-soul toward self-consciousness. "Its analog [in Goethe] is the self-conscious human ego which knows itself directly and not by any process of logical reasoning." In other words, the Bildungsprozess is not a strictly lateral process of action and reaction; Goethe saw it more as a spiral-like movement (Steigerung) whose upward limit was unknowable (Gohlman, 1990:22).

To conclude, all of these various definitions and ideas on *Bildung*, from theological to secular one, have provided a basis for the popular literary type, *Bildungsroman* even though it also has a great deal of definitions and descriptions along with its own peculiar characteristics, themes, and types.

1.2. HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE *BILDUNGSROMAN*

In the late eighteenth century, a type of novel, in which the protagonist experiences a spiritual, mental and psychological development, had emerged. This new genre, the *Bildungsroman*, which is the combination of novel and biography, became a source of debate since there was not a certain definition or translation of the meaning of term. The only thing which was agreed on was its being German-originated. The difficulty of translating the term made some scholars suggest that "its meaning should nonetheless emerge clearly from an account of the novels themselves and the steady recurrence of certain common motifs in them" (Buckley 1974: viii). The reason behind this translation-chaos has been caused by the word *Bildung* which the name of the genre was derived from. James Hardin writes in his *Reflection and Action: Essays on the Bildungsroman* (1991), *Bildung* is "a slippery concept" and by contrast with its former meaning, it "is bound to our interpretation of cultural values" (Hardin 1991: xii). Therefore, "[a]ny generalisation about the 'Bildungsroman' as a genre is apt to be bedevilled by the variant meanings of the word 'Bildung' in German" (qtd. in Hardin: xii).

Most probably, it would be better to start with the historical origin and the movements that have influenced the *Bildungsroman* and gave the genre its recent shape. Even if it had been a popular genre around the late eighteenth century, Petru Golban, who believes in a change in the literary works genres and historical periods

diachronically, claims its origins can be traced back to ancient times. He asserts that there are certain common aspects between ancient epic and the *Bildungsroman* (Golban, 2003: 20). On the basis of Mikhail Bakhtin's ideas, he puts forward three types of literary works which have led up to the rise of the *Bildungsroman*. "Experience", "journey", "ordeal", "adventure", "personal history", "remembrance" are the thematic elements of these literary types and Golban believes that these common elements have given way to the birth of the *Bildungsroman* tradition (21). He suggests that just like the *Bildungsroman*, these novels of Antiquity include a process of change and they characterise "one or another principle of character developmental process" (23).

The first novel type that is mentioned by Bakhtin is "travel novel". In this type, "the hero is a point moving in space" and he does not have any "distinguishing characteristics". The protagonist's adventures enable the author to "develop and demonstrate the spatial and static social diversity of the world" (Bakhtin, 1986:10). The world and the character are spatial and static and "life is an alternation of various contrasting conditions: success/failure, happiness/unhappiness, victory/defeat" (11). Time is also a poorly developed category in this type of novel. The author does not give information about the hero's age or how he has progressed from youth to maturity or old age. The only basis of time is "adventure time" which consists of "moments, hours, days-snatched random from the temporal process." Due to this lack of historical time, the emphasis can be seen only "on differences and contrasts". The character does not understand the "wholeness" of "sociocultural phenomena as nationalities, countries, cities, social groups, and occupations." The most important part is that the image of man is really static just as the world around him. There is no development of progress in human and even if the status of hero can change, "he himself remains unchanged" (11). To this type novel, Bakhtin gives the example of Apuleius' *Golden Ass* in which "the character's desire for new things and knowledge of magic, as well as the revaluation of 'metamorphosis' not as a tragic change of a character into a natural object" just like in the *Bildungsroman* (Golban, 2003: 22).

The second type of novel that was mentioned by Bakhtin is the "novel of ordeal". As the most common subcategory of European literature, its hero is depicted as a "complete and unchanging" character that is tested and struggle throughout the

novel. His qualities like “fidelity, valor, bravery, virtue, nobility, sanctity” are tested and verified (Bakhtin, 2010: 11-12). According to Bakhtin, this type of novel has two different subcategories. The representative of this first category is “Greek romance (Aethiopica, Leucippe and Clitophon, and others”, while the other one is revealed by Christian saints (12).

The first kind “is constructed as a test of fidelity in love and purity of the ideal hero and heroine” and the characters of this type show no development or formation because of no attribution to characters’ inner worlds. As for the second subcategory, “there is a significant change in the ideological content both of man’s image and of the idea of testing”. The lives of holy men, whose faith are tested through “suffering and temptation”, are in the centre but like other types of novels, there is also no movement or formation for the hero. “The tested hero is ... ready-made and pre-determined” (13).

The last and the most important type of ancient novel is “the biographical novel” since it has helped the development of the *Bildungsroman* as a genre. The real-life events like “birth, childhood, school years, marriage, the fate that life brings, works and deeds, death” are the themes of this type. Even though one can acquire information about the hero’s life course, it is not possible to see “any true process of becoming or development” (17). While hero remains unchanged, his destiny and life change. Instead of his formation, the author concentrates on the events of his life course which cause emotions such as happiness, sadness, and so on.

All of these ancient types of novels and their characteristics have enabled the *Bildungsroman* to gain its major themes and elements. However, the impact of the Medieval Era cannot be underestimated on the development of the genre. The most widespread literary form of the Middle Ages is the “romance” which has emerged in the twelfth century with the influence of ancient novels.

English romances are thus influenced by the ‘novel of travel or wandering’ of Antiquity, but they mostly continue the ‘novel of trial and ordeal’ with its static protagonists whose features are tested; along with their concern with Christian and chivalric values; their adventurous time, to which a ‘fabulous time’ is added as a result of the influence provided by the oriental tales, revealing, at the same time, a clear deviation from the normal time category (Golban, 2003: 31).

Furthermore, some of the themes that are used by Medieval romances are shared with the *Bildungsroman*. “The spirit of adventure, of initiation, and of trial”, “the motif of quest” and “the idea of challenge” are also common themes that are almost used in *Bildungsromane* in every period. However, the most influential motif has been ‘maturity’ which can be observed in *King Horn* (c.1225), one of the best known romance stories of the era. It is about a prince who has gained his maturity after experiencing some adventures and love affairs. As Golban puts forward that here, the theme of maturity is different from the theme of the traditional *Bildungsroman*. It does not refer

...the final stage of a gradual biological development from childhood through adolescence and youth, or as revealing the success of the formative process with regard to spiritual and mental wholeness, but considers a unilateral self-accomplishment of a personality through challenges of life (29).

Similarly, those mature characters of the romance also have some kind of “personal integrity” like the traditional *Bildungsroman* heroes. To illustrate, the famous romance knight Sir Gawain comprehends the scope of human failure after failing to “give up a girdle presented to him by his hostess”. It is an outstanding aspect since “it may be for the first time that a protagonist discovers in an act of failure his fullest humanity and reveals the most important aspect of a human personality: its individuality” (30).

Another period, which has given way to the development of the *Bildungsroman*, is the Renaissance. During the Renaissance, new elements have been brought to the novel tradition and later they have contributed to the formation and growth process of protagonists. The most influential literary type of the era was “the picaresque novel” which was originated in sixteenth century Spain. The themes and characteristics of the heroes, so-called *picaros*, formed a basis for the elements of the *Bildungsroman*. The picaresque novel was similar to the Medieval romance tradition in terms of the used motifs such as chivalry, adventure, trial, and quest. However, the authors of the picaresque novel adopted “a humorous outlook on the conventions of chivalry and by contrasting them with the realities of ordinary life” (31).

The best-known critic, who has revealed the similarities between *picaros* and protagonists of the *Bildungsroman*, is Susan Howe. In her *Wilhelm Meister and His*

English Kinsmen: Apprentices to Life (1930), she puts forward that the heroes of the *Bildungsroman* are actually kinships of the “recalcitrant hero of the moral allegory” and “the picaresque hero” (Howe, 1930:5). She believes that, like in moral allegories, the hero has to encounter with some vices and virtues which can come into being as disguised human beings to “tempt or warn or advise him.” As for the picaresque novel, heroes “like Françon, Gil Blas, or Tom Jones” create a carefree, rambling adventurer who has “a tendency to go on long journeys and see the world, meeting in the course of his travels a motley array of characters who insist upon telling the hero their life-stories and who represent all sides of the social structure of the time” (5).

The *Bildungsroman* hero is also influenced by idea of “universal man” which has been born in the Renaissance period. He tries to develop “all his gifts to the utmost” and improve his artistic side. Additionally, so as to reach his goals, he becomes wise “through experience” and learns from his pain and misfortunes during his quest. These heroes can have some weak personality traits like being “a little feeble, impressionable” or “vacillating”, but still they manage to conclude their long journeys with their endowed “exceptional powers of mind and spirit” (5). Howe claims that

They are more sensitive and more gifted than the average young man; their perceptions are sharper, their failures more heartbreaking, their struggles for adjustment to the world more desperate than those of their fellows, but their ultimate victory is assured (6).

With its new structural and thematic differences, the novels of the Renaissance era have brought some other changes into the *Bildungsroman* tradition. For example, with their new “third-person strategies”, they help the development process and improvement of the heroes (Golban, 2003:32). The narrators have “a deeper insight...into human psychology and existence, a concern with the character’s physical and intellectual evolution, his gradual self-discovery amid the complexity of the external world” which is essential for the *Bildungsroman*. Furthermore, the heroes are no longer static, and they are open to some kind of development and cultivation realistically. This feature contributes a lot to a very distinguished theme of the Renaissance novel which is “pedagogy”. Golban explains that

The external world is viewed in terms of schooling and education, through which the protagonist has to pass in order to change and develop.

The evolution of the character allows the exclusion of his static features; yet the world becomes almost unmodified and definite, but, at the same time, subject to a rich complexity of contrasting aspects (33).

This pedagogic idea also can be found in the *Bildungsroman* genre which is sometimes called “novel of education”. The protagonist’s journey to maturity or old age is filled with “didactic and moral values” in the process of his formation (32).

Furthermore, the picaresque novel of the Renaissance period also uses an autobiographical manner which helps the author show the process of development just like in the *Bildungsroman*. By adopting a first-person narration, he can reflect the hero’s inner world and conflicts or mental situation while dealing with the events like “encounter, arrest, separation, escape, sudden acquisition and waster, robbery—as well as institutionalized education, professional initiation, love affairs, ordeal by love” with the use of irony and humour. The author makes contributions to the *Bildungsroman* hero by telling or assessing

the experience of life of a character from childhood through youth and maturity to old age, and sometimes along with different changes of his inner life: for instance from idealism and indulging in wishful thinking in youth to reason and pragmatism in old age (34).

The impact of the picaresque novel proceeded during the seventeenth century. The genre, which has a Spanish origin, had been translated into some influential languages such as French, German and English. It made way to the birth of the national picaresque novel between the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries (35). Richard Bjornson reveals the function of these novels like that

By breaking down the traditional separation of the styles and expanding the range of acceptable subject matter to include the morally serious treatment of nonaristocratic characters, they constituted one of the most important stages in the transition between earlier literary prose and the modern novel, which itself became the dominant mode of fictional expression in eighteenth-and-nineteenth-century Europe” (qtd. in Golban 2003: 35).

The transportation of the picaresque novel to Europe made it possible for the *Bildungsroman* to come into the world. German authors, like Goethe, started giving places to picaro-like heroes in their works in which the reader can observe the journey of the character who has desire for adventure and action. The character began to evolve with the world that surrounded him and experienced a real

development and formation. That is to say, the “world’s foundation changes and the character has to change with it; the hero thus loses his private features and becomes to such issues as reality and human possibilities, freedom” (36).

However, the most significant century was the eighteenth century since the *Bildungsroman* was born with the influence of the German Enlightenment. The neoclassical ideas and principles gave way to creation of the first *Bildungsromane*, especially Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* and Wieland’s *Geschichte des Agathon*, in the history along with the other types that mentioned before such as ancient epics, the medieval romances and the picaresque novels. Bakhtin argues that

...it is immensely important to consider the idea of education as it took shape during the Enlightenment, and particularly that specific subcategory that we find on German soil as the idea of the “education of the human race” in Lessing and Herder (26).

He also suggests that the Enlightenment period is noteworthy because it was the “time of concretization and visual clarification of the new world and its history” (44). It was the time when the religious meaning of the word *Bildung* and theological view of the world had changed considerably. Siljander, Kivela and Sutinen describe the change like this

In examinations of the history of *Bildung* ideas, it has become habit in German discussions to name the period of time from the last decades of the 1700s to the first decades of the 1800s *Deutsche Klassik*The epochs, which are traditionally distinct from each other, change rapidly in the course of the 18th and 19th century, from Late Enlightenment to New Humanism, Classic, Idealism, and Romanticism, and include a large variety of different ideas of *Bildung* . Hoffmann criticises the traditional historiography of education for harmonising very complex and complicated processes. This is also the case for the *Bildung* idea of the ‘German classic’...Goethe and Schiller in particular had very different opinions on the subject. The same applies to the pedagogical designs and applications of the *Bildung* idea. We can more readily discuss numerous different and often incompatible ideas of *Bildung* than one uniform *Bildung* idea or understanding (Siljander, Kivela and Sutinen, 2012: 13).

As can be deduced from above, the authors and the readers of the era started to improve and cultivate themselves and their skills under the impact of the Age of Reason which gives huge importance to mind, reason, and development of the human mind. The aim was on achieving “the spiritual maturity of both men and

women” as a result of the Enlightenment vision and it has become the source of the *Bildungsroman* tradition (Hardin, 1991: 361).

Through the end of the Enlightenment period, another movement had occurred as opposed to neoclassical view of the world. The Romanticism trend had become one of the most influential epochs of the *Bildungsroman* with its themes like childhood, youth, individuality, and so on. It affected all the fields of art from literature to music, painting to philosophy. In literature, it mostly showed itself in the form of poetry. The work which is accepted as the manifesto of Romanticism was the *Preface of Lyrical Ballads* (1798), written by Samuel Coleridge and William Wordsworth. It was actually the work which revealed the basic themes and focus points of the Romantic poetry and some of these themes later used in the *Bildungsroman* tradition.

In the light of this Preface, most of the Romantic poets and authors accepted the era as a new period and believed in the spirit of the age. Poetry was seen as “the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings” and the essence of the poetry was not the outer world but the mind, emotions and imagination of the poet who wrote it (Wordsworth, 1967: 263). The basic poetic form was lyrical poem and first-person narration became the major one with the use of “I” which was often referred directly to the poet. That is to say, the development of the self had become a major topic of the Romantic poetry just like in the *Bildungsroman*. Poets usually saw themselves as prophets in a time of crisis. They were against the rules of the past and thought that one must free himself from the rules inherited from the past. The poets relied on instinct, intuition and feeling. They gave huge importance to the Nature and described it as a work of art from the divine imagination, a healing power, a refuge from civilisation, a source of refreshment and meditation:

For Wordsworth nature was not merely the uncivilized, the primitive, the world as yet untouched by man, but man himself was part of nature. Wordsworth and his contemporaries loved nature as perhaps no generation before or since, for they saw in her not only infinite beauty, but behind the ceaseless mutations of changing colour and transient scene ...The Renaissance had discovered man; it was left for Romanticism to make the real discovery of nature, and wondering to guess” with a mild surmise” at who knows that arcane hidden therein from unpoetic gaze (Bloom, 1970: 35).

These characteristics and motifs of the poetry later were adopted by novel writers and used in a great deal of work including the *Bildungsroman*. The writers, who fed up with the rationalistic side of the Enlightenment and Neo-classicism, started to reflect their imagination and feelings upon their works. It was “a rebellion against the atmosphere of material positivism and an expression of nostalgia for a fascinating and magical past” (Marigny, 1993: 61). The early Romantics adopted idea of “cultural revolution for all mankind” and German writers began to use this concept while creating the *Bildungsromane* (Hardin, 1991:111). Unlike the picaresque hero, who “is oriented toward action, nor feeling. In his rough world, he has neither leisure nor the interest to relish the nuances of degrees of purity of his own emotions”, the new- heroes would express their inner thought and emotions while the author put emphasis on his childhood, his relationship with the nature and formation (Alter, 1965: 79).

All these improvements in the novel genre and human psychology prepared to place for the birth of the *Bildungsroman* in Weimar Germany.

To Thomas L. Jeffers, the “idea of Bildung was conceived by the lateeighteenth-century Weimer classicists” (46), where the “supreme Weimer meditation on Bildung is Schiller’s 1793 work, *Über die Aesthetische Erziehung des Menschen (On the Aesthetic Education of Man)*” (51). Not only does *On the Aesthetic Education of Man* promote the romantic emphasis on “personalistic pursuits”, meaning “the duty to realize our individual uniqueness” (50), “an innate individuality”, but it also “projects a history of and a model for such realization that would influence Goethe and the English novelists who came after” (51), in particular romantics and their heirs such as Carlyle and Pater (Golban, 2018: 4).

Not only after Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre*, but also Wieland’s *Agathon*, the genre had started to be defined by various scholars. Their works formed the basis for the new genre whose “mystical limits” were pushed by the German Romantics. Especially Goethe’s work, in which the protagonist’s development process can be observed, had become a prototype or a turning point in the history of the *Bildungsroman*. It helped critics to identify the basic characteristics of the traditional genre while giving it a world-wide popularity.

1.3. THE LITERARY THEORIES ON THE *BILDUNGSROMAN* AND ITS GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS AND THEMES

During the late eighteenth century, a new genre had emerged as a combination of biography and novel in which the spiritual and psychological formation of a protagonist was shown. With the emerge of Goethe's *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjare* in 1795, it had been the most important literary type of Germany and it had spread all around the world thanks to translations and theories on it. This newly-originated genre, the *Bildungsroman* had become the source of a lot of literary debates and articles even with its origin because it was known that Goethe or other *Bildungsroman* writers like Wieland or Jean Paul was unaware of the term "Bildungsroman" at the time. They were just using the themes and values of the genre without knowing what it would be called in the future (Hardin, 1991: xii). According to Martini, it was Karl von Morgenstern (1770-1852), a professor of rhetoric in Dorpat, who coined the word the *Bildungsroman* in 1819

The term first surfaces in a fragment of a lecture "Über den Geist und Zusammenhang einer Reihe philosophischer Romane" (On the Spirit and Connection of a Series of Philosophical Novels) held publicly on 12 December 1810 ...edited by Morgenstern.... Here the term was applied to the novels of the poet Friedrich Maximilian Klinger.... In this lecture Morgenstern finds "none of the other philosophical novels of the Germans, or of their Bildungsromane in general, suited in the same degree" to foster moral elevation and masculine strength of character as those of Klinger.... He writes, "As early as 1803 the author of this fragment had sketched out the plan for a text: "Über Bildungsromane" (On Bildungsromane... would have become a counterpart to Blanckenburg's Versuch über den Roman (Essay on the Novel), known to him at that time only by title." The introduction to the lecture "Über das Wesen des Bildungsromans" reveals that he was aware of his new coinage of the term: "[to] designate the most excellent among the many types of novels as a Bildungsroman, a word which, to my knowledge, has not been used before" (3).

However, in his lecture, Morgenstern was analysing Klinger's works on the same level with Goethe's and Wieland's. He believes that "for the education of the youth", a more masculine character was needed and their works are lack of these powerful masculine figures despite containing a lot of beauties (11). Along with these ideas, he additionally praised *Wilhelm Meisters* since it was presenting the thinking, culture

and life of Germany very well with its moral hero. In this point, he criticised the *Agathon* by arguing that it failed because Wieland “lived in an earlier period in which German *Bildung* could not yet hold its own against meddling foreign influences” (Boes ,2012:2).

He also makes a difference between the epic and the novel forms. He claims that while the epic shows the protagonist as the influencer of his surrounding, the novel shows the surrounding and the other characters as the influencer in the process of protagonist’s *Bildung*. The impacts of events and incidents and even other characters in the works can be shown on the protagonist’s life emotionally as he tries to develop and become “through himself as well as through that which is not himself”. In the light of these definitions, he explains the *Bildungsroman* “as the most noble type of novel and that which best captures the essence of the novel in contrast to that of the epos.” Its protagonist develops and completes his formation while also cultivating the reader better than any other types of novel. It is not only compatible with “the laws of beauty”, it is also didactic, and it purposes teaching both the protagonist and the reader (qtd.in Hardin, 1991: 17). The novel enables the reader to see the interior soul, goals, struggles, and victories of the protagonist while he is turning into a talented and free young man. With all these comments on the subject, he finishes his lecture with these hopeful words

How much has changed in Germany and in the rest of Europe during the twenty-five years that have passed since the publication of the Apprenticeship; how much has already changed its shape and how much strives toward new forms that in some cases have been foreseen, but in others come completely unexpected! . . . [Considering all the recent transformations] we may expect many happy achievements from the current and from future generations. For the same reason, many other marvelous trees with beautiful flowers and ripe fruits shall flourish in the infinitely large garden of novel writing! (qtd. in Boes, 2012:59)

Even if Morgenstern was the person, who had first mentioned the *Bildungsroman*, it was Wilhelm Dilthey (1833-1911) that popularised the genre in his study, *Das Erlebnes und die Dichtung* (Poetry and Experience) in 1906. By basing upon especially Goethes’s *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* (Wilhelm Meister’s Apprenticeship), he constructed the characteristics and definition of the genre. Actually, in one of his earlier work, *Das Leben Schleiermachers* (1870), he even showed how much he was affected by Goethe’s work and called the novels as

Bildungsromane after his work by claiming: “I would like to call the novels which make up the school of Wilhelm Meister . . . "Bildungsromane." Goethe's work shows human cultivation (Ausbildung) in various stages, forms, stages of life” (qtd. in Hardin, 1991:91). With the analysis of *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre*, he also argued that this new genre is the “product of sociological circumstances that obtained in the German principalities” since Germany used to have a strict repressive state and it was lack of “legitimate public sphere” during this Romantic period so that “self-involved protagonists” found the appropriate place to occur by dealing with the social world around (Boes, 2006: 232).

According to Dilthey, the protagonist of the novel was passing through some stages after accomplishing the previous stage and turning into happy grown-ups after experiencing some misfortunes, so he defined the *Bildungsromane* as novels which

portray a young man of their time: how he enters life in a happy state of naiveté seeking kindred souls, finds friendship and love, how he comes into conflict with the hard realities of the world, how he grows to maturity through diverse life-experiences, finds himself, and attains certainty about his purpose in the world. Goethe's goal was the story of a person preparing himself for an active life; the theme of the two Romantic writers was the poet; Hölderlin's hero was a heroic person striving to change the world but finding himself in the end thrust back upon his own thought and poetry (Hardin, 1991: 98).

As he mentioned, Goethe's Wilhelm was a very successful character that he indeed made it possible for Dilthey to describe the heroes of these types of novels and later Wilhelm became a prototype of the genre by completing his *Bildung* through the work. He was a fundamental character in the history of the *Bildungsroman* since “...for the first time we have a hero who knows that the only image of himself that he can expect to find in the world is the one that he himself creates” (Gohlman, 1990:20). The emphasis is on totally Wilhelm Meister's individuality and development in the work. Wilhelm, who is from a bourgeois background, contradicts with his father and friends after refusing to deal with commerce as they do also and having a bad love experience. He leaves his home and starts to travel during which he encounters with different people and unlucky events such as failing to become an actor. However, in the end, he understands the meaning of life and takes lessons from what he has experienced. He becomes a well-adjusted individual, gets married, compromises with the society, and completes his apprenticeship.

The real lesson Wilhelm Meister teaches the reader is how to turn a tough life into a successful one by understanding “the meaning of life”. Goethe called it as the “apprenticeship” because the hero accomplishes his formation and becomes the master of his life after passing through “the stages of an apprenticeship” (Howe, 1930:4). In *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre*, at one point, the hero Wilhelm realises that it is the chance that gives way to humans’ lives not the destiny. He experiences a moment of “epiphany”, which is a common characteristic of the *Bildungsromane* heroes), and says that actually fate is just a collection of chance events by asking “Is what we call Destiny but Chance?” (Goethe, 1899: 74) After this realisation, he learns about the existence of The Tower Society, which has been observing all of his life and movements and he completes his apprenticeship by taking over the reins of his life and marrying the woman he wants. Selin Ever explains this process as

There is an unmistakable touch of irony in this turn of events that undermines the novel’s own investment in the idea of free and spontaneous self-determination, as Wilhelm realizes that there were many times in his life “when he thought he was acting freely and unobserved”, “only to discover that he had been observed, even directed.”...Thus, Wilhelm’s *Bildung* is never really completed, and begins anew with every experience, which is often undercut by another ironic situation. In fact, even the novel’s famous closing sentence --“I don’t know about kingdoms”, said Wilhelm, “but I do know that I have found a treasure I never deserved” --which is often read as his ultimate reconciliation with society, calls into question whether Wilhelm has achieved *Bildung* after all (Ever, 2013: 10-11).

Through Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meister*, a well-known characteristic of the *Bildungsroman* comes into being, “the apprenticeship”. It turns into a new pattern, through which the heroes start their journeys and finish their cycle of lives after being educated and cultivated thanks to other characters and events. The best-known critic, who wrote about the pattern of “the apprenticeship”, is maybe Susan Howe. She asserts that

The adolescent hero of the typical "apprentice" novel sets out on his way through the world, meets with reverses usually due to his own temperament, falls in with various guides and counsellors, makes many false starts in choosing his friends, his wife, and his life work, and finally adjusts himself in some way to the demands of his time and environment by finding a sphere of action in which he may work effectively (4).

In this respect, the journey of Wilhelm through life can be called as “educative or pedagogical” since he achieves to maintain maturity and formation “by the acquisition of values such as devotion, wisdom, moral strength, altruism, and so on” (Golban, 2017:131). He makes peace with the external reality and the society as Hegel states

The end of such apprenticeship consists in this, that the subject sows his wild oats, accommodates himself with his wishes and opinions to existing relationships and their rationality, enters the concatenation of the world, and acquires for himself an appropriate attitude to it (qtd. in Boes, 2012: 15).

Furthermore, it is not only the protagonist who achieves the apprenticeship, but also the reader is also affected by the hero and “becomes his own Wilhelm Meister, an apprentice, a traveller, on his own account” (qtd. in Argyle 2002: 34).

Susan Howe is a very important critic who mentions Goethe and his influence on the *Bildungsroman* in his book, *Wilhelm Meister and his English Kinsmen, apprentices to life* (1930). She creates a connection between German and English heroes by especially using the “apprenticeship” theme. She believes that it was thanks to German authors and scholars that the *Bildungsroman* would find its place in the English Literature, mainly by means of *Wilhelm Meister*. She calls the genre as “the novel of all-around development or self-culture” and accepts Wilhelm Meister “the archetype” (Howe, 1930: 7). She also states that there is a connection between “these apprenticeship novels” and “Byronism”

Their heroes are often misunderstood and badly adjusted young men, unappreciated by their families, and full of loud complaints against the world. A dash of Byronic pride and fine theatrical frenzy, something of his sense of the vanity and futility of all things in heaven and earth, is often just the thing that saves them. They are not, as a rule, conspicuous for their sense of proportion or their sense of humor, but an ironic defiance of circumstance sometimes takes the place of it and proves to be a safety valve (9).

She adds that, just like Byronic heroes, the heroes of the *Bildungsroman* are romantic and morally strong. However, her best remark is on the events that influences the hero and the socially- accepted endings which are also a part of the *Bildungsroman* tradition. According to Howe, exterior powers like “industrial confusion, political reform, religious doubt, and imperial expansion” affect the hero. After being

triumphant and defeating the vices, the heroes get married to the right women and continue their lives as wise and happy human beings in the end. Depending on the author of the novel, the heroes can choose different occupations from a member of the Parliament to a doctor. These endings are important since they show life “as something moving, changing, dynamic” in contrast to the other novel types. The heroes gain awareness and deepen their philosophy of life after growing old with the unfortunate life events. Even if the reader can see the change and settling down of the hero, there is still a sense of incompleteness. Howe explains this incompleteness with the insoluble problems and writes “the best thing about most of them is their sense of their own inadequacy in the face of it, and of man and his destiny as an eternal mystery” (11).

Another critic, who has made great contributions to the genre of the *Bildungsroman*, is Jerome Hamilton Buckley. In his *Season of Youth: The Bildungsroman from Dickens to Golding* (1974), he tries to define the characteristics of the genre and forms a framework by claiming Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meister* as the most influential “novel of education” in the nineteenth century. He finds an autobiographical side in the *Bildungsromane* and tries to reveal the similarities between young Goethe’s and Wilhelm’s lives. According to Buckley, Wilhelm has an “artistic temperament,” and is “eager to achieve independence and self-expression” just like Goethe. He is “self-conscious” throughout his quest of the self-development. Both Wilhelm and Goethe have problematic relationships with their fathers and unwilling to satisfy their wishes (Buckley, 1974: 11).

Similar to Howe, he also mentions the motif of “the apprenticeship” and argues that Wilhelm’s real apprenticeship starts after he realises that he is not talented enough to become an actor. Buckley believes that this incident turns into to “be an allegory all the illusions of his troubled youth. The true apprenticeship...is spiritual rather than professional” (11). Wilhelm achieves his spiritual growth after passing “through many dark passages” and reaches the light. He learns the existence of the Tower Society and understands that he is always watched and guided by them. Being aware of his predestined success, “he is now prepared to move from conscious self-culture to a spontaneous understanding of life” and he reaches a better and happy place (12).

As mentioned before, he also suggests that there is a direct link between the picaresque hero and the hero of the *Bildungsroman*. Like picaros, he travels a lot and learns from the conditions and people he comes across. He also resembles the hero of “the Parzival figure” and “the Renaissance man” in terms of taking lessons from their trials and cultivating their skills to the fullest (13). He tries to outline the typical characteristics of the genre as

A child of some sensibility grows up in a country or in a provincial town, where he finds constraints, social and intellectual, placed upon the imagination. His family, especially his father, proves doggedly hostile to his creative instincts or flights of fancy, antagonistic to his ambitions, and quite impervious to the new ideas he has gained from unprescribed reading. His first schooling, even if not totally inadequate, may be frustrating insofar as it may suggest opinions not available to him in his present setting. He therefore, sometimes at quite an early age, leaves the repressive atmosphere of home (and also the relative innocence), to make his way independently in the city (in the English novels, usually London). There his real education begins, not only his preparation for career but also –and often more importantly–his direct experience of urban life. The latter involves at least two love affairs or sexual encounters, one debasing, one exalting, and demands that in this respect and others the hero reappraise his values. By the time, he has decided, after painful soul-searching, the sort of accommodation to the modern world he can honestly make, he has left his adolescence behind and entered upon his maturity. His initiation complete, he may then visit his old home, to demonstrate by his presence the degree of his success or the wisdom of his choice (17-18).

Even though there are objections, these elements can be found commonly in most of the *Bildungsromane*. Especially “the child figure” who is generally fatherless or orphaned and needs a “substitute parent” more like a mentor to guide him throughout his quest.

Another dominant element of the *Bildungsroman* is “the journey from home”. Buckley asserts that this journey is usually towards the city which “is both the agent of liberation and a source of corruption.” The protagonist can encounter with new and exciting opportunities while also getting bored and miserable because of the crowded, hectic, and lonely life. To be able to survive in this materialistic city, the hero must make money since “the loss of money” can be seen as “the root of all evil”. Buckley believes that Wilhelm is “foolish to remain indifferent to his property

and money” because it contributes a lot to the hero’s “true enrichment of spirit” (21). Financially-free hero can only concentrate on his formation and self-cultivation when he has the money. Furthermore, after passing through all of these trials, the hero is expected to undergo another important test under the name of “love”. The rejection and failure of the hero as a lover lead him towards other paths and he experiences “moments of insight, epiphanies, spots of time, when the reality of things breaks through the fog of delusion” (22). He turns into an “inner-directed” person and realises his responsibilities to himself and other people around.

After Howe and Buckley, Jeffrey L. Sammons remarks the words “[i]f a person interested in literary matters commands as many as a dozen words of German, one of them is likely to be: Bildungsroman” in his work, “The Mystery of the Missing Bildungsroman, or: What Happened to Wilhelm Meister's Legacy?” in 1981 (qtd. in Redfield, 1996:38). He tries to describe it by writing

I think that the Bildungsroman should have something to do with *Bildung*, that is, with the early bourgeois, humanistic concept of the shaping of the individual self from its innate potentialities through acculturation and social experience to the threshold of maturity. (qtd. in Hardin, 1991: 41)

He calls the genre as “phantom” and “an essentially German tradition” especially in Hesse and Mann’s works and claims the re-birth of the *Bildungsroman* as the early twentieth century in the Wilhelminian period, not the nineteenth century (53-57). Ever explains it and comments on Sammons’ idea as

...it is nearly impossible to find a nineteenth century Bildungsroman that qualifies for the title, if by the term one does not simply understand any novel “recounting the history of a young person entering upon life and the world” but strictly one that communicates the Enlightenment values; especially “a faith that there is world enough and time for self-realization, a confidence in the potential of life and the world for allowing a benign outcome to the growth of the self” (Ever, 2013: 15).

The reason behind it is that even though there are several critics, who show the genre as “predominant” type of the nineteenth century, it was only Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meister* which was written and mentioned during this century. He argues that the genre was born in the late eighteenth century and flourished with the Romanticism thanks to Goethe. After that, during the nineteenth century, it came to the edge of disappearing while re-emerging “in the modernist neo-Romantic revival” in the

twentieth century (Bubikova, 2011: 17). Therefore, Sammons concludes his essay with the sentence, “[t]here is no nineteenth-century Bildungsroman genre because no major writer after Goethe could envision a social context for *Bildung*” (qtd. in Ever, 2013: 16).

When a chronological order is followed, another critic, Martin Swales comes into the stage in the course of the *Bildungsroman* development. In his book, *The German Bildungsroman from Wieland to Hesse* (1978), he analyses six major texts of German authors (Wieland, Goethe, Stifter, Keller, Mann, and Hesse) and tries to reveal some important characteristics of the genre which are lack of teleological philosophy for him. He gives Wieland’s *Agathon* (1767) and Friedrich von Blanckenburg’s *Versuch über den Roman* (1774) credit for the flourishing of the *Bildungsroman* since Blanckenburg gives the traditional novel “a new psychological and intellectual seriousness” (Swales, 1978: 13). According to Swales, Blanckenburg puts forward that

Wieland's signal achievement resided in his ability to get inside a character, to portray the complex stuff of human potential which, in interaction with the outside world, yields the palpable process of human *Werden*, of growth and change. By this means artistic and human dignity and cohesion was conferred on the sequence of episodic adventures which novel heroes, by tradition, underwent (18).

These heroes are general from bourgeois society and as individuals, they try to change their worlds with their goals like love, ambition, dignity, and self-respect. During this process of changing, the heroes are accompanied by the “otherness” of the other characters in the novel and they have to keep their contacts with these people because “these characters exist, so to speak, not in their own right but for the education benefit of the hero: that they are significant insofar they are underwritten by a potentially slumbering within him” (qtd. in Hardin, 1991: 52).

The theme, which Swales generally argues about, is the successful and “happy ending” at the end of the *Bildungsromane*. As Hegel puts forward it in his *Aesthetics*

...For the conclusion of such an apprenticeship usually amounts to the hero getting the rough spots knocked off him ...In the last analysis he usually gets his girl and some kind of job, marries, and becomes a philistine just like all the others (50).

He does not find these happy endings as an essential part of the genre, even though “the process of development targets the whole of an individual person that has to be revealed organically in all his or her complexity” (Golban, 2018: 10). He accredits that there is a tension between the hero’s individuality and the happy ending which usually ends up with a marriage ceremony, a new-born family, or a new career path since these social acts can limit and confine the self-realization process of the hero (Swales, 1978: 29).

Following Swales, Marianne Hirsch has clarified her ideas on the *Bildungsroman* in his essay “The Novel of Formation as Genre: Between *Great Expectations* and *Lost Illusions*” in 1979. Unlike most critics, rather than a strictly German genre, she believes the *Bildungsroman* is a European literary type. Moreover, she agrees that the *Bildungsroman* is a fusion of the *Wilhelm Meister* and the eighteenth century idea of *Bildung* which based on the “Bildungsidee” of self-development and prefers to call the genre as the “novel of formation” since it is a broader term (Hirsch, 1979: 293-311). She proposes seven-step generic model for the novel of formation which is centralised around a single character. She suggests that in the presence of a “defined social order”, the character’s individual growth and improvement can be observed. She finds the central character passive and incapable of controlling his own destiny even if he can shape the incidents around him. She also highlights the role of society in the novel of formation and asserts that “[s]ociety is the novel’s antagonist and is viewed as a school of life, a locus for experience” (293-311). The spirit of the social order can be pointed out through the character’s fate.

Additionally, Hirsch addresses to the one of the best-known themes of the genre, the “quest” of the protagonist. She believes that the quest story

.... portrays a search for a meaningful existence within society, for the authentic values which will facilitate the unfolding of inner capacities. The linear chronological plot, according to Scholes and Kellogg, represents “a general movement to emphasize character in narrative,” since it “allows for free and full character development without interference from the requirements of a tightly-knit plot.” Growth is a gradual process consisting of a number of encounters between subjective needs and an unbending social order. Since it entails the consideration of various alternatives, the growth process necessitates errors and the pursuit of false leads (293-311).

Through this quest, another important concern of the *Bildungsroman*, “the development of the selfhood” is completed. The hero finishes his apprenticeship through the events of his life and attends the existing society which is a foreseen resolution for him. He can either choose to accept the norms and rules that are determined by the society or reject all of them. Either way, the novel “ends with a precise stand on his part, with his assessment of himself and his place in society” (293-311).

Hirsch continues her model with the relationship between the narrator and the protagonist. According to her, there is an irony and instead of yearning for the youth, the narrator tells the story of the inexperienced hero ironically. Like Hardin and Howe, she also mentions the educative role of the genre and calls it as a “didactic novel” through which the readers also enhance and educate themselves thanks to the experiences of the hero. Last but not least, she refers to the importance of the other characters in the novel like Swales before him

... educators serve as mediators and interpreters between the two confronting forces of self and society; companions serve as reflectors on the protagonist, standing for alternative goals and achievements (for example Wilhelm Meister and Lothario, Emma Woodhouse and Jane Fairfax, Lucien de Rubempré and David Séchard); lovers provide the opportunity for the education of sentiment (293-311).

These supporting characters can be seen as mentors who help the hero when he thinks he has lost his way and lead him to the path that takes him to his development and happiness.

After all of these critics and comments on the *Bildungsroman*, a well-known Russian literary theorist, Mikhael Bakhtin appears in the history of the genre which, according to him, is based on the “idea of testing.” He claims that, like all the other types of novel, the *Bildungsroman* also experiences a diachronic developmental process. He calls the genre as the “novel of human emergence” and it totally concerns the “image of man in the process of becoming” (Bakhtin, 1986: 19). According to Bakhtin, the protagonist of the *Bildungsroman*

.... emerges along with the world and he reflects the historical emergence of the world itself. He is no longer within an epoch, but on the border between two epochs, at the transition point from one to another. This transition is accomplished in him and through him. He is forced to

become a new, unprecedented type of human being. What is happening here is precisely the emergence of a new man (23).

This new man has to change with the world which is changing constantly. By renewing himself, he “enters into a completely new, *spatial* sphere of existence” and becomes the subject of the “realistic novel of emergence” (24). This newly-emerged hero starts to grow “in national-historical time” and his “individual emergence” combines with his “historical emergence” (25).

Another idea, that has been brought forward by Bakhtin and has become a theme in the *Bildungsroman*, is the notion of life “as a school”. He believes that life is a path of experiences and everyone has to pass through and learn how to be more patient, sober, and consenting (22). The heroes of the *Bildungsroman* must educate themselves and cultivate their insights. According to Bakhtin, this idea of education derives from the German Enlightenment, he finds this view “on German soil as the idea of the ‘education of human race’” (24). In the process of this education, the hero is claimed to be tested by different kinds of problems and achieves the freedom of mind in the end (13). He can sometimes accomplish to fulfil his goal, sometimes fail even if his formation and change will be completed in any circumstances.

Lastly, the *Bildungsroman* and its characteristics especially in European culture were put forward by Franco Moretti who calls the genre as a “symbolic form” in his *The Way of the World: The Bildungsroman in European Culture* in 1987. He accepts the Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* as the starting point of the genre since most of the other critics claim that the new hero Wilhelm was “followed by Elizabeth Bennet and Julien Sorel, Rastignac and Frédéric Moreau and Bel-Ami, Waverley and David Copperfield, Renzo Tramaglino “and so on (Moretti, 1987: 3). According to Moretti, the most important characteristic of the *Bildungsroman* hero is his “youth” since “youth...becomes for our modern culture the age which holds the ‘meaning of life.’” (4). Unlike ancient heroes, the hero of the *Bildungsroman* is especially depicted as a young individual in the search for the meaning of life and self-actualisation not coincidentally or other characteristics of him are not more important and gripping than his youth. He is a young person in the process of being an adult and there is nothing special about him. However, Moretti asserts that

But when status society starts to collapse, the countryside is abandoned for the city, and the world of work changes at an incredible and incessant pace, the colourless and uneventful socialization of 'old' youth becomes increasingly implausible: it becomes a problem, one that makes youth itself problematic. Already in Meister's case, 'apprenticeship' is no longer the slow and predictable progress towards one's father's work, but rather an uncertain exploration of social space, which the nineteenth century - through travel and adventure, wandering and getting lost (4).

That is to say, the newly-defined "youth" of the hero has a huge impact on his formation and exploration of the self while also creating him problems due to the circumstances of the epoch. These problems can be explained with the decline of Feudalism through which the young successors would be able to get their fathers' positions by fulfilling their social roles. Now they have to deal with the modernity which is a "bewitching and risky process" with "great expectations" and "lost illusions" (5). Since they are no longer "feudally prescribed", their growth process would be painful and problematic.

Thomas L. Jeffers also puts forward the matter in a beautiful and coherent way as stating "Mr. Moretti made youth 'a specific image of modernity': restless, semi-inchoate, in a state of what Karl Marx called 'permanent revolution'" (Jeffers, 2005: 51). To clarify, it is not possible for the *Bildungsroman* to show his young heroes unaffected by the revolutions or the other social and political changes of their eras. The youth is a "specific material sign" that is chosen in particular and it emphasises on "modernity's dynamism and instability." The young heroes are now the essential part of the world and they look for the meaning of life "in the *future* rather than in the past" since they are aware of their immortality and the brief nature of their lives (5-6).

In the following parts of his book, Moretti defines the *Bildungsroman* by getting help from Lukacs' idea. According to them, it involves contradictions in itself and it exists thanks to its contradictory nature. This very nature makes it the "most open "form "to dangers" (6). Furthermore, the *Bildungsroman* is built upon the "idea of normality". By choosing normal and common heroes and situations as its subjects, it "makes normality interesting and meaningful as normality" (11). The basic characters and every-day life problems turn into a part of a meaningful and outstanding journey through which a "compromise" within the society appears.

Moretti calls the “compromise” as “the novel’s most celebrated theme”. He claims that

....it was *precisely this predisposition to compromise* that allowed the *Bildungsroman* to emerge victorious from that veritable ‘struggle for existence’ between various narrative forms that took place at the turn of the eighteenth century: historical novel and epistolary novel, lyric, allegorical, satirical, ‘romantic’ novel, *Künstlerroman*... (10).

The hero of the *Bildungsroman* compromises with the society at the end of the novel and adapts himself to the world as a cultivated hero after completing his self-formation through the story. However, at that point, Moretti argues about the traditional happy ending tradition of the genre. He suggests that while the young heroes should find an end by getting older and gaining “maturity” with a new identity in Goethe’s and English novelists’ works, the heroes of the French novelists get the sense of betrayal and they are unable to find the meaning of life in the end (8). He presents the classical ending of the *Bildungsroman* as a marked one and states that “events acquire meaning” only if “they led to *one* ending, and one only” (7). Furthermore, he claims that in most of the classical works, marriage is the most-preferred ending as it is the best way to compromise with the society as in the example of Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meister*. He believes with the theme of “compromise” especially the 'bourgeois' class is targeted. Since the *Bildungsroman* also aims at educating the reader, Moretti aims at educating the 'bourgeois' class. The reason behind is that Moretti finds the cultural values of the bourgeois class useless and ridiculous and the best way to solve this problem is reconciling with the society and finding some beneficial ways through which all the other classes in the society win (63).

CHAPTER TWO

2. MODERNISM AND THE *BILDUNGSROMAN*

2.1. MODERNISM AND THE *BILDUNGSROMAN*

Modernism is an artistic movement which has started to show itself “rather locally, in France, with Baudelaire in literature and Manet in painting, and perhaps with Flaubert, too, in prose fiction” during the late 19th and the 20th century (Greenberg, 1980:7). It was a revolt against clear-cut storytelling, conservative values of the realism, and established social and religious ideas (Rayment, 2017: 4). It dominates a variety of artistic fields from painting to music, and even architecture. As for literature, modernism elicits a breaking away

... from established rules, traditions and conventions, fresh ways of looking at man's position and function in the universe and many (in some cases remarkable) experiments in form and style. It is particularly concerned with language and how to use it (representationally or otherwise) and with writing itself. (Cuddon, 1999: 516)

It is especially concerned with the “language” since as for modernist critics, language is not objective. Unlike realistic claims, it does not reflect the world as it is and modernists believe that language usually fails when it comes to conveying the right message and intended meaning. Words can be misunderstood or misleading as they try to portray an objective “reality” which is fragmented and complex from the point of modernist scholars. At that point, Rayment records that in contrast to modernism, realism “presents its traditional/ conservative / moral values as *natural* in order to make them unquestionable.” (4).

These conservative and so-called moral values, which modernism protests, are especially the Victorian hypocrisy and traditions whose aim were to create submissive and compromised individuals. Furthermore, authors and thinkers of the time were trying to re-build their shattered world after the First World War which had spread a huge fear and loss of belief to people’s hearts. The people that they lost, the homelands that they had to leave behind made people question even the existence

of a compassionate and almighty God (Lewis, 2000:38). There were some writers and scholars who became the pioneers in the process of fixation the broken world.

In literature writers such as Richard Wagner and Henrik Ibsen already foresaw what future civilizations and accompanying progress could do to individuals; Ibsen in particular questioned the morally upright Victorian image as false and flawed and presented his views that morality was not as simple as black and white. Philosophers such as Arthur Schopenhauer and Friedrich Wilhelm Nietzsche began to radically question truth; transforming and reconstructing old notions of morality and of the individual's place in society (Nicholls, 1995: 34-35).

According to these scholars and people of the era, the world was no longer a meaningful whole but an irrational and complex place, a fragmented and unreliable area and literal and artistic means of the era which was inadequate to reveal the changes in the society and human personality.

While some people were resisting against the changing traditions and sticking with the old reassuring values, some others were carrying out ground-breaking research on human psychology to understand the hidden reason behind this change. Freud and Jung were two of these revolutionary scholars who dealt with human mind. According to Freud, human and his memory cannot be trusted since it is "fragmentary, inaccurate, and not entirely trustworthy" (Knafo, 2009: 183). Moreover, human perception can change from one person to another due to its relative nature. As for Jung,

the principle governing the personal unconsciousness is not libido but the collective memory, that is a structure of symbols rooted in the whole experience of the human race (including folklore, history, mythology), which provides primordial images, principles, and archetypes (Golban, 2003: 218).

These archetypes and human consciousness cause people to break social norms not because of their evil nature but because of their animal instincts and primordial sides.

All of these studies on human behaviour and psychology made it impossible for authors and poets of the era to ignore the need for new styles and artistic techniques to be created. They should have found a way to exhibit human consciousness while portraying the protagonist in peace with his past and future. There must have been a way to uncover alienated and isolated human beings and their perception of life while depicting their struggle to find personal relationships

and their de-humanization process especially in cities (Rayment, 2017:4). Therefore, modernist novel

...has shown, perhaps, four great preoccupations: with the complexities of its own form, with the representation of inward states of consciousness, with a sense of nihilistic disorder behind the ordered surface of life and reality, and with the freeing of narrative art from the determination of an onerous plot (Bradbury, 1976: 393).

The best-known narrative technique, which was used by modernist writers to reveal how the character experiences life and manifests his thoughts and ideas, was stream-of-consciousness technique. It was coined by William James in his work *Principles of Psychology* (1890) to describe the stream-like flow of the thoughts and memories in human consciousness. According to James, “the transition between the thought of one object and the thought of another is no more a break in the thought than a joint in a bamboo is a break in the wood” (James, 2007: 240). In this way, this new narrative style made it possible for modernist writers such as James Joyce and Virginia Woolf to express their characters’ flow of thoughts and feelings by means of inner monologues. Wallace Martin puts forward the four different types of stream-of-consciousness which enabled these writers to reflect their heroes’ intriguing minds

- a) Present consciousness represented: “interior monologue” (first person, present tense), either talking to oneself, or transcript of mind. Direct discourse.
- b) Psycho-narration: narrator describes contents of character’s mind (third person, past tense). Indirect discourse.
- a) Quoted monologue: “interior monologue” quoted by narrator (narrative- third person, past tense, character’s thought- first person, present tense). Direct discourse.
- a) Represented speech and thought, or narrated monologue: character’s thoughts, in her own language, third person (both narration and thoughts in third person, past tense) (Martin, 1986: 140).

These narration styles prove that modernist writers were against the “chronological linear development of the narrative” and were trying to give fragmentary images and memories by jumping from past to present and back again (Golban, 2013: 217). The technique was necessary to be used since it was the only way to reflect how complicated the world was. Time was not objective for the hero and because of the

moment-to-moment experiences, plots were generally dealing with very short periods of time. The narrators were not reliable since the hero's perception and point of view could change any minute. The texts were also fragmentary and full of gaps as the world and the hero was expected to create his own meaning of life in this shattered universe (Rayment, 2017:7).

To put forward a general framework of modernism, it can be said that it "attempted to reveal a rebellious spirit in art, a tendency to reject the commonplace and the traditional conventions, and to reflect in their works this state of confusion and chaos" (Golban, 2013: 217). The focus was on the ordinary people and places but the chosen point of view was portraying the setting (mostly cities) as unfamiliar. The target audience was educated upper-middle class and intellectuals, yet the characters were from different classes. Subjectivity was the key since modernists believed that everybody perceives the world differently and the aim of the novelist is

...to create a whole and full impression, to produce a controlled effect on the reader through the careful arrangement of form and subject matter. The aim is still to tell a story which is morally or metaphysically relevant, but the point now is that the reader must perceive and feel the story together with the character-as an experiential process, not as a finished product seen from the outside (Onega, 1996: 20).

The human was not accepted as a "whole" and his mind was divided into two parts: his complicated conscious and hidden unconscious. His darkest desires and fears, memories that he tried to forget were repressed in his subconscious and modernist writers were trying to unveil the hidden and dreadful experiences of the hero by using new special techniques as mentioned before. Their characters were struggling "to remember the past in order to try to make sense of themselves in the present" (Rayment, 2017:6). Therefore, they were more complex and contradictory than their predecessors. Rather than a strong, decent and moral character, they were depicted as cowards and immoral human beings because of the discrepancy with the society.

In a way, all modern characters are anti-heroes, because no modern character can connect perfectly to society as a whole. To be a hero in the old sense, a character not only has to represent his or her culture's best powers and features. He or she lives in a world . . . in which the individual's needs can match up with those of society at large. But with the coming of modernity such a relationship became more and more

difficult. A sense of connection gave way to a sense of *alienation*. Social norms seemed out of sync with individual needs, as social wholes grew more vast, impersonal, mechanistic, and oppressive. Individual character, it seemed, could no longer be defined in terms of its affiliation with the group. Instead, alienation became definitive; character came to be something defined in terms of opposition to society (Matz, 2004: 47).

As the world itself is meaningless and confusing, texts are also meaningless and in the novels, “there is, in none of them a story” (qtd. in Kern, 2011: 67). The heroes were alienated and lonely and they “failed to keep up with real life” (Matz, 2004: 9). These modern lonesome characters used to experience a moment of enlightenment, an epiphany, “a sudden insight triggered by a trivial, everyday event” through which their lives started to gain meaning and make sense (49).

It was impossible for the *Bildungsroman* not to be affected by the modernism and the change that it had brought since like modernist works, “it is an exemplary genre for the representation of subjectivity, subject formation, and relation of the subject to modern social formation” (Castle, 2006: 249). The traditional harmonious hero of the *Bildungsroman* had to turn into a rebellious character who could not compromise with the society anymore. Unlike Goethe’s Wilhelm, who reconciled with the society in the end, the modern hero of the genre was reluctant to accept the terms and social norms that were imposed by the social institutions. The traditional happy ending, which usually finalised with a marriage, family, or a career, turned into “the narration of failure” that ended up with an exile and loneliness due to the “change in socio-cultural concerns in life” (255).

The modern hero was no longer a follower of the social success on the contrary they often grew “from conformity to rebellion” and ended “not in happy oneness with society at large but in intense and often destructive rejections of it” (Kern, 2011: 48). The institutions, such as school, religion, marriage, or family, were not able to answer the needs of the hero and it resulted in a loss of hope and belief with a questioning process. As for Moretti, who mentions the modern *Bildungsroman* as the late *Bildungsroman*,

the modernists abandoned their prior tinkering with novels of formation and moved towards literary structures built around narrative “satellites”: inherently meaningless episodes which cannot be strung together into an accretive chain (Boes, 2006: 238).

He also asserts that “the individual will hardly feel at home in this world, and socialization will not be fully accomplished” (Moretti, 2000: 231). Therefore, this painful and troublesome journey of the hero made it necessary for modern techniques and styles to be used in order to portray the inner world and confusing or clashing ideas of the human mind.

Another important figure who had tried to draw the outline of the modern Bildungsroman was Gregory Castle in his *Reading the Modernist Bildungsroman* in 2006. He suggested that the definition and perception of the *Bildung* had also changed into “a liberatory depersonalization” rather than the classical idea of “socialization”. He claimed that

...new kind of subject is born in this important critique of Bildung. This new subject rediscovers the aesthetic dimension of self-cultivation and becomes conscious of the artifice of the self, which now, in this climate of revolt, constitutes the only available freedom from so-called freedoms of bourgeois subjectivity (Castle, 2006: 66-67).

That is to say, this new subject was against the elements that formed the stability and uniformity of the classical *Bildungsroman*. The *Bildung* idea turned from “harmonious identity-formation, aesthetic education” and “rewarding social relations” to “struggle between desire” and expectations (24). Castle also put forward the need for new techniques so as to scan the intriguing minds of the heroes in their new *Bildung* process by stating that “a platform for writers to explore the ‘Bildung’ of the hero in detail” was needed (5). The most suitable technique to achieve the reflection of the mind was stream-of-consciousness which enables writers to express the mental and artistic developments of their protagonists as mentioned before.

If a summary is needed to clarify the difference between the classical *Bildungsroman* and the modern one, it can be said that while the hero searches for the way to reconcile with the society in the classical one, the hero of the modernist *Bildungsroman* tries to rebel against the social norms to give meaning to his life. The journey is no more towards far-away places to gain experience, but turns into an inner journey to oneself and world inside. As in the classical texts, the hero finds the happiness and becomes an individual after compromising with the society, in the classical texts, compromising gives its place to conflicts and displeasures. The hero

thinks that he was born in the wrong class and tries to upgrade in classical tradition, while the modernist hero believes that he was born in the wrong time and he gives a fight to continue living with other people around. The hero of the modern Bildungsroman is portrayed in a more attractive way than the nice classical hero since he carries to contradiction in himself. As for the ending, the classical novels prefer the happy ending unlike modern one which chooses to shock his reader. The classical marriage theme gives its place to lonely and alienated characters in the end. Lastly, the concept of “youth”, which used to be profit for the classical heroes, starts to cause losing since the hero has to leave his youth behind and acquire maturity.

2.1.1. Modernist Impact on *A Portrait of the Artist a Young Man* and *Death in Venice*

Along with the traditional characteristics of the *Bildungsroman*, *A Portrait of the Artist a Young Man* and *Death in Venice*, due to the era that they were written, need a modernist reading and point of view to have a full-understanding of the texts. To begin with, *A Portrait of the Artist a Young Man*, which was written in 1916 by James Joyce, is a semi-autobiographical story of Stephen Dedalus. What makes this novel modernist and unique is the use of stream-of-consciousness technique, word choice, and the musicality of the book. In the stream-of-consciousness technique, the story, depictions, other characters and the events are given directly from the eyes of the main character. The character’s mind is open to the readers and readers are included in the novel. They must flow with the character’s mind back and fro in the time and catch the time of the novel (Saha, 2016: 22). Joyce is one of the leaders of this style and in *A Portrait of the Artist a Young Man*, he has almost opened a new era by his use of the technique and striking word choice. Supportively, in his *The Modern Psychological Novel* (1955), Leon Edel calls the opening of the *A Portrait of the Artist a Young Man* as a novelty and adds that

What the reader discovered, as he read on, was that there were not narratives in the traditional sense. The author seemed bent on effacing himself and confronting the reader with the direct mental experience of the characters. There were only occasional shifts from past to present,

from present to past; what was happening seemed to occur largely at whatever moment the reader happened to be reading the story. (Edel, 1955: 19-20).

Edel also states that it is a distinctive and unique departure from the old narrative style since the author does not know everything about his characters and tell the whole story constantly. This is what Joyce has done in his book by even giving the baby Stephen's point of view.

Joyce expresses the complexity of maturing mind starting from Stephen's babyhood and ending on the edge of adulthood. He starts to novel with a third-person narrator and ends with a first-person narrator thanks to which he manages to represent the complex inner lives of the characters and the reader can perceive the world as Stephen does. Joyce lets his characters to speak freely for themselves and express their own thoughts and perceptions by achieving "an authorial objectivity" and withdrawing "the omniscient narrator" (Golban, 2003: 223). Instead of introducing his character directly, he implies the meanings, provides interpretations and makes his reader observe the development, maturity, and personality of his hero. Lack of a linear representation of events keeps the reader alert and involves him/her into growth process. For instance, Joyce does not directly tell the reader who Stephen is or how many years has passed or how old Stephen is. Instead, he expects people to understand that Stephen is no longer a baby by improving his word choice and language style. That is to say, thanks to "Joyce's differential style for capturing the shifting qualities of conflict and memory", it becomes possible to witness Stephen's physical, psychological, and artistic formation.

To exemplify, the book starts with a nursery rhyme with basic and simple words of baby Stephen who says "ONCE UPON A TIME and a very good time it was there was a moocow coming down along the road and this moocow that was down along the road met a nicens little boy named baby tuckoo" (Joyce, 2004: 3). As can be referred from the choice of word such as "moocow" or "tuckoo", Stephen can only express himself with these simple words since he does not have proper mental lexicon to build up complex sentences. However, he grows up within the novel and the reader can observe the change in his vocabulary and grammar which gets more and more artistic and intriguing. The reader even finds Stephen while contemplating about the question of existence after a time

All had died: all had been judged. What did it profit a man to gain the whole world if he lost his soul? At last he had understood: and human life lay around him, a plain of peace whereon antlike men laboured in brotherhood, their dead sleeping under quiet mounds. The elbow of his companion touched him and his heart was touched: and when he spoke to answer a question of his master he heard his own voice full of the quietude of humility and contrition (110).

The words like “humility” and “contrition” do not belong to everyday language of a person, these kinds of questioning sessions and word choice actually make the reader understand the difference in Stephen who has an artistic side unlike other characters. Joyce, by means of stream-of-consciousness technique, creates a process through which the reader can see the thoughts and feelings of a writer-to-be in his development phase.

The impacts of modernism can also be seen in Thomas Mann’s autobiographical novella *Death in Venice* which was written in 1912. To begin with, the issues, which modernist heroes have to deal with such as religion, family, or politics, also affect Mann’s hero, writer Gustav von Aschenbach. He has to concern about the issues such as “writers’ dignity, mastery, and status in a bourgeois world; ancient Greek notions of beauty, pederasty, and divinely inspired madness; and Prussianism, Protestantism, and literary modernism” (Shookman, 2004: 87). Furthermore, Mann is accepted as a modernist writer along with the authors like Proust and Kafka and he also breaks the link with traditional techniques. However, his use of stream-of-consciousness or other modern styles differ from Joyce or other modernist writers since

...he was not completely familiar with them and their works since he was German and his works are representative of German thought and philosophy which proves that he was more familiar with great German modern writers like Rilke, Kafka, Musil, and Hesse (Sadeghi, 2018:31).

Even though he is not familiar with works of foreign writers, he also uses “psychological characterization” like other modernist authors. He gives importance to the “cathartic effect of literature” and believes that literature should not worry about giving moral lessons, instead it should make readers gain an “imaginative insight” through which they can “overcome prejudices” and respect each other’s

individuality. To summarize, “he introduces literature as a redeemer which can lead us to understanding and love” (31).

Additionally, Mann puts forward a criticism of his era especially criticism of bourgeois life like most of his modernist contemporaries. As a son of a civil servant, Aschenbach is raised with a strict discipline throughout his life. However, when he travels to Venice, he starts to lose his self-discipline as a consequence of a forbidden kind of love with Tadzio, a Polish boy, and this situation leads to his downfall (Mundt, 2004: 88). Unlike classical heroes, who compromise with society, he risks his own life and education as an artist and breaks all his connection with life in a chaotic state of mind. That is to say, he has no longer reconcile with the society which forces him to obey his norms and rules.

In *Death in Venice*, another modernist element is the city of Venice itself. Modernists believe that “[t]he twentieth century evidences a new interest in a place as an important issue in general as a result of widespread public recognition that earth as a place” (Lutwack, 1984: 2). This is the reason why Venice is a breathtaking, authentic place for modernist writers. It is the “evolution of the myth of the city” since the writers cannot create their romantic requiems in industrialised places in Europe. Venice is both the reason of decline, decay and death, and also is a magnificent and splendid paradise which is “a theme the Modernists were eager to pick up and apply as an extended trope for the current mental state of humankind” (Stevens, 2010: 10).

All of these elements from the use of stream-of-consciousness to choice of peculiar vocabulary and settings have made these two literary works, *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and *Death in Venice*, modernist pieces of art. That is why it would be impossible to analyse these novels by denying the modernist impacts on them. In further analyses, it is going to be comprehended that this modernist perspective differentiates these two given works from traditional *Bildungsroman* with the issues they have dealt with and stylistic devices.

2.2. THE *BILDUNGSROMAN* IN GERMAN AND ENGLISH CULTURES

As mentioned before, the *Bildungsroman* gets its name from the German words *Bild* and *Bildung* which have religious and theological connotations. Their initial meanings, which were used especially by medieval Christian mystics, were “transformation [salvation] of the disfigured sinner back to ...[His] image” (qtd. in Yılmaz, 2017: 27). However, with the impact of Age of Reason, this notion started to have more secularised meaning. German mystics such as Meister Eckart and Martin Luther played an important role in this secularisation process. Meister stated that “God could be found, directly and decisively, anywhere and by anyone” (McGinn, 1996: 199). In other words, he believed that human beings were able to experience the existence of God directly and he helped individualism to find its place in religious sphere.

Following him, Martin Luther revolted against the Roman Catholic Church to remove the agency of priests between man and God. As Jeffers puts it forward

...he introduced a notion that effectually overturned the tables in the medieval temple: he said that an active life in the marketplace pleased God more than a passive one in the monastery, and was accordingly an immediate, positive means of salvation. Hustling in the marketplace created new fortunes, while not-hustling ruined old ones, and the resulting shifts in status and political power made people wonder whether their social niches were God-given after all (Jeffers, 2005: 39).

That is to say, he had not believed that Roman Catholic Church had aimed at religious concerns, instead the main concern was political and economic (Varickayil, 1980: 21). These problems led to the birth of another Church under the name Protestantism. This church turned out to be “territorial church” which later paved the way for German nationalisation.

During this time, Germany was also going on its political conflict with France and also trying to deal with Protestant Germany. Therefore, it was not surprising for Germany to give much more importance to its own nationalism while France was adapting the new ideas of the Enlightenment and flourishing French nationalism (Dumont, 1986: 589). Germans were trying to establish a unique culture and literature until they had contacted with “French bourgeois culture”, and they were influenced by the ideas such as individual development, “personalistic pursuits”, and “individual uniqueness” (Jeffers, 2005: 39). All of these impacts of French

nationalism and Enlightenment concepts concluded with a change in the meaning of *Bildung* and gave way to the birth of the *Bildungsroman* with especially works of Goethe and Wieland.

After the birth of the genre, Todd Kontje has been one of the critics who writes about the German contribution on the *Bildungsroman* in his book *The German Bildungsroman: History of a National Genre* in 1993. As for him, the theme of the German *Bildungsroman* is ranging from “individual psychological development” to “the importance of religion in a secular age” (qtd. in Graham, 2019: 10). Unlike most of the comments, he disagrees with the idea which accepts the existing period of the *Bildungsroman* as “Age of Goethe” since it would be impossible to call any other novel as the *Bildungsroman* after the Second World War. It would be the acceptance of the death of the genre in a way (24). Moreover, he asserts that German *Bildungsroman* is affected by the dominant political situation in the country namely, Nationalism as he writes the genre “has served as a venue to depict individual development in a region with a long, and often deeply troubled, political history” in contrast to a lot of critics who put forward to the lack of political impact on German *Bildungsroman* (32).

However, although the *Bildungsroman* can be accepted as a German invention by most of the critics, Howe argues that

The *Bildungsroman*, then, was in no sense a German invention, but a German reshaping of eighteenth-century ideas current in Europe but well steeped in German atmosphere, and growing gradually into a fiction form particularly congenial to German taste (Howe, 1930: 24).

In other words, the German concept was later adopted by different nationalities but especially by English literature with small differences in the nineteenth century. Howe suggests in his *Wilhelm Meister and His English Kinsmen: Apprentices to Life* (1930) that German *Bildungsroman* entered to English Literature chiefly through *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* under the name of “apprenticeship novel.” However, the genre was developed mostly by English writers who “had either spent some time in Germany, or were familiar with German literature and thought, especially Goethe's, from their reading” (7). Thanks to them, a set of literary ideas were transferred to English literature and notions such as “man's outlook on the world” had changed and developed between the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries which were the most changeable times of the world. She also criticises the formation process of English

heroes who used to be very busy “with something to do, to envisage life very clearly as an artistic creative process” before the translation of Thomas Carlyle who had translated Goethe’s *Wilhelm Meisters* into English language. She asserts that after his translation, English heroes started to derive indirectly from Goethe’s hero before passing through stages like Wertherism and Byronism and finding their English voice (qtd. in Hardin, 1991: xxv). As for Thomas Carlyle, he was an important figure in the history of English *Bildungsroman* since thanks to his translation of Goethe and under German writers, English writers and readers lost their prejudices against German works. He was keen on German lifestyle and religion and he accepted them as the superior nation while giving lectures on German Literature. His admiration of German culture and Goethe encouraged him to bring the *Bildungsroman* tradition into English Literature (Aver, 2015: 11).

Furthermore, Howe claims that it was not only Goethe’s *Wilhelm* which had affected the understanding of the *Bildungsroman* in England. The English apprenticeship novel was also influenced by the “autobiographical tone” of Rousseau and *Werther*’s “world-weariness” and “the supersensitiveness”. She also connects the development of the *Bildungsroman* with Byronism. These Byronic heroes were generally misunderstood and not able to reconcile with the society. They are prejudiced against the world and were not appreciated by their own family. However, their pride, love of adventure, and interest in art made them inspire the heroes of the *Bildungsroman*. Thanks to these works, English writers were able to analyse the deepest parts of their heroes’ minds by getting rid of excessive emotions that derived from Romanticism. Howe also believes that it was not possible for English heroes not to be affected by the changing and deteriorative circumstances of the era such as “the machine age of nineteenth-century industrial England, the growth of large cities, and the progress in transportation” (8). They had to experience the new, the unknown, and the “speeding-up” of life which helped the heroes deepen and broaden their senses and insights.

At that point, it would be appropriate to reveal the biggest difference between German and English *Bildungsroman*. As it is known, the hero of the *Bildungsroman* generally leaves his home, starts a quest at the end of which he gains self-realisation after experiencing some unfortunate events that teach him the meaning of life. The

tested hero finally reconciles with society and cultivates himself and his skills. The difference shows itself in this point as Thamarana states

German novelists basically concentrate on internal or psychological struggle on the hero whereas English novelists complicate the protagonist's battle to establish an individual identity with various conflicts from outside the self. So the protagonist endeavours for a quest for the meaning of life or an instrument for writer's social and moral opinions as presented through the main character (Thamarana, 2015:22).

In other words, while German writers ignore the influence of outer forces on their heroes, English writers put emphasis on the external distractions and influences such as political, economic, or even religious circumstances of their times which complicate the developmental process of the heroes during their journeys. Hardin supports this idea by revealing the themes such as "social mobility" and "class conflict" in English *Bildungsroman*. He suggests that German version has already had its own readers sphere who is interested in individual development and pursuit of cultivation. Its English version then adds its concerns like "moral, spiritual, and psychological maturity" with "economic and social advancement" (Hardin, 1991: xxiv).

Another critic, Buckley claims that while German writers have a conscious effort to portray their characters' quest for "self-cultivation and self-education through experience and study", English writers put less emphasis on this motif and "these works are less connected with formal education." The main focus of English writers is on the "flourishing of the imagination and awakening of artistic inclinations." According to Buckley, English *Bildungsromane* have some specific themes and plot outline. To exemplify, themes such as "childhood, the conflict of generations, provinciality, the larger society, self-education, alienation, ordeal by love and the search for a vocation and a working philosophy" are the major concerns of the English *Bildungsroman* and in the traditional plot outline, the hero leaves the provincial town that he has ever lived and immigrates to a city in which he has to deal with some kinds of problems and misfortunes. Finally, he goes back his old home to show "the degree of his success or the wisdom of his choice." (qtd. in Bubikova, 2011: 14). The hero is generally fatherless, orphaned or does not get along with his father which leads him to find substitute parents or creed to fill the empty place of his father that can cause a loss of faith for the hero.

Additionally, Buckley accepts the English *Bildungsroman* as autobiographical. For example, while analysing the novel *Of Human Bondage* by Somerset Maugham, he suggests that “[t]his is a novel, not an autobiography, though much in it is autobiographical, more is pure invention.” (Buckley, 1974: 24). To clarify, it is natural for some writers to use their own memories and experiences on their heroes if they find it necessary for the development process of the characters. However, in the flow of the novel, these real experiences get mixed with imaginary situations like in the example of Charles Dickens’ *Great Expectations*, Charlotte Brontë’s *Jane Eyre*, or Joyce’s *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* in which the story does not belong to their writers but to the characters themselves.

All of these points, which have been touched upon, are necessary since *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* is a British, while *Death in Venice* is a German product. In the light of this historical and literary background, it would be easier to understand the national influence on these books under the *Bildungsroman* tradition as Stephen and Aschenbach are not independent from the period and nation they have been created in.

2.3. KÜNSTLERROMAN

Defining the genre of the *Bildungsroman* has never been an easy act since the genre itself has had a contradictory nature and comprises of the terms such as *Bild* and *Bildung* which are used to be described and explained by so many different scholars of the time. Therefore, it has been confused with other types of novels from biographical novel to the epistolary novel and this difficulty has given way to the birth of sub-genres of the *Bildungsroman*.

The first sub-genre which is often confused with the *Bildungsroman* is *Entwicklungsroman*, the novel of development. In these kinds of novels, the emphasis on the hero’s general growth and physical aging rather his inner quest or self-cultivation (Buckley, 1974: 13). It centres around the individual who confronts with the society and his surrounding in the process of physical maturation. As for the second sub-genre, *Erziehungsroman*, the novel of education, is a term which is sometimes used instead of the *Bildungsroman*. However, it puts the emphasis on “the youth’s training and formal education, not on again the hero’s personal and mental

development (13). It deals with the problems such as schooling or the lessons to be learned which makes it more pedagogic than the *Bildungsroman* (Swales 1978: 14). After these two variations, the third sub-genre of the *Bildungsroman* is “Zeitroman which blends the development of era in which the hero lives with his or her personal development” (Thamarana, 2015: 22).

The last but the most important sub-genre of the *Bildungsroman* is *Künstlerroman* since two books, which were chosen for the analysis parts of this study (*A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and *Death in Venice*), are the examples of this sub-genre. Basically, it can be defined as the development of a free-spirited and artist throughout the novel. The inner world and sensitive nature of the hero are showed from his childhood to adolescence while he becomes the master of his art and actualise his self-identification (Buckley, 1974: 14). The hero experiences some problems which lead him to perceive his own artistic potential and talent. He has to fight with stereotypical ideas and social norms or traditions so that he can reconcile with the society and discover himself such as the heroes of Charles Dickens’ *David Copperfield*, D.H.Lawrence’s *Sons and Lovers*, F. Scott Fitzgerald’s *This Side of Paradise*, or W. Somerset Maugham’s *Of Human Bandage*. In other words, the hero has to liberate himself from the burdens of family and social life and tell his own story which is an “quest for self” and also a discrepancy between life and art that will turn him into an “artist-as-hero” or an “artist-as-exile” (Beebe, 1964: 6).

2.3.1. A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man and Death in Venice as Künstlerromane

The best-known example of the sub-genre is James Joyce’s *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* in which the protagonist’s, Stephen Dedalus’, artistic growth and development could be observed. Stephen, who evolves into a good writer in time, is depicted in a detailed way with the help of a modernist narrative technique “stream-of-consciousness” by Joyce. He explores what it means to become artist even it ends up with leaving his family and friends behind. As an isolated figure, who rebels against his community, religion, political views, and family, he shapes a new identity as a young artist and Joyce enables his readers to witness his mental state and progress.

Stephen has always been different from his peers as a more sensitive and imaginative boy. He does not resemble his parents or friends since he thinks more complex. He contemplates and dwells on problems such as religion, politics, or beauty more than any other children of his age as he even feels moved by a nursery rhyme more than everyone

How beautiful and sad that was! How beautiful the words were where they said Bury me in the old churchyard! A tremor passed over his body. How sad and how beautiful! He wanted to cry quietly but not for himself: for the words, so beautiful and sad, like music. The bell! The bell! Farewell! O farewell! (Joyce, 2004: 20)

In the first chapter, he becomes aware of his difference but feels bad and disconnected as a weird person. However, later he attends university and spends more time on his art and becomes a very successful actor and an essayist which makes him feel better and more independent than other people around. Buckley declares Stephen's pride and his sense of superiority turn him into a self-absorbed person. He is so egoistical, "so intent on his difference from others, that he refuses to honor the reality of those who move in the outside world and make claims upon his affections" (Buckley, 1974: 234).

Buckley continues commenting on *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* while revealing artistic sides of the novel and the character. He announces the "quality of emotions" and the level of language that Stephen uses to express his experiences as highly effective and sophisticated acts. His feelings, impressions and thoughts are all around the novel rather than physical events. From the nursery rhyme that the novel begins with, Buckley lays the foundation of "auditory" skills of Stephen which are highly developed in contrast to his sense of sight. He learns the things he knows from what he hears such as during the "in short exchanges of speech or in long heated debates like the quarrel at the Christmas dinner or in extended harangues like the terrifying sermon on Hell" (236).

Buckley, who believes there is an autobiographical side of the novel, however, not fully, finds Stephen "responsive to the ring of words, the texture" and "the connotation" like Joyce himself. His habit of repeating the new words that he encounters over and over again is a prophecy of his turning into a writer in the near future as "through them he [has] glimpses of the real world around him" (Joyce,

2004: 54). Therefore, it is not a surprise when he dedicates himself to the art and “ponders the magic and mystery of words and the matchless poise of ‘a lucid supple periodic prose’” (236). In the end, he comes the realisation that human relationships are not as valuable as a “resolute aesthetic detachment.” For that reason, he chooses to be an alienated and “committed aesthete” who prefers the exile as the only way to cultivate his artistic skills.

As for *Death in Venice*, it is also called as the milestone of German *Künstlerroman*, “a novel about historical and fictional artist” by the critic Erich Meuthen in 2011. He believes that “a process of disintegration apparent in that genre, a loss of faith in the Western notions of an autonomous subject and recognizable truth” are tried to be shown by Mann in the novel (qtd. in Shookman, 2003: 220). Meuthen also suggests that *Death in Venice*

treats the problem of an artist’s dignity, a concept that he relates to the idealistic aesthetics of Friedrich Schiller, in particular to Schiller’s treatise *Über Anmut und Würde*. Aschenbach founders on the contradictions inherent Schiller’s aesthetic philosophy, he adds, above all on its untenable dichotomy of body and mind (221).

He also adds that Mann deliberately discredits the beauties around to show that rhetoric is the only important way to make something look aesthetic and outstanding as can be seen from the depiction of Tadzio and the sunrise.

Besides Meuthen, Bernd M. Kraske offers *Death in Venice* and Aschenbach as the characterisation of “entire intellectual epoch” in 1997. He believes that Mann actually tries to criticise and reject the European understanding of aesthetic which is symbolised as the reason of decadence by Venice in the book. The novella also makes him afraid of the possibility of causing a “narcotic effect” on people who “prefer sects, drugs, and apocalyptic concepts — which he calls symptoms of a new decadence — to reason” (231) since Aschenbach was depicted more than once in the book as author “who had renounced all sympathy for the abyss and reprehended the reprehensible” (Mann, 2004: 135). This is caused by the fact that unlike Joyce’s Stephen, Aschenbach is not in the process of becoming an artist, he has already been an author and in contrast to Stephen’s hopeful nature, his artistic side makes him vulnerable and melancholic.

Aschenbach feels that he is on edge of decadence and has some artistic concerns as Mann claims

Especially now that his life was on the decline and his fear of failing to achieve his artistic goals—the concern that his time might run out before he had accomplished what he needed to accomplish and given fully of himself (7).

Therefore, with a sudden impulse, he travels towards Venice and tries to flourish his artistic abilities and finds the inspiration again. In Venice, he is so affected by a Polish boy, Tadzio that while talking about him, he makes great descriptions and shows the reader his talented side. However, he is unable to make a distinction between real life and the world of art. He even finds himself in a Platonic dialogue in which he argues about the Tadzio's beauty as

He spoke to him of the intense trepidation the man of feeling experiences when his eye beholds a representation of eternal beauty; he spoke to him of the desires of the base and impious man who thought by man and the source of all the roguery and deep-seated lust in longing (84-85).

As can be understood from the passage, unlike Stephen, he is not able to differentiate his art or fiction from his real life fantasies as an artist. This stems from the Mann's sympathy for works of Nietzsche about Apollonian and Dionysian ideas. He gives place to "the Nietzschean dichotomy" and binary oppositions in his work. Aschenbach has to deal with his "Ego and the ID, the modern and mythical", "Platonic idealism and bodily eroticism" as an artist at the same time (Stevens, 2010: 41). To exemplify, while Dionysus represents the ecstasy, suffering, intoxication, Apollo stands for discipline, rationality, order, beauty and harmony (Shookman, 2004: 88). These two contrasting artistic temperaments result in with the death of Aschenbach who falls for Dionysian pleasures in the end.

To summarize, the process of artistic development of Stephen and the decadence of Aschenbach who is concerned about his current artistic improvement and their writers' autobiographical touches make these literary works *Künstlerromane*. In *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, it is possible to witness the Stephen's quest towards art and exile since he is a unique soul with distinct abilities in terms of the use of words and language while it is obvious that Aschenbach's artistic and sensitive nature leaves him defenceless towards a new kind of love and country in *Death in Venice*.

2.4. ANTI-BILDUNGSROMAN

The *Bildungsroman* is a developing genre which changes its shape and characteristics within the period it is in. As long as new trends and problems occur, the genre gives place to these concerns rather than close its eyes. That is to say, as Marc Redfield suggests “the more *Bildungsroman* is cast into questions, the more it flourishes” (Redfield, 1996: 42). This very feature of the genre enables it to develop new sub-genres and types such as *Künstlerroman*, *Entwicklungsroman*, or *Erziehungsroman* as mentioned before. *Anti-Bildungsroman* can sometimes be accepted as one of these sub-genres of the *Bildungsroman*, while sometimes it can be seen as a new transformed shape of the genre especially during postmodernism and post colonialism by also being called under the names as “new *Bildungsroman*”, “post-colonial *Bildungsroman*” or “*umBildungsroman*” (Demirtaş, 2015:75). Since one of the works, *Death in Venice* which is going to be analysed as an *Anti-Bildungsroman* in this dissertation and it is stated that postmodernism and post colonialism have their influences on the concept, it will be necessary to revise these two literary movements even if the novella was not written during these periods, but still shows the characteristics of the *Anti-Bildungsroman* as ahead of its time.

Postmodernism is a term which has been dominant during the twentieth century and it covers the fields such as literature, art, philosophy, architecture, music and so on. It comes into being as a reaction to modernism as it is defined like “a number of trends or movements in the arts and literature developing in the 1970s in reaction to or rejection of the dogma, principles, or practices of established Modernism” (qtd. in Elaati, 2016: 1). In literature, it is used to contradict “the supposed stylistics and ideological limitations of modernist literature and the radical changes the world underwent” after the Second World War (Sheeba, 2017: 181).

The basic characteristics of the postmodernist literature are the use irony and playfulness in the literary works as opposed to seriousness of modernist novels. The main concern is on the language which creates a gap between people and the world. The only way to experience the world is through language. Thanks to language, human beings both feel themselves unique and the same with other people around while accepting the fact that they are indeed cultural products, shaped by the

countries that were born in. However, the most important element that postmodernism brings is the disregard of binary opposition and blurring of the differences (184). It rejects the stereotypical ideas on gender, sexuality and race which will be necessary to understand Aschenbach's situation as he starts to question his sexuality in *Death in Venice*.

Postmodernists believe that identities such as "woman", "gay", "muslim", "black", "Japanese" do not have any natural basis since they are "*discursive*", not biological. It is only possible to know somebody's biological sex thanks to their DNAs, not the "culturally defined *gender*", religion, or "sexual orientation" (Rayment, 2017: 11). At that point, it deals with stories of minority groups in contrary to dominant or privileged groups which used to involve white, heterosexual, "upper-class, Anglo-European" men. That is to say, the focus is on the "Other" and it asks the questions like "how do women, homosexuals, non-Europeans experience the world? What is the world like from these marginal perspectives?" (14).

As for Post- colonialism, post-colonial literature tries to discover what happens to the colonised when they were conquered by the coloniser. It directly deals with the literature that has been created by the colonised. It is the methodology and theory of the Other who are suppressed by the colonising and dominant culture. This literary theory comes into stage in the 1960s after a revolutionary change. The dominant criticism of the era was New Criticism which finds 'close reading' of the text necessary (Searle, 2005: 691-698). It ignores the feelings, beliefs and ideas of the writer and the reader. However, literary critics such as Jacques Derrida criticised these accepted definitions and assumptions of reading and writing processes while giving a part to readers and the writers in the field of hermeneutics as the founder of deconstruction (Silverman, 1989: 24-35). The scholars like Derrida are called as postist critics who are Jonathan Culler, J. Hillis Miller, Barbara Johnson and Michel Foucault. They are against the New Critics who believe that the language of literature is different from the language of science and daily language. According to them, language is the discourse, that is to say, the language which is used in a text is certainly influenced by the discourse of that society. Therefore, the language of science and society cannot be separated from the language of literature and this language shapes the 'objective reality'. Foucault writes that

Each society has its regime of truth, its 'general politics' of truth: that is, the types of discourse which it accepts and makes function as true; the mechanisms and instances which enable one to distinguish true and false statements, the means by which each is sanctioned; the techniques and procedures accorded value in the acquisition of truth; the status of those who are charged with saying what counts are true (Foucault, 1972: 344).

As can be seen, he believes that objective reality is created by the regime which does it by using language. From this point of view, actually the difference between colonialism and post-colonialism becomes visible. While colonialism attacks the colonised countries by force and military army, post-colonialism suppresses the oppressed races via culture and language, namely discourse. It is best defined by Childs and Williams

In the period of after decolonization, it rapidly became apparent (to the newly independent nations, at least) that although colonial armies and bureaucracies might have withdrawn, Western powers were still intent on maintaining maximum indirect control over erstwhile colonies, via political, cultural and above all economic channels, a phenomenon which became known as neo-colonialism (Childs & Williams, 1997: 5).

Furthermore, Foucault, who focuses on power relations as expressed through language, tries to create a link between language and power (Given, 2008: 249). The society uses the discourse of the powerful forces in the government. Therefore, one can see that Foucault and his contemporaries put importance to subjective reality since the discourse can be changed from culture to culture. This idea can create a problem while trying to find a common good and value for the people. Postmodernists solve this problem by putting forward that each society contains within a dominant cultural group whose ideas determine the common ethics and beliefs which is called as hegemony by Marxist critics.

Then what happens if one person's ideas are different from this dominant cultural group? Before post-colonialism, they had to be silence and conform. However, with the post-colonial literature, the group of the Others finds a voice to reflect their thoughts. Toni Morrison, Alice Walker, Gabriel Garcia Marques, Gayatri Spivak and Judith Butler are some of those writers who have different ideas from conventional discourse. They speak for the oppressed, suppressed, and silenced people of Africa, Australia, and Native America in addition to them, for gays, lesbians and females under the name of post-colonial queer theory (Belizario, 2016:

385-388). Therefore, post-colonial literature can be seen as the literature of the inferior, colonised, oppressed and silenced people who have gained confidence to show their reactions through language in their works since it is believed that all the prejudices and attitudes can be found in all texts.

In summary, even if postmodernism and post-colonialism share a lot of common concerns, they differ from each other in some respects. For example, while postmodernism is interested in theoretical and aesthetical problems, post-colonialism generally deals with political issues. Additionally, the geography is important for post-colonial writers since they try to deconstruct European identity and reveal European authority unlike postmodernists who deal with authority in general. In other words, deconstruction through language forms the basis of post-colonialism which establishes a new way of thinking by emphasising of European literature and life-style.

To conclude, it was necessary to take a look at postmodernism and post-colonialism since it would be inadequate to comprehend full analysis of *Death in Venice* as an *anti-Bildungsroman* which is defined as a novel that “follows the same pattern with the traditional Bildungsroman consisting of the individual’s quest for formation and self-development, but results in failure to achieve any growth, change, or self-development” (Kociatkewicz, 2008: 33). Therefore, Aschenach, the hero with homosexual tendencies, is needed to be read with a postmodernist and post-colonial point of view although it was not written in the period of Modernism in 1912. As a novella, which is ahead of its time, it shows contemporary characteristics and its hero is the voice of the “Other”.

CHAPTER THREE

3. AN ANALYSIS OF A *PORTRAIT OF THE ARTIST AS A YOUNG MAN*

3.1. A DETAILED INTRODUCTION TO THE NOVEL

A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man was written and published in a modern magazine called *The Egoist* in 1914-15 after James Joyce had been rejected by his first version of the book, *Stephen Hero* for several times. Joyce, who had tried to write Stephen's story over ten years, was believed to throw the novel into fire in frustration for not being able to have it published anywhere (Spencer, 1963:7). Thanks to his wife's attempt to save it, there are some undamaged parts which show that the work itself reveals a great resemblance to Joyce's own life and it evolves into a five-chapter work rather than its original a thousand-page version.

Joyce's real aim was creating a realistic and autobiographical novel which could not be actualised when Joyce realised that it was not possible to write a life story with the strict literary rules of Victorian era. He became too involved with his work to stay objective and artistic which caused him to leave the novel unfinished. However, the writing process of such a long literary work had improved his writing skills and narrative style as *Stephen Hero* "was the first text in which Joyce combined modulations of narrative perspective with aspects of inner consciousness" (Engholt, 2010:46). He tried to give the reader "some kind of intellectual pleasure" and "spiritual enjoyment" by changing the objects and events of everyday life into something artistic with the help of his protagonist, Stephen Dedalus, "a renegade Catholic artist". He rejected the rules and traditions of the Victorian era and created his own literary devices and style while trying to portray a story in which he expressed his notion of "we are what we were; our maturity is an extension of our childhood, and the courageous boy is father of the arrogant young man" (Ellmann, 1959: 306). That is to say, he gained a modernist point of view and reflected this modernist approach to his works and writing style to write about "youth, freedom,

identity, and success, and about what it means to be human within modernity” (Riquelme, 2013: 463).

During the time when Joyce wrote *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, modernism had reached its peak and Joyce was one of the pioneer writers of the era who made great contributions to Modernism with his original literary styles and devices such as stream of consciousness technique which was not the only contribution he made, but also his distinctive use of imagery has contributed much to the artistic development of the twentieth-century novel. “Specifically, in *A Portrait*, he uses imagery to establish motifs, identify symbols, and provide thematic unity throughout the work” (Zimbaro, 1992: 52). Reciprocatively, Modernism itself had great impact on his novel and character since it was a movement through which writers tried to express their dislike for the established conventions and traditional rules of the Victorian era as mentioned before. People were feeling disoriented, uncertain, and hollow due to effects of the First World War and they were trying to complete the gap which occurred after they lost their belief of God and hope for a better future. As Neimneh summarizes it with

rapidly changing times and cultural upheavals, the human race questioned moral values. Coherent meaning was lost, and essences were devalued within an atmosphere of cultural decline. Hence, people tried to find meaning in a confusing life, to construct a pattern, or to impose some order on a world they could neither control nor understand. When they could not heroically thrive in a mechanized age, they tried to live minimally and internally within the enclaves of art and the subjective mind (Neimneh, 2013:76).

Authors like Joyce tried to give meaning to their lives and through their works to the lives of other people. People, who felt lost and aimless, needed to see their “existential alienation” and suffering in literary works in order to find a way of identification and a sense of belonging.

Joyce’s hero Stephen is a great example of the modernist hero since he portrays a character who is lack of “largeness, grace, power, and social success.” (77). Stephen is just an ordinary young man who has to fight with the maladies of his life like everyone else at that time. He is exactly a product of his own age as Ziolkowski states when characters’ psychologies are analysed through “the cultural myths that engender and sustain them, the ‘heroes’ and ‘heroines’ we imagine can inevitably be read as the projection of each age’s endeavor to confront humanity’s

collective dreads and dreams” (Ziolkowski, 2004:5). Therefore, it is possible to write that the fragmented and shattered society of the modern era has given birth to problematic and incompatible heroes who try to complete their individual journey and salvation in a dehumanized and mechanized new world.

Joyce gives these problematic heroes a chance to express their own ideas and conflicted inner worlds with the narrative device, stream-of-consciousness which enables readers to see the flow of thoughts in the characters’ minds that are full of memories and experiences. In *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, with the use of omniscient third person narrator and free-indirect speech, he reflects Stephen Dedalus’ growing mind, artistic side and his use words and language skilfully. Through his character, Joyce criticizes his homeland Ireland, nationalism and the Catholic Church by introducing “a promising young man into colonial Irish society and exaggerate its fault through him” (Small, 2015: 11).

The process of self-realisation and becoming an artist are the central concerns of the book since Stephen realises his difference and artistic tendency in the story and leaves everything behind which holds him back such as family, religion, country, and friends. Therefore, the era when Joyce lives and writes the novel has a great importance since through the character Stephen, Joyce produces a criticism of Irish nationalism and Catholicism. Murat Belge summarizes the era in his epilogue for the novel and suggests that Joyce creates his work during the time when Ireland gives a fight against England that holds it under the yoke. In the beginning, he supports the people who try to gain their independence. However, when Irish people totally reject the English language and culture and strike a racist attitude with the intent of using only Gaelic language which is a primitive and old language, Joyce takes a dislike towards his own people and country. Moreover, he finds the orthodox religion, Catholicism really repressive. The Church, which has stopped doing beneficial and positive deeds long ago, is a very powerful and reactionary institution in Ireland. The clerics turn into “the epistemological guardians of the purity, essence and soul of Ireland and nationalism are fuelled seamlessly into the Irish version of Catholicism” (Miller, 1985: 151). The effect of Church on nationalism has not been denied and the Church is able to lead and manipulate people when even the subject is politics. In the case of Charles Stewart Parnell, who is also mentioned in the Dedalus household in the book and causes a great disagreement, the Church uses its power and interferes

with governmental issues. As a political nationalist leader and advocate of parliamentary Home Rule, Parnell has a secret and extramarital affair with a wife of a friend, Katherine O' Shea and the Church turns him into a disgraceful target in the eyes of the public which ends up with the death of Parnell. Moreover, the Catholic Church dominates the education and controls over it while managing the national schools which causes a conservative generation to be raised. These kinds of misfortunate incidents result in loss of hope for Joyce and his character Stephen Dedalus. Joyce shows his disapproval through the lines of Stephen as he writes "When the soul of a man is born in this country there are nets flung at it to hold it back from flight. You talk to me of nationality, language, religion. I shall try to fly by those nets" (Joyce, 2004: 180). With the help of these words, Joyce puts forward the reason why he has left his country and why Stephen should exile himself from Ireland to become an artist. They must get rid of the pressure that defined social order and Irish society has set forth with the strict Catholic dogmas. Otherwise, a self-realisation, cultivation, or *Bildung* cannot be possible for free and sensitive souls like Joyce and Stephen. To summarize, both Joyce and Stephen "recognize a sort of cultural subservience" which forces them "to be under the mercy of strict laws by denoting that any attempts at assimilation with new ethos of the modern is unavoidably an act of disobedience sought a creation of a self-identity" that makes "rebellion, exile, or inner or physical scales" necessary (Korichi, 2018: 3).

As for the synopsis, the book tells the autobiographical story of Stephen Dedalus whose both spiritual and physical development and artistic journey from a child to young boy can be observed throughout the novel. It starts with a nursery rhyme through which Stephen starts to introduce his family members and portrays his earliest childhood memory. Unlike traditional novels, Joyce lets the reader enter the mind of his character and get to know him through his own memories and impressions. The reader understands that he is a different and special boy who reveals his artistic skills thanks to elaborate language and vocabulary he uses while mentioning his experiences.

Stephen is the oldest children of an Irish family with at least ten more siblings. In the beginning of the novel, Stephen, who misses his family and gets homesick, turns into an alienated and isolated child after being sent to Clongowes Wood College, a Jesuit boarding school. In the school, he is sometimes bullied and

humiliated by other students because of his silent and different nature. After a holiday break, Stephen learns that he can no longer continue his education at Clongowes due to the deteriorative financial situation of his father. However, after a time, his father manages to send him another Jesuit school, Belvedere.

During his education at Belvedere, he grows up both mentally and physically. His father continues having financial problems which cause them to move to Dublin. In this period, Stephen keeps on getting lonely and expresses himself with the new words that he loves playing with. He is different from other students since he gives great importance to his senses and tries to understand the world better. However, his image of world shatters when they move to Dublin which is a dark and gloomy place for Stephen. He, as a newly-matured boy, starts to realise his sexual desires and tendencies and has the first sexual intercourse with a Dublin prostitute. This incident becomes one of the most outstanding parts of the novel since it causes Stephen to later lose his religious belief. Stephen, who has been brought up as Catholic by his mother, is being haunted by this horrible sin and believes that he is going to Hell after listening to a sermon by one of the priests. He becomes remorseful and devotes himself to religious acts and education.

However, after a time, he starts to find this ascetic life passionless and a hinder for his artistic development. He experiences an epiphany in the shape a girl by the sea and experiences an enlightenment, an artistic revolution. He refuses to become a priest after being offered by the schoolmaster and decides to attend the university. The university education and experiences move him away from his family, country, and religion. He starts to find his mother too religious, his father not powerful enough, his friends inferior, and religion an obstacle to his self-actualisation. He finds the solution in self-imposed exile and willingly, leaves his life behind and takes off for a new life as an artist.

3.2. JOYCE AND STEPHEN

The period, Joyce has lived, is one of the most complicated times when many turbulent events and conflicts come into stage due to political tension with England, repressive Catholic Church and misunderstood Irish nationalism. In such an

atmosphere, the modernist Irish writers like Joyce, Beckett, or Wilde have found the solution in showing “stark criticism towards Irish authoritarian institutions that have done much to embitter their lives in Ireland” and they choose to leave their country which is the only way to express themselves freely (Korichi, 2018:3). To embody their confusion, isolation, and alienation, they have started to create autobiographies and memoirs since they believe that these experiences can help readers to soothe their own loneliness which is also a characteristic of the *Bildungsroman* novels as they are often autobiographical and carry some elements from writer’s own personal lives (Holman, 1992: 52). They “use their writing as a kind of rebellion to express what they witnessed in Ireland” (Korichi, 2018: 20). As a result, by creating autobiographical novels with a protagonist who symbolises their own thoughts and ideals, they have tried to “reconstruct their own personal” identities. They take the past into consideration with its relation to “the personal and political future they hope for” (22).

Consequently, it is not interesting to find similarities between Joyce and his hero, Stephen Dedalus through whom Joyce tries to express his own artistic, political, and religious ideas by giving a piece of his mind. Even if sometimes it is believed that Stephen directly represents Joyce in the book, Joyce only uses his experiences and some memories to put forward the situation in Ireland. He explains to his brother Stanislaus that Stephen is just “an imaginary, not a real, self-portrait” and his brother adds Joyce “followed his own development closely, has been his own model and has chosen to use many incidents from his own experience” while creating the Stephen character by inventing many other experiences, as well (Saunders, 2010: xix).

These common life events and similarities are needed to be analysed since “experience” is a key point in the *Bildungsroman* tradition. His personal auto biographer Richard Ellmann states in his *James Joyce* (1982) that like Stephen, James is the eldest children of a middle-class Catholic family with ten other siblings. During the earlier parts of his childhood, Joyce lives a comfortable life with his affectionate and loveable parents. He is sent to religious Jesuit boarding school, Clongowes Wood College just as Stephen does. After a time, his father, John Stanislaus’s financial state deteriorates, and he has to give a break to his education in a similar way with his hero, Stephen. However just like Stephen’s father, Simon

Dedalus, his father finds a way to send him another Jesuit school, Belvedere College. Similarly, both Joyce and Stephen's educational lives go on with their university lives.

Both James and Stephen have had a Catholic upbringing thanks to their mothers and schools that they are attended. Their families' ideas have affected them in terms of politics and religion which has resulted in a religious crisis and an abandonment of Catholic faith since they find religion and nationalism as a hindrance to their artistic growth (Fargnoli and Gillespie, 2006: 4). Both of them choose to exile themselves from the society that they live in to gain self-realisation, artistic freedom, self-identity and they escape from "spiritually paralyzing 'reality' of Dublin to a self-imposed exile" (Anderson, 1986: 6). Joyce tries to portray his character realistically and his solution has become to draw a hero who is created by looking back at Joyce's own past and memories. "Stephen walks the same streets of Bray and Dublin that Joyce himself did, he also attends real schools and churches, and visits pubs that Joyce himself went to" (Engholt, 2010: 49). Stephen experiences the same life events as Joyce has done to be able to show his view of the world and artistic narrative style such as witnessing a row at a Christmas dinner, winning a prize in a competition or visiting Cork with his father (Norburn, 2004:4-5). Moreover, like Stephen, Joyce experiences his first sexual intercourse with a prostitute and continues his visits. Consequently, he also feels remorseful and disgusted because of his Catholic upbringing which ends up with his fall from Catholic belief just as Stephen (Korichi, 2018: 29).

Some critics like Jeri Johnson believes that not every detail or event is faithful to Joyce's own life experiences. He suggests

They are selected by Joyce, who with remarkable spareness and precision provides the telling detail. Things happen in the novel because of their significance to the portrait of Stephen that Joyce wishes to draw, because they reveal something about him (and the culture in which he exists). (Johnson, 2008: xvi)

However, his brother Stanislaus Joyce writes that Joyce himself has told him about the book which is planned to be half autobiographical and satirical. He asserts "[h]e is putting a large number of his acquaintances into it, and those Jesuits whom he has known" (Stanislaus, 1971: 12).

This is a fact that some of Joyce's characters are based on real people in his life. To exemplify, his father is related to Simon Dedalus in terms of his profession and ideas. However, unlike Stephen, who starts to be alienated from his father especially after the visit they have paid to Cork, Joyce feels amused and closer to his father as Ellman states in *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, "Stephen denies that Simon is in any real sense his father, but James himself had no doubt that he was in every way his father's son" (Ellmann, 1982: 22). Furthermore, other characters such as John Casey and Mrs. Dante are also really members of Joyce's household. John Casey is actually John Kelly of Tralee who has similar opinions like Casey in the matter of nationalism and Parnell and likewise Mrs. Dante is virtually Mrs. Hearn Conway, the governess of the family, who is a keen believer and pious Catholic. Another member of the family, who has found his place in the book, is Joyce's brother, Stanislaus under the name of brother John. Joyce also mentions his first love with his real name, Eileen who is a neighbour in the Protestant Vance family. However, unlike Stephen, he manages to find his real love and continues his life with that beautiful lady, Nora Barnacle that he adores.

His teachers from school are also based on Joyce's real teachers at Clongowes, Bevelde and University College. For instance, he gives place to Father Conmee, the rector of Clongowes and Father Dolan whose real name is Father James Daly, "the efficient prefect of studies at Clongowes for thirty years, and a martinet." (28) However, the incident, which he has lived with Father Dolan after breaking his glass and beating in an injustice way, does not take part in Clongowes' Punishment Book in real life. Another punishment which is given to Joyce for using "vulgar language", yet, is found in the book. Moreover, his brother recalls Joyce as "less isolated, less retentively bookish, and at times, less manageable than Stephen" (Zimbaro, 1992: 55). Joyce also portrays his character more innocent than himself to intensify the corruption that he will undergo more dramatically (Ellmann, 1982: 30).

Additionally, some of the events and friends are also real-life people such as being bullied and pushed into the square ditch. He is, indeed, treated harshly and badly by his fellow students and after this incident, he lays up with fever in the spring of 1891 just like Stephen does (28). Several debates of him on aesthetic, art, and politics are also from the speeches that he has done with some of his friends especially Cranly who is the reflection of the dearest friend of Joyce, John Francis

Byrne. Another friend that Joyce mentions in the book is Francis Skeffington under the name of McCann who is interested in social liberty and equality in general. However, in the end, Joyce prefers to leave all of these friends and family members in favour of a better future as an artist just as Stephen does. He, in a way, justifies the reason behind his volunteer exile by revealing his own life experiences and people around to make his readers comprehend the urgent need of isolation and alienation from such an obstructive atmosphere especially for a sensitive soul like him.

3.3. FROM CHILDHOOD TO MATURITY

As mentioned before, the *Bildungsroman* tradition gives huge importance to the concepts such as “childhood”, “youth”, “adolescence”, and “maturity”. These are the key elements that should be observed in the development process of the protagonist to be able to call a novel as the *Bildungsroman*. Abrams describes the genre as the “development of the protagonist’s mind and character, in the passage from childhood through various experiences- and usually through a spiritual crisis- into maturity and recognition of his or her identity and role in the world” after which he/she gains independence of thought, self-actualisation, and individual autonomy (Abrams, 1988: 119-120). In other words, the reader should be able to read through the earliest years of the character, whose road to maturity is not smooth and easy, to his adulthood and witness his mental and physical growth

While growing up, the traditional *Bildungsroman* character, undergoes several differences through the experiences which come from his education, family life, love affairs, religious and political upbringings and sometimes financial problems. All these hindering institutions prepare him for a better future and he is able to overcome all of them to actualise his *Bildung* process. For Moretti, the protagonist gets this strength from his “youth” which “is the most meaningful part of life” (Moretti, 1987: 3). Instead of dwelling on past, this new “youth” reconciles with his past and “seeks its meaning in the future rather than in the past” (5). He looks for ways to stay forever young and improve his skills with the help of his past experiences since “the sum of lived experience which makes up the whole man, and makes him whole” (Mitchell, 1976: 61).

Golban summarizes the stages of character development in the *Bildungsroman* in a very fulfilling way in his *The Victorian Bildungsroman* (2003).

He states them as

1 childhood: the stage at home, where the experience of life, though static, is incomplete

2 youth: the stage determined by the departure from home and consisting of a larger society to which the hero must accommodate himself, and where his evolution and development actually take place

3 (early) maturity: the final stage of desired formation, completeness and change determined by the experience in the second stage (243).

All of these elements can be seen in *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* since Joyce tells the story of Stephen who grows into a young artist as it can be understood from the title of the book. However, as a modernist writer, his style is different from other authors of the genre since he does not directly give place to conventional and traditional literary norms in his work.

Joyce does this not primarily by altering the structure of the *Bildung* plot in some subversive way but by narrating new norms of development, new scenes of acculturation and education, that test the limits and critique the various components of the classical *Bildungsroman* (Castle, 2006: 164).

He works on the possible narrative styles and devices, such as stream-of-consciousness or free-indirect speech, to portray Stephen's psychological and physical development throughout the novel.

Thanks to new literary devices of Joyce's writing style, readers are able to perceive the world as Stephen does from the beginning. As modernist believes that people comprehend the world as fragments, Joyce's work is "a mosaic of jagged fragments" (Johnson, 2008: xvi). He uses his literary genius and establishes a tie between Stephen's past, childhood memories and future, grown self. Mitchell asserts that

Since interest is focused on Stephen's spiritual progression, the novel tends to be episodic; it is clear that the basic division of the work into five chapters reflects this progression and that each chapter presents us with a distinct stage in Stephen's development (Mitchell, 1976: 69).

Unlike traditional novels, no rising action has taken place in the book and every chapter has their own rise and fall in a fragmented way.

These fragmented five episodes, stream-of-consciousness technique and inner monologues are only way to express how Stephen feels and how he grows old since Joyce does not depict his character and write how many years have passed. The book starts with a nursery rhyme: “ONCE UPON A TIME and a very good time it was there was a moocow coming down along the road and this moocow that was down along the road met a nicens little boy named baby tuckoo” (Joyce, 2004:3). Without Joyce’s narrating, Stephen introduces his father who is telling the story and portrays himself as “baby tuckoo”. The reader starts to realise that as a baby, Stephen perceives the world with the help of his senses such as touching, feeling, smelling, and hearing as he says

When you wet the bed, first it is warm then it gets cold. His mother put on the oilsheet. That had the queer smell.

His mother had a nicer smell than his father. She played on the piano the sailor's hornpipe for him to dance (3).

These words reveal his preference of mother over his father who “has a hairy face” and Joyce shows how a child responds to the world around. He also introduces other family members like Uncle Charles, his governess, Dante and his first love affection towards his neighbour’s daughter, Eileen.

The chapter goes on with Stephen’s starting to a Jesuit school, Clongowes and mentioning his fellow friends. This part is important for the *Bildungsroman* tradition since it is believed that “external world is viewed in terms of schooling and education, through which the protagonist has to pass in order to change and develop” (Golban, 2003:33). Moreover, the hero usually starts to alienate himself and turns into an isolated figure after the weariness of school years. These elements are also valid for young Stephen since he gets homesick and begins to realise his mental and physical difference from other kids as he declares “[h]e felt his body small and weak amid the throng of players and his eyes were weak and watery. Rody Kickham was not like that” (4). Furthermore, unlike other students, the readers understand that Stephen finds ease in words and literature which foreshadows his artistic side as he mentions

It was nice and warm to see the lights in the castle. It was like something in a book. Perhaps Leicester Abbeyll was like that. And there were nice sentences in Doctor Cornwell's Spelling Book. They were like poetry but they were only sentences to learn the spelling from (7).

This sensitive and lonely boy's alienation process fastens with an incident through which he is bullied by the other kids. Just because he refuses to "swop his little snuffbox for Wells's seasoned hacking chestnut", Wells throws him into the square ditch which causes him to get fever and ends up in the school infirmary.

Other students at school make Stephen feel weird and question himself as in the case of kissing his mother.

Then he went away from the door and Wells came over to Stephen and said:

-Tell us, Dedalus, do you kiss your mother before you go to bed?

Stephen answered:

-I do.

Wells turned to the other fellows and said:

-O, I say, here's a fellow says he kisses his mother every night before he goes to bed. The other fellows stopped their game and turned round, laughing. Stephen blushed under their eyes and said:

-I do not (11).

Stephen cannot be sure about what is the right thing to do. Even a small gesture like kissing turns into a problem among these different and cruel students and makes Stephen feel isolated.

Later in the chapter, Stephen's first Christmas dinner takes place which has shown that Stephen grows a little bit since now he can sit in the same table with his family members unlike his siblings that "were waiting in the nursery, as he had often waited" (27). The dinner is worth mentioning as it also helps Stephen's mental development and he starts to understand the place of religion and politics in his household and in his life in general. The dinner takes place after Parnell's, the libertarian leader of Ireland, death and causes a huge conflict between Dante and Stephen's father, Simon and Mr. Casey. Simon and Mr. Casey are in the opinion that Church causes the death of Parnell and the intervention of the Church cannot be accepted when it comes to political matters. On the other hand, Dante insists that the Church has every right to intervene with political issues since "[t]hey are doing their duty in warning the people." (26). This long and confusing fight ends up with Dante's leaving and his father's crying which has always been remembered by Stephen as Dante and Mr. Casey shout by saying

-0, he'll remember all this when he grows up, said Dante hotly-the language he heard against God and religion and priests in his own home. -Let him remember too, cried Mr Casey to her from across the table, the language with which the priests and the priests' pawns broke Parnell's heart and hounded him into his grave. Let him remember that too when he grows up (29).

Like they have foreseen, Stephen never forgets the argument and also how religion and politics make people lose their tempers and act irrationally. This scene turns into one of the reasons why Stephen falls apart with his Catholic and nationalistic upbringing later in the book.

In the following pages, Stephen gets both physically and psychologically bigger and stronger which makes him feel superior than other kids from time to time especially after an unfair occasion. Stephen breaks his glasses because of his friends and has to attend Latin lesson without it after getting permission from Father Arnall, the teacher of the lesson. However, Father Dolan, the prefect of studies, realises that Stephen does not read his book and does not believe him when he says he has broken his glasses. The incident ends up with Stephen's beating in front of other students unjustly as Stephens thinks "it was unfair and cruel. The prefect of studies was a priest but that was cruel and unfair" (45). This experience happens to be the other reason why Stephen starts to question the religion and his friends persuade Stephen to go and complain Father Dolan to the rector since he has been beaten undeservedly and wrongly. Stephen listens to their advice and complains Father Dolan to the rector who shows an understanding and mild attitude and gives Stephen right. After getting out of the rector's room, he thinks that

He was alone. He was happy and free: but he would not be anyway proud with Father Dolan. He would be very quiet and obedient: and he wished that he could do something kind for him to show him that he was not proud (51).

This part has an influence on Stephen's spiritual improvement just as other *Bildungsroman* characters since he becomes proud and prideful due to his bravery. Moreover, he learns to demand justice and claim his rights in the case of injustices.

Stephen turns into an arrogant and angry young boy with the arriving of teenager period. Like the traditional *Bildungsroman* hero, he finds it difficult to get along with the society and people around. However, since he is not an ordinary protagonist, he expresses his anguish more artistically and elaborately. Like other

Bildungsroman characters, he deals with issues such as “ordeal by love”, “alienation”, “the conflict of generations” (Buckley, 1974: 19). Throughout the novel, he feels affection for different girls. Firstly, he likes his neighbour Eileen whose family is a Protestant as a child. He describes her and the effect of religion in his mind as mentioning “Eileen had long thin cool white hands too because she was a girl. They were like ivory; only soft. That was the meaning of Tower of Ivory but protestants could not understand it and made fun of it” (37). Eileen’s traits “eventually blend with other female "E" references in the novel--"Emma" and "E--C--" and Emma Clery--all revealing different facets of Stephen's ambiguous, confused, conflicting sentiments about the women in his life.” (Zimbaro, 1992:10). Later, Stephen experiences his first sexual relationship with a Dublin prostitute and this event becomes a religious torture which haunts Stephen during his adolescence years.

Stephen himself is aware of the “anguish” and “impatient” he feels for life and as a unique boy, he has been handling the issue differently.

The causes of his embitterment were many, remote and near. He was angry with himself for being young and the prey of restless foolish impulses, angry also with the change of fortune which was reshaping the world about him into a vision of squalor and insincerity. Yet his anger lent nothing to the vision. He chronicled with patience what he saw, detaching himself from it and testing its mortifying flavour in secret (Joyce, 2004: 58).

He has been accepting the failure of his consciousness and “of the squalor of his own mind and home” (68). From time to time, he shows hints of self-hate in the process of self-actualisation and self-realisation just like any other traditional *Bildungsroman* heroes. The most miserable and hateful moments for Stephen are the times when he recalls his sexual sin.

It shocked him to find in the outer world a trace of what he had deemed till then a brutish and individual malady of his own mind. His monstrous reveries came thronging into his memory. They too had sprung up before him, suddenly and furiously, out of mere words. He had soon given in to them, and allowed them to sweep across and abase his intellect, wondering always where they came from, from what den of monstrous images, and always weak and humble towards others, restless and sickened of himself when they had swept over him (79).

As in the matter of this part, Stephen hates and curses himself “for his own mad and filthy orgies” while trying to find his own voice and meaning of life as any other teenager (80). His difference becomes a source of pain and he grows up earlier than other children because of his artistic sensitivity. He feels like he has never been a child, or his childhood has ended earlier than it should.

His mind seemed older than theirs: it shone coldly on their strifes and happiness and regrets like a moon upon a younger earth. No life or youth stirred in him as it had stirred in them. He had known neither the pleasure of companionship with others nor the vigour of rude male health nor filial piety. Nothing stirred within his soul but a cold and cruel and loveless lust. His childhood was dead or lost and with it his soul capable of simple joys and he was drifting amid life like the barren shell of the moon (84).

Stephen mourns for his childhood and his early maturation. He feels as if his youth is decaying and it worries him since he has no future goal and vocation in mind to fight for. He takes priesthood into consideration as a profession. However, when he observes other priest or religious figures, he finds their lives boring and aimless in the example of the dean in his university.

His very body had waxed old in lowly service of the Lord-... Nay, his very soul had waxed old in that service without growing towards light and beauty or spreading abroad a sweet odour of her sanctity-a mortified will no more responsive to the thrill of its obedience than was to the thrill of love or combat his ageing body, spare and sinewy, greyed with a silver pointed down (163-164).

However, Stephen comes into realisation after experiencing an epiphany- a moment of enlightenment- after what he truly perceives the meaning and direction of his life. He needs to be an artist, he needs to produce and write which can only be possible by leaving his own country, family, and friends. All the experiences, betrayals, arguments help Stephen to get mature and gain an artistic insight and like any other *Bildungsroman* character, Stephen achieves adolescence and maturity after being tested by misfortunes and unfortunate events.

3.4. STEPHEN'S ARTISTIC GROWTH

A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man, as mentioned before, can also be defined as a *Künstlerroman* since it tells the story of a young artist in his development process. As Miller states that the novel

is rich with literary technique. Joyce was experimenting with the structure of the *künstlerroman* (the novel of or about the artist), conveying the narrative through the perspective of the growing artist, literally from infancy to adulthood. His syntactical and grammatical style maps both the development of the mind and abilities of the young artist, beginning with the fragmented and simple style and associative logic of a child, and moving to the complex logic and subtle perception of a sensitive and artistic young man (Miller, 2006: 82).

Stephen goes through a *Bildung* process, yet his formation is different from other *Bildungsroman* characters, since he evolves into an artist. As a sensitive and fragile soul, he is hurt more easily and he tends to lose his way faster. On the other hand, he is more arrogant and prideful as a developing artist with the feeling of superiority. The reason behind is that "Joyce represents in his novels the consciousness of the modern man emphasizing the supremacy of art, the alienated artist and the interest in the inner experience of the individual" (Ergin, 2005: 60). He finds isolation and alienation of the artist obligatory to create free and realistic works. His insistence on reflection the inner world of the artist throughout his maturation makes *A Portrait* modern rather than traditional *Bildungsroman*.

As Clarence Hugh Holmen claims, Stephen, like other *Bildungsroman* heroes, constantly searches for the meaning and patterns in the nature to be able to survive and improve (Holman, 1992:33). After a while, he can see the difference in himself and embraces the loneliness. Thanks to modern literary techniques that are used by Joyce, the reader is able to witness all the process with distinctive memories and experiences which give way to artistic alienation and isolation of Stephen as Seret states

As the artist-protagonist travels through various experiences, the artist-author travels simultaneously alongside him, but does so in an opposite direction; the artist-author travels from present to past, instead of past to present, and in doing so revisits his youth. ... the author of the *Künstlerroman* attempts to analyze his youth (Seret, 1992:4).

These various experiences make it possible for Stephen to find the right vocation for himself, namely, to become an artist. Even if his difference is obvious, especially after chapter four Stephen gets the “recognition of artistic destiny and mastery of an artistic craft” (Abrams, 1988: 201).

As mentioned before, Stephen perceives the world through his senses from the very beginning. As Seret points out “[e]ach chapter of *A Portrait* represents a stage in the gestation of the artist’s development” (Seret, 1992: 96). Therefore, it is possible to see Stephen’s artistic growth even in the first chapter. In Chapter One, Stephen spends quite a lot of time thinking about even just for roses unlike other kids as he says “[w]hite roses and red roses: those were beautiful colours to think of” (Joyce, 2004: 9). The language and words that he chooses to use are unusual and intense for a boy at his age as he describes one of his friends like “[h]e thought that he was sick in his heart if you could be sick in that place” (10). For a primary-school boy, it is not normal to use this figurative language while just talking about a friend at school. However, Joyce reveals his character’s artistic development through fascinating and intriguing words and language that he uses as he gets maturity. Stephen is depicted as a boy who is into linguistics which foreshadows his future as a good essayist and artist. In other words, “Joyce captures here the essence of Stephen’s verbal self-enclosure: those words do not simply describe a world; language slowly becomes a world with its own character and integrity” (Spinks, 2009: 88).

Words have always fascinated him and made him wish for more to learn. He tries to apprehend the world around by memorising new vocabulary.

Words which he did not understand he said over and over to himself till he had learnt them by heart: and through them he had glimpses of the real world about him. The hour when he too would take part in the life of that world seemed drawing near and in secret he began to make ready for the great part which he felt awaited him the nature of which he only dimly apprehended (Joyce, 2004: 54).

That is why it is very easy for Stephen to be moved by only a song with beautiful words in it and to daydream as an imaginative boy like in the case of Brigid’s song as he comments as “How beautiful and sad that was! How beautiful the words were where they said Bury me in the old churchyard!” (20). As a word-lover, he is just

dreaming about reading more books instead of playing with other students since books “made you feel so happy” (22).

When starting to read Chapter Two, the reader understands that Stephen is aware of his love of linguistics or literature has not been shared by his friends.

The noise of children at play annoyed him and their silly voices made him feel, even more keenly than he had felt at Clongowes, that he was different from others. He did not want to play. He wanted to meet in the real world the unsubstantial image which his soul so constantly beheld. He did not know where to seek it or how but a premonition which led him on told him that this image would, without any overt act of his, encounter him (56).

In this part, unlike his friends, he just wants to fantasize about Mercedes, a character from *The Count of Monte Cristo*. His only wish is to be left alone and dream about when and how he can meet Mercedes instead of spending time with other kids. He only cares about fulfilling his soul and tasting “the joy of loneliness” (59). Here, Joyce’s effect can be seen on Stephen as he desires loneliness and isolation to feel love since Joyce believes “[n]o man...can be a lover of the true or the good unless he abhors the multitude; and the artist, though he may employ the crowd, is careful to isolate himself” (qtd. in Belanger, 1916: xxiv).

Stephen’s love for literature can also be seen when he fights over Byron with some friends at school. Even if his friends insist that Byron is a “heretic and immoral” poet, Stephen still favours Byron and thinks he is the greatest poet ever (Joyce, 2004: 70). Stephen does not retract his words even the boys bully him. His interest in literature empowers after he has won some money with an essay. His family moves to Dublin which is a source of unhappiness for Stephen. “His sensitive nature was still smarting under the lashes of an undivined and squalid way of life. His soul was still disquieted and cast down by the dull phenomenon of Dublin” (68). As a result, Stephen finds relief only in essay writing in such an atmosphere. That is to say, Stephen again reaches happiness only with the help of words as an artist-to-be. He cannot even comprehend the death and existence without words as a sensitive soul.

He had not died but he had faded out like a film in the sun. He had been lost or had wandered out of existence for he no longer existed. How strange to think of him passing out of existence in such a way, not by death, but by fading out in the sun or by being lost and forgotten somewhere in the universe! (82)

As he gets older, he starts to dwell on existential issues more and worry about death and life unlike any other boy at his age. Nothing is so easy for him to apprehend and ignore with his fragile and gentle way of thinking.

Coming towards the end of Chapter Two, Stephen establishes a strange link between his artistic growth and women. As Seret puts forward “passion and poetry is fused in the soul of the adolescent artist as literature becomes linked to sex” (Seret, 1992: 110). After having a sexual intercourse with a prostitute, Stephen is finally capable of reflecting his intense feelings with words. The first sin makes it possible for Stephen to speak the unspoken as he says “[h]e wanted to sin with another of his kind, to force another being sin with him and to exult with her in sin” (Joyce, 2004:88). In this respect, women can even be accepted as the source of Stephen’s literary outburst which comes into being as poems or villanelle.

He has always been able to gain inspiration from the women he has acquainted in the course of his young life, from Eileen Vance, whom he wanted to marry when he was young, to Emma Clery. To Mercedes, a character from *The Count of Monte Cristo* which he reads as a young boy, to the Virgin Mary, to whom he prays during Father Arnall’s sermon on hell in the third chapter, to the prostitute with whom he has his first sexual experience (Engholt, 2010: 39).

Even his artistic call has been revealed him in the form of a woman by the seashore to transfer him from religious vocation to artistic one. This epiphany becomes the most outstanding part of the book since as an artist-to-be, Stephen finds the meaning of his life. His existence gains a purpose and he starts to draw route of his life accordingly.

The other importance of this part lies in the use of Dedalus name. In Chapter Four, Stephen is offered a job as a priest and contemplates about accepting it. However, when he walks towards to the beach, he hears his name being called by some boys who are swimming.

Again! Again! Again! A voice from beyond the world was calling.
-Hello, Stephanos!
-Here comes The Dedalus!
-Ao! ... Eh, give it over, Dwyer, I'm telling you or I'll give you a stuff in the kisser for yourself. ... Ao!
-Good man, Towser! Duck him!
-Come along, Dedalus! Bous Stephanoumenos! Bous Stephaneforos!
(Joyce, 2014: 147).

In this part, for the first time in his life, “his strange name seemed to him a prophecy” (148). Like Daedalus, “the fabulous artificer”, Stephen has to learn how to use artifice and escape from his personal labyrinth as in the story of Daedalus and his son, Icarus who used to be imprisoned and fly to the sky with their wings of wax. It is the only way to achieve “freedom and power of his soul” as an artist not as a priest. Now he can live “as the great artificer whose name he bore, a living thing, new and soaring and beautiful, impalpable, imperishable” (149).

After this epiphany moment, Stephen decides to attend university where he can cultivate his artistic skills and learn more about the aesthetic and philosophy. As Seret asserts that “before an individual can develop into an artist he must first formulate a concept of aesthetics”, in the last chapter, Stephen puzzles his head theories of Aristotle and Aquinas to find the aesthetic ideas of his own (Seret, 1992: 113).

Aquinas uses a term which seems to be inexact. It baffled me for a long time. It would lead you to believe that he had in mind symbolism or idealism, the supreme quality of beauty being a light from some other world, the idea of which the matter was but the shadow, the reality of which it was but the symbol... The instant wherein that supreme quality of beauty, the clear radiance of the esthetic image, is apprehended luminously by the mind which has been arrested by its wholeness and fascinated by its harmony is the luminous silent stasis of esthetic pleasure, a spiritual state very like to that cardiac condition which the Italian physiologist Luigi Galvani, using a phrase almost as beautiful as Shelley's, called the enchantment of the heart (189).

Thanks to these ideas, Joyce gives his concern on aesthetic and beauty from Stephen’s point of view. While his friends are more into Irish nationalism and religion, Stephen only cares about his art and finds these kinds of politic and religious issues as a hindrance to his self-actualisation as an artist. He even finds ideas of his teachers inadequate when it comes to art and aesthetics and looks for ways to develop and learn more about everything beautiful, artistic and philosophic.

After the epiphany and university education, Stephen’s search of identity almost ends since as in the case of his expression

Stephen Dedalus
Class of Elements
Clongowes Wood College
Sallins
County Kildare

Ireland
Europe
The World
The Universe (12).

In the very beginning, Stephen, who looks for his own identity, questions his own existence with these words and realises how small he is in such a giant universe. It can be said that he searches for his aim in this life or vocation which are revealed to him in chapter four with the symbol of a girl “with the wonder of mortal beauty” (150). Thanks to this moment, Stephen decides to leave his country and move to complete his artistic growth in the end. The end, which gets form of a diary, is also significant since the reader witnesses Stephen’s finding his own voice. Joyce, who uses the third person narrator throughout the book, exchanges it with the first person to emphasize the change in Stephen who does not need any outer voice to tell his story anymore. The book “begins with infant language appropriate to a very small child, develops into the speech of an intelligent and observant boy, and concludes in the range of a sophisticated university student” (Gillie 1975: 99). Stephen as in the story of Daedalus, his spiritual father, flies towards freedom and unknown to find new ways to express himself as in his declaration “I will try to express myself in some mode of life or art as freely as I can and as wholly as I can, using for my defence the only arms I allow myself to use, silence, exile and cunning” (219).

3.5. PARENTAL IMPACT ON STEPHEN’S DEVELOPMENT

In the *Bildungsromane*, parents have some impacts on the hero’s development process to a certain degree. The protagonist is generally “in conflict with his actual parents, especially father, or any parental figures” (Golban, 2003: 239). This conflict can result in hero’s alienation and the death of the parent can lead the hero “to the search for a substitute parent or creed” (Buckley, 1974:19). Moreover “[b]eing a novel of education, the *Bildungsroman* needs not only an impressionable or receptive young person as pupil and central figure but also a teacher or mentor” (Hardin, 1990: 317). Even Stephen does not lose any of his parents or have a huge conflict or argument with them, he still feels betrayed or restricted by the ideas that his parents symbolise. However, Buckley points out that Stephen’s family is portrayed as

“elusive shadows” and they are just defined by Stephen who is “so-self-absorbed, so intent on his difference from others, that he refuses to honour the reality of those who move to outside world and make claims upon his affections” (Buckley, 1974: 234). Stephen appears as an arrogant figure who even dares to leave his family and friends behind especially towards the end. He only cares about “his own mind” which “is more interesting to [him] than the entire country” (234).

In the beginning, Stephen favours his mother and his stories seem mother dominated. Mrs. Dedalus shows him love and care while satisfying his needs like putting on oilsheet when he wets the bed. It is also obvious that Stephen prefers his mother over his father as he utters “[h]is mother had a nicer smell than his father” (Joyce, 2004: 3). As a boy, who perceives the world with his senses, the smell of the mother makes her a loveable figure for baby Stephen. Especially when Stephen leaves for Clongowes, his yearning becomes the dominant theme of the first chapter. Saying farewell to his “nice mother” is not easy for young Stephen and his mother’s crying upsets him.

Nice mother! The first day in the hall of the castle when she had said goodbye she had put up her veil double to her nose to kiss him: and her nose and eyes were red. But he had pretended not to see that she was going to cry. She was a nice mother, but she was not so nice when she cried (6).

The day when he can see his family again haunts Stephen during the time he spends at Clongowes. While other children are playing, he contemplates about how many days have left until he goes home for holiday. Feeling lonely and alienated, Stephen misses to be “at home and lay his head on his mother’s lap” (10). Even when he imagines his own death, he thinks he “might die before his mother came” and this worries him a lot (19). However, his affectionate for his mother, which dominates the first chapters, gives its place to anger and anguish after a time. He feels the “anger at hearing his mother sneeze or at being disturbed in his devotions” (132). The boy, who even cannot cope with his mother’s sneezing, becomes intolerant towards her when his mother does not approve his decision to start a university.

Yes, his mother was hostile to the idea, as he had read from her listless silence. Yet her mistrust pricked him more keenly than his father's pride and he thought coldly how he had watched the faith which was fading down in his soul ageing and strengthening in her eyes. A dim antagonism gathered force within him and darkened his mind as a cloud against her disloyalty: and when it passed, cloudlike, leaving his mind serene and

dutiful towards her again, he was made aware dimly and without regret of a first noiseless sundering of their lives (144).

His mother starts to appear him a hostile figure who stands in front of his artistic growth and development. Like other *Bildungsroman* heroes, Stephen begins to see her an obstacle to his improvement, yet, manages to relieve himself as he believes he has done his duty for his family. His religious mother cannot hinder him with his pious and conservative thoughts anymore especially after he gets his artistic call since “his heart already bitten by an ache of loathing and bitterness. His father's whistle, his mother's mutterings, the screech of an unseen maniac were to him now so many voices offending and threatening to humble the pride of his youth” (153). He is not afraid of arguing with his mother who believes that Stephen has “a queer mind and have read too much”, on the contrary, Stephen knows that he has “read little and understood less” as a person whose vocation has been heralded (221).

As for the impact of Stephen's father, his influence is much more powerful than his mother's since “the improvident worldliness” of Simon Dedalus turns him into a “foster-parent” in Stephen's eyes (Levin, 1941:52). In a traditional *Bildungsroman*, the father symbolises the authority and genre can be read as a “rebellion against the father and the social values he represents, the desire for self-mastery and the journey from father and home” (Castle, 2003: 670). In *A Portrait*, Stephen's father represents Irish nationalism with his “irresponsible and reckless world” view (Zimbaro, 1992:40). The father, who seems to Stephen as a strong figure, turns into a weak and inefficient character in his artistic development process. Stephen is exposed to his father's fervent argument with Dante about politics and religion which ends up with Simon's crying in a miserable way.

At the Christmas dinner, the father defending Parnell is a fine clear Irish voice to be admired by his listening son; but before long he becomes a stage Celt full of blarney, and then just a shapeless symbol of embarrassing improvidence (Buckley, 1974: 232).

Later, the readers understand that his father's extreme reactions are caused by his drinking problem which also deteriorates their financial situation. They get poorer and Simon cannot afford to send Stephen back to school. Stephen is aware of their financial problems.

In a vague way he understood that his father was in trouble and that this was the reason why he himself had not been sent back to Clongowes. For

some time, he had felt the slight change in his house; and those changes in what he had deemed unchangeable were so many slight shocks to his boyish conception of the world (Joyce, 2004: 55-56).

This process goes on with moving to worse places like Dublin and changing schools which causes Stephen to be disturbed even someone mentions his father's name. His smile starts to fade when "[a]ny allusion made to his father by a fellow or by a master put his calm to rout in a moment" (66). His dislike escalates when Simon and Stephen pay a visit to Cork to start a new school and see the places that his father has lived as a child. While drinking with his old buddies, Simon starts to give advice and talk about the indecent and irresponsible memories of his own. He wants his son to do the same thing as he says

When you kick out for yourself, Stephen-as I daresay you will one of those days-remember, whatever you do, to mix with gentlemen. When I was a young fellow I tell you, I enjoyed myself... But we were all gentlemen, Stephen-at least I hope we were-and bloody good honest Irishmen too. That's the kind of fellows I want you to associate with, fellows of the right kidney.t I'm talking to you as a friend, Stephen. I don't believe a son should be afraid of his father. No, I treat you as your grandfather treated me when I was a young chap. We were more like brothers than father and son (80).

While he is talking about how Stephen should live his life, Stephen is beginning to hate his father. Simon "teaches him only the most superficial code of social conduct, advocating irresponsibility as a means of finding personal freedom" and his irresponsibility makes Stephen question his fatherhood (Zimbaro, 1992: 50).

They had set out early in the morning from Newcombe's coffeehouse, where Mr Dedalus' cup had rattled noisily against its saucer, and Stephen had tried to cover that shameful sign of his father's drinking bout of the night before by moving his chair and coughing. One humiliation had succeeded another-the false smiles of the market sellers, the curvetings and oglings of the barmaids with whom his father flirted, the compliments and encouraging words of his father's friends (Joyce, 2004: 82),

After this visit, Stephen starts to think his father not as a role-model or mentor for himself anymore. His shallow advice and teachings make Stephen feel disgusted, alienated and unsympathetic to his father who does not know how to be a supportive parent for him and the family.

However, Stephen especially feels betrayed after learning his father laughing with other Jesuit priests about Stephen's most courageous decision. As mentioned

before, Stephen complains Father Dolan to the rector when he beats him unjustly in front of other students. Stephen, who thinks that the rector has really cared about his ideas and respected them, learns that the incidents occurs differently.

Mr Dedalus imitated the mincing nasal tone of the provincial.

-Father Dolan and I, when I told them all at dinner about it, Father Dolan and I had a great laugh over it. *You better mind yourself, Father Dolan*, said I, or *young Dedalus will send you up for twice nine*. We had a famous laugh together over it. Ha! Ha! Ha! Mr Dedalus turned to his wife and interjected in his natural voice:

-Shows you the spirit in which they take the boys there. O, a jesuit for your life, for diplomacy!

He reassumed the provincial's voice and repeated:

-I told them all at dinner about it and Father Dolan and I and all of us we all had a hearty laugh together over it. Ha! Ha! Ha! (63)

Stephen feels ridiculed since he has been proud of himself and his bravery after getting out of the rector's room. He has been left alone and made fun of by his own father with other symbolic fatherly figures of his life since the role of the father can be shared with other authority characters from priests to deans in the *Bildungsromane*. In the end, without a person to mentor him, Stephen becomes his own mentor and gives his own decisions. He even tries to improve his family's financial state with the help of the money he gets from a winning-essay in a competition. He spends a lot of effort to make amendments with his family, buys gifts, takes them to dinners but when they run out of this money, everything turns back to its old state. Therefore, Stephen cannot stop feeling stupid and says

How foolish his aim had been! He had tried to build a breakwater of order and elegance against the sordid tide of life without him and to dam up, by rules of conduct and active interests and new filial relations, the powerful recurrence of the tide within him. Useless. From without as from within the water had flowed over his barriers: their tides began once more to jostle fiercely above the crumbled mole (86).

With his final effort, Stephen slowly loses his dependence on his father and mother. He, step by step, breaks his connections with his family by alienating himself. He even does not feel like they are sharing the same blood after a time.

He had not gone one step nearer the lives he had sought to approach nor bridged the restless shame and rancour that had divided him from mother and brother and sister. He felt that he was hardly of the one blood with them but stood to them rather in the mystical kinship of fosterage, foster child and foster brother (86-87).

Stephen starts to believe that blood is not thicker than water and it actually makes it easier for him to leave his family behind when he exiles himself. He tries his best to fix his family ties, yet, these ties turn into obstacles in his way. As Buckley states “[w]e have been given, however, no evidence up to this point that there has ever been any particularly close relationship between mother [or father] and son, and even now we have no sense of a distinct identity setting itself against another's will” (Buckley, 1974: 232). To summarize like any other *Bildungsroman* hero, Stephen is antagonised by his parents despite not as explicitly as other novels and to complete his *Bildung* process as an artist, he continues his way without them.

3.6. THE INFLUENCE OF IRISH NATIONALISM AND RELIGION ON STEPHEN'S DEVELOPMENT

In contrast to traditional *Bildungsroman*, whose concern is adapting the defined social rules and conventions successfully, the hero of the modern *Bildungsroman*

assimilates himself or herself to pursue his or her individual and aesthetic desires separate from the environmental expectations, and thus collides with social entailments of the period which lead him to failure. The modernist *Bildungsroman* receives its uniqueness and deviates from the classical pattern in terms of the character's isolation from social institutions (Golban and Aver, 2015:4).

The hero perceives the social demands and institutions such as family, politics, and religion as an obstacle in the process of his development. He is tested by some moral and social values during his physical and spiritual quest for meaning of life. In other words, the protagonist has to complete his “growth and development within the context of a defined social order” (Hirsch, 1979: 297).

In this respect, the hero of the *A Portrait*, Stephen is also tested by social and moral restrictions especially stem from Irish nationalism and the Catholic Church. His artistic growth is pressured by defined Irish and Catholic conventions which have been taught him from the beginning as a child. The reason behind it is that Joyce wants to show “harsh criticism towards the Irish Catholic Church, nationalism,

and social conventions portraying them as the true detriments to the progress of Ireland” (Korichi, 2018: 33). Like Joyce, his protagonist also believes that the culture of Ireland is just a hindrance to his future vocation. Therefore, in the end, Joyce exiles his hero as he has done himself once.

From the beginning, Stephen is threatened by three major institutions: family, Ireland, and the Church. As a strict Catholic, his family tries to vaccinate him the religious doctrines through repression and punishment. Stephen learns that if he has done something wrong, or committed a sin, he will be punished severely. As a child, he learns to be afraid when he does something wrong to make her mother or her governess angry. As in the beginning of the novel, Dante says that if he does not apologise, “the eagles will come and pull out his eyes” (Joyce, 2004: 4). Stephen codes this punishment system in his mind and develops a fear towards religion. This religious repression shows itself even in the matter of love. Stephen later understands that Dante threatens him with pulling out his eyes because he wants to marry Eileen, the daughter of his Protestant neighbours. A marriage between a Catholic and Protestant has accepted as a sinful act by his family and Stephen apprehends that “he is going to grow up in a world where he will be forced to suppress his true feelings and conform to society's rules and threats” (Zimbaro, 1992: 53).

When he gets older, he recognises that religion is not the only dominating institution in his household, politics is another subject to deal with since his father, Simon Dedalus, is a strict advocate of Irish nationalism. Stephen, who grows enough to sit with other members of the family in the same table, is confused by a fervent quarrel between Mr. Dedalus, Mr. Casey and Dante. Parnell, the leader of Irish nationalism, has died after he has been caught having a relationship with a married woman, and is dishonoured by the Catholic Church because of his adultery. However, it causes an argument between the family members since all of them have different ideas on the point. Dante, as a pious Catholic, believes the Church has every right to interfere with politics while Mr. Dedalus and Mr. Casey blame it as the reason why Parnell has died.

-It is religion, Dante said again. They are right. They must direct their flocks.

-And preach politics from the altar, is it? asked Mr Dedalus.

-Certainly, said Dante. It is a question of public morality. A priest would not be a priest if he did not tell his flock what is right and what is wrong (26-27).

This argument takes its distinguishing place in little Stephen's mind even if he does not understand anything. Dante and Mr. Casey directly address him and want him to remember and maybe be the judge of the right side when he gets older.

- O, he'll remember all this when he grows up, said Dante hotly the language he heard against God and religion and priests in his own home.

- Let him remember too, cried Mr Casey to her from across the table, the language with which the priests and the priests' pawns broke Parnell's heart and hounded him into his grave. Let him remember that too when he grows up (29).

Due to this heated argument at the Christmas Dinner, Stephen has to learn about disappointing realities of the adult world and realises how cruel and aggressive people can get to support the dogmas or ideas they believe in. Later, he rejects that kind of extreme emotions which happen to be an obstacle to his artistic future.

The older he gets, the more religious and political conventions interfere with Stephen's life. Especially when he experiences his first sexual act with a prostitute, his fear of religious authorities reaches its peak. Even if he knows extramarital relationship is one of the biggest sins, he cannot stop himself and sins again and again as he says he "had sinned mortally not once but many times and he knew that, while he stood in danger of eternal damnation for the first sin alone, by every succeeding sin he multiplied his guilt and his punishment" (91). This very sin gives way to other deadly sins to be performed by Stephen.

From the evil seed of lust all other deadly sins had sprung forth: pride in himself and contempt of others, covetousness in using money for the purchase of unlawful pleasures, envy of those whose vices he could not reach to and calumnious murmuring against the pious, gluttonous enjoyment of food, the dull glowering anger amid which he brooded upon his longing, the swamp of spiritual and bodily sloth in which his whole being had sunk (93).

However, during the period of retreat, when all of the students have to appeal God's mercy because of their sins and banish their minds from "all worldly thoughts, and think only of the last things, death, judgment, hell and heaven", Stephen has been haunted by the idea of Hell that is drawn by Father Arnall vividly (97).

Hell is a strait and dark and foul smelling prison, an abode of demons and lost souls, filled with fire and smoke. The straitness of this prison house is expressly designed by God to punish those who refused to be bound by

His law. In earthly prisons the poor captive has at least some liberty of movement, were it only within the four walls of his cell or in the gloomy yard of his prison. Not so in hell. There, by reason of the great number of the damned, the prisoners are heaped together in their awful prison, the walls of which are said to be four thousand miles thick: and the damned are so utterly bound and helpless that, as a blessed saint, Saint Anselm, writes in his book on Similitudes, they are not even able to remove from the eye a worm that gnaws it (105).

Father Arnall continues his horrible and merciless description of Hell throughout his sermon which fills Stephen's heart and mind with fear. He talks about tortures which aim at sinners' five senses. From that point, Stephen is not able to continue his life with the knowledge of his awful sin. He even waits for death to take him in great agonies. Finally, he runs to find a Church and confesses his sins after which he starts to proceed a pious and conservative life. He strictly fulfils his religious duties, performs all the deeds from fasting to praying. He even tries to tame his senses which can be the most challenging task for a gentle boy like Stephen who perceives the world through his senses with his artistic sensitivity.

Each of his senses was brought under a rigorous discipline. In order to mortify the sense of sight he made it his rule to walk in the street with downcast eyes . . . To mortify his hearing he exerted no control over his voice which was then breaking, neither sang nor whistled, and made no attempt to flee from noises . . . To mortify the taste he practiced strict habits at table . . . But it was to the mortification of touch he brought the most assiduous inventiveness. He never consciously changed his position in bed, sat in the most uncomfortable positions, suffered patiently every itch and pain (131).

Indeed, Stephen tries to give an end to necessities of an artist. He has to feel, hear, touch, smell and transfer these precious sensations to his works. He must free his mind from all the restrictions and express his unbiased thoughts. To the contrary, he devotes himself to the religion which results in his being offered a position as a priest. However, he does not feel ready to leave himself to the hands of religious authority irrevocably.

He would never swing the thurible before the tabernacle as priest. His destiny was to be elusive of social or religious orders. The wisdom of the priest's appeal did not touch him to the quick. He was destined to learn his own wisdom apart from others or to learn the wisdom of others himself wandering among the snares of the world (141).

In that point, while contemplating about whether to be a priest or not, Stephen experiences a moment of epiphany which heralds him his artistic destiny. An image of a girl, who rises from the sea, persuades him to find beauty in worldly environment and to appreciate it rather than otherworldly deeds “with the wonder of mortal beauty” (150). In a way, the girl, orders Stephen to create and abandon his religious and restrictive dogmas and beliefs behind.

Stephen, who is freed from his Catholic upbringing, starts university to learn more about art and philosophy. This time, he has to fight with nationalistic and political ideas to continue his way. His nationalist friends want him to sign a petition for universal peace which is rejected by Stephen as he wants to go his own way by declaring “My signature is of no account . . . You are right to go your way. Leave me to go mine.” (176). His refusal causes his friend Davin to question his Irish race as “What with your name and your ideas . . . are you Irish at all?” (178). He tries to learn why Stephen has stopped taking Irish lessons and has rejected to talk his own old Gaelic language. This moment turns into to be a final point for Stephen and he expresses his dislike toward Ireland.

-Try to be one of us, repeated Davin. In your heart you are an Irishman but your pride is too powerful.

-My ancestors threw off their language and took another, Stephen said. They allowed a handful of foreigners to subject them. Do you fancy I am going to pay in my own life and person debts they made? What for?

-For our freedom, said Davin.

-No honourable and sincere man, said Stephen, has given up to you his life and his youth and his affections from the days of Tone to those of Parnell but you sold him to the enemy or failed him in need or reviled him and left him for another. And you invite me to be one of you. I'd see you damned first (179).

Through this dialogue, Stephen-Joyce explains his true feelings for the country where he has born and raised. He blames his own ancestors who have given up on their own language and adopted another. They are the cause of Parnell's death who has been trying to free his country from the colonial institutions and language. Stephen will not let Irish nationalism devour his artistic talent and destiny like in the Parnell's case. To summarize, all of these incidents distance Stephen from his family, religion and nation in the end. He realises he cannot develop in such a hostile and restrictive atmosphere and leaves to complete his free *Bildung* process. In other words, he does not accept to be “marginalized by race, class, education, nationality,

or gender, refuses socialization and assimilation into social institutions that do not advance his ...artistic designs” (Castle, 2006: 24).

3.7. SELF-IMPOSED EXILE THROUGH EPIPHANIES

It has already stated that the hero of the traditional *Bildungsroman* “experiences epiphanies that lead to (or should determine) his/her final initiation and formation” (Golban, 2003: 239). These epiphanies form “an important intermediating link which reconciles the problematic protagonist with particular social reality” (Bubikova, 2011:13). The protagonist must reconcile and compromise with the society to complete his formation in the end in traditional *Bildungsroman* tradition. He has to accept its norms and rules and ends his search for meaning with establishing a social bond between himself and the society like getting married, or having a proper vocation as a “model for a new type of *social contract*” (Moretti, 1987:22). However, with the arrival of modernist concerns, the ending of the genre has also changed its structure. The hero, particularly artist-protagonist, has to exile himself from the state and country he is in. He has to accept “the notion of the necessity of escape from society, or self-imposed exile as a prerequisite to a fulfilling life, which gives a new twist to this form of the novel” (Mitchell, 1976: 73).

This is also valid for Joyce’s hero, Stephen who has to exile himself and continue his life without the company of any family members or friends to gain an artistic insight. Joyce heralds his future and route with the help of epiphany since

It is an effective method for the author to convey to the reader that the protagonist has experienced a significant and momentous sensation that makes him realize a larger essence or meaning of his life and fate. Originally, the epiphany was associated with a “manifestation” of God’s presence within the created world. Joyce, however, adapted the term to secular experience, and in his writings the term signifies the experience of sudden revelation that occurs in the act of perceiving a commonplace and ordinary object (Engholt, 2010: 40).

The book consists of several insignificant epiphanies which give way to actual and major epiphany of artistic call. They reveal the stages that Stephen has to pass before completing his real formation. He “rejects priesthood, religion, language, authority, family, nationality and country, and embraces self-exile as the only means of self-liberation and self-escape” (Golban, 2003: 226). It is impossible for him to gain this

awareness without Joyce's special technique, namely, the use of epiphanies. It is believed that the book includes twelve different epiphanies which especially can be observed at the end of each chapter (Beja, 1992: 30). As a very effective tool in Joyce's hands, Stephen is convinced to leave his own people and country. With every epiphany, he comes closer to the truth of reality. In the first chapter, he starts to get religious hypocrisy when he realises he cannot get married to a Protestant girl and at the end of the chapter, he overcomes the injustice of the priests through the moments of first small epiphanies. In the second chapter, he tastes the reality of sexual life which is "an unknown and timid pressure, darker than the swoon of sin, softer than sound or odour" (Joyce, 2004: 89). As for the third chapter, it is a false hope that makes Stephen believe the truth of the universe which lies in the other world and religion is the real vocation he has to follow after the epiphany moment of confessing his sins. However, the real and biggest epiphany takes place in Chapter Four, in which his artistic fate is announced with the symbol of an earthly beauty of a girl and Stephen answers this holy call by freeing himself from all the restrictions like religion, Ireland, and family (Belge, 1989: 326).

The actual epiphany scene is full of symbols which foreshadow Stephen's future. Stephen's own name sounds like a prophecy which lets him identify himself with the historical figures that he gets his name from

Now, as never before, his strange name seemed to him a prophecy... A moment before the ghost of the ancient kingdom of the Danes had looked forth through the vesture of the haze wrapped city. Now, at the name of the fabulous artificer, he seemed to hear the noise of dim waves and to see a winged form flying above the waves and slowly climbing the air. What did it mean? Was it a quaint device opening a page of some medieval book of prophecies and symbols, a hawk-like man flying sunward above the sea, a prophecy of the end he had been born to serve and had been following through the mists of childhood and boyhood, a symbol of the artist forging anew in his workshop out of the sluggish matter of the earth a new soaring impalpable imperishable being? (148)

Stephen, whose name is "linked the first Christian martyr (Stephen) and the mythic Greek maze-maker (Daedalus), a man known for his cunning and skill", is ready to persecuted for the sake of his beliefs and fly like a free bird to his future (Zimbaro, 1992: 4). Joyce, indeed, fills the book with the symbols of flying such as "hawk-like man", "winged form flying above the waves", "like a heavy bird". The reason behind it is that he finds only remedy in exile and flying from home. Like his name-father

Daedalus, Stephen has to get rid of his own labyrinth and prison and fly to the sky while rejecting belonging a group. Thanks to this epiphany, Stephen understands the meaning and purpose of his life in an extraordinary way and decides to set off for his spiritual maturation.

Her eyes had called him and his soul had leaped at the call. To live, to err, to fall, to triumph, to recreate life out of life! A wild angel had appeared to him, the angel of mortal youth and beauty, an envoy from the fair courts of life, to throw open before him in an instant of ecstasy the gates of all the ways of error and glory. On and on and on and on! (150)

To live freely and to create without limitations, Stephen has to leave. He has to protest against the powers that try to make him compromise with the society. He refuses to reconcile with a country which has not reconciled with his own children as in the case of Parnell since he believes “Ireland is the old sow that eats her farrow” like a monster (180). He even becomes estranged to his own language and rejects to use the words that have formed that language.

The language in which we are speaking is his before it is mine. How different are the words home, Christ, ale, master, on his lips and on mine! I cannot speak or write these words without unrest of spirit. His language, so familiar and so foreign, will always be for me an acquired speech. I have not made or accepted its words. My voice holds them at bay. My soul frets in the shadow of his language (167).

He does not want to learn original language of Irish society since his own ancestors have betrayed their origins and chosen English language over their old one. Therefore, Stephen cannot rationalise using a language, which has already been abandoned and creating literary works with it.

To conclude, the society turns into an antagonist in Stephen’s story of formation. Like other *Bildungsromane*, which is concluded “at a momentous point in the hero’s life, which signals the culmination of a process of self-discovery, or the moment when a life-defining decision is made”, *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* is also concluded with Stephen’s setting off for a life-defining decision (Cañadas, 2006: 16). However, unlike traditional *Bildungsromane*, Stephen does not compromise with the society and accept their conventions. Instead, he starts his journey towards the unknown to gain his own artistic voice by freeing himself from all the restriction and accepting the possibility of long-lasting loneliness and alienation. Like Lucifer, the fallen angel, he refuses to obey and serve to a system

which he does not believe in and he understands that “it is time to go” (218). He has to leave to “discover the mode of life or of art whereby [his] spirit could express itself in unfettered freedom” (219). Through the end, he explains the real need of his heart and gets ready for his ultimate end as a promising young artist.

I will not serve that in which I no longer believe, whether it call itself my home, my fatherland or my church: and I will try to express myself in some mode of life or art as freely as I can and as wholly as I can, using for my defence the only arms I allow myself to use, silence, exile and cunning (219).

In other words, he chooses not to serve like his mythical “old father, old artificer”, Daedalus and flies like a bird, escapes from the devouring pressure of his motherland as a representative of modern *Bildungsroman* hero.

CHAPTER FOUR

4. AN ANALYSIS OF *DEATH IN VENICE*

4.1. A DETAILED INTRODUCTION TO THE NOVELLA

Thomas Mann, the modernist German writer, is universally known as a ground-breaking artist. As a winner of a Nobel Prize in 1929, he generally “questions the moral and aesthetic ‘certainties’ of bourgeois culture” in his works. It is also possible to see the change in the sense of time and history along with decadence of the time in Mann’s writings. He is a courageous artist, who is not afraid of dealing with subjects that most of the writers have not written about. In this respect, the time he has been writing is worth mentioning since it has a huge impact on Mann and the works he has created.

Mann starts to write in the last decade of the nineteenth century. It is an era when “European writers broke their link with traditional realist writing and adapted new techniques of Modernism notably stream of consciousness” (Sadeghi, 2018:30). Although he is a contemporary to modern writer James Joyce, Mann’s works have been a product of German philosophy and idea. However, both of them deal with the same questions that the age, which they lived in, puts forward. They share almost the same artistic innovations and give huge importance to subjectivity of human beings while describing the world around them. The subjects they handle are also similar such as “the problem of the relation of the lonely artist to his surroundings, the expression of the social, moral and artistic crisis in the years before World War I” (Egri, 1968: 86). In other words, Mann, just like Joyce, is aware of the necessity to explore inner psychology of the artist to form a basis for new literary representation.

The relationship between Mann and modernist scholars, whose influence can be seen in his works, are not limited with Joyce. He is influenced by modernist writers like Rilke, Kafka, Hesse, Musil, Goethe, Freud, Jung, and Nietzsche. Mann

forms a unique and united artistic style thanks to these important figures of modernist era. For example, he believes the cathartic effect of literature through which the reader can gain an insight and learn how to “overcome prejudices which are in contradiction to human dignity and the respect of the individual” (Mann, 1946: 287). Furthermore, Mann, who has mostly been influenced by Nietzsche, can also have huge interest for Schopenhauer and Wagner and he has described them as “a triad of eternally united spirits” (Sadeghi, 2018:31).

As an objector of traditional intellectualism, Mann shows interest towards psychology. By being affected by Freud’s ideas, he emphasises unconscious parts of his characters’ mind. He suggests that Freud’s psychoanalysis is “revolutionary and focuses on black side of human soul and passion in opposition to rationality” (32). In addition to Freud, Mann has also been influenced by Jung, the founder of analytic psychology. Especially in his work, *Death in Venice*, he turns Jungian idea of collective unconscious into cultural unconscious. He explains the concept as “a realm where the borders between the ego and the cosmos are opened, and the ego loses itself and mixes itself up” (qtd. in Bishop, 2004: 35). Thanks to the impact of Freud and Jung, he manages to create a character, Gustav von Aschenbach who gives a fight between his id, ego and super ego. As a restrained and temperate character, Aschenbach, who always leads a decent life, is defeated by his id and cannot stop his impulses to travel and fall in love. Mann makes it possible for reader to understand this discrepancy by illuminating the important parts of his character’s inner life with the help of external incidents. However, the philosopher, who has mainly affected Mann, is Nietzsche with his dichotomy of Apollo-Dionysus which will be discussed under a separate heading.

Thomas Mann, the quintessential author of the modern era, writes about “the relation between art and life, the artist and society, the aristocratic past and the bourgeois present, the North and South, Platonic idealism and bodily eroticism, the conscious and the unconscious” (Traschen, 1965: 177). As an upholder of Western values, he, like Joyce, contradicts with his own nation and society. He no longer deals with “bourgeois consensus about what a *Nationalschriftsteller* should be” as the German society is changing with its literary culture during the early twentieth century (Boes, 2014: 431). Additionally, under the Third Reich and Nazi Germany, Mann starts to find Germany as an impossible place to live in. The critical years of

World War I turn Mann into an abhorrent of Nationalism and defenders of War. *Death in Venice*, in particular, is a consequence of this turmoil era and Mann's battle with it. The novella can be read as "a control mechanism to warn the dangers of the degeneration of a declining Western civilization" (Winkelman, 1995: 6). By creating a modern German stereotypical hero, Mann tries to show the struggle with modern hero in a chaotic and disintegrated world. Aschenbach embodies the German culture and mentality even though Mann himself has a weird relationship with his own country (Ritter, 1992:89).

Mann leaves Nazi Germany before World War II because of the "undemocratic structure of Wilhelminian society" (Stevens, 2010:36). He makes a successful name in the United States away from Hitler's oppression which detracts him from his aestheticism. However, he has always given Germany a huge place in his heart and utters that "German Culture is where I am" (Koopmann, 1982: 5). He feels a great sadness and terror for the sake of German nation who is in war at that time. In his letters, Mann expresses his worries and dilemma of Germany's post-war fate. Although the idea of Germany's losing the war terrifies him, he gets more scared when he thinks Germany as the winning side. He abhors Hitler and his defenders because of the situation that they have put Germany in since Germany has been known a country of loyalty, obedience, trust, and safety. Wishing his beloved country's defeat causes Mann to have great worries and sorrow (Necatigil, 2006: 8).

In the shade of these historical and literal changes, Mann comes up with a new idea of a novel which he describes as

I am in the midst of a work: a really strange thing that I brought with me from Venice, a novella, serious and pure in tone, concerning a case of pederasty in an aging artist. You say, 'Hum, hum!' but it is quite respectable (Shookman, 2004: 45).

Mann, who goes to Venice with his wife Katia and brother Heinrich, stays at the Hotel des Bains on the Lido like his character, Aschenbach. In addition to his trip, some other events, which have taken place around that time, help him create his protagonist. To exemplify, Mann is affected deeply by the death of Austrian composer Gustav Mahler (1860-1911). Shookman asserts that Mahler and Aschenbach have a lot in common

A photograph of Mahler that he cut from a newspaper, in fact, is the source of his detailed description of Aschenbach's physical features at

the end of chapter 2. Aschenbach bears Mahler's first name, too. Finally, Mahler died when he was fifty, and Aschenbach, even though Mann never gives his exact age in *Death in Venice*, was ennobled when he turned fifty (42).

With the help of these features, Mahler forms the basis of Mann's character. Along with Mahler, another composer with German origin, Richard Wagner (1873-1913) gets Mann's attention. His opera, *Tristan und Isolde* (1865), "may hold a clue to how Aschenbach perishes" (42). Like *Isolde*, Aschenbach dies of powerful love and the last scene of the book has similarities with the opera's ending in which *Isolde* also thinks that his lover is smiling at him near the sea and wishes her own death.

As for the story of the book, Mann himself explains in his letters that his original intent is to write a book about the great poet's, Goethe's "degrading infatuation with Ulrike von Levetzow, who was fifty-five years junior when he proposed marriage to her in 1823" (Boes, 2014: 431). Mann, who is also influenced by Goethe's work *Die Wahlverwandtschaften*, wishes to show how a powerful intellect like Goethe can lose his dignity by a passion for a young girl. However, instead of portraying a love relationship between an older man and a young girl, he chooses an older man with a homosexual tendency towards a young boy at the age of fourteen.

Mann writes his book, *Death in Venice* in 1911 and makes it publish in *Neue Rundschau* between October and November 1912. The novella, which tells the story of a well-known neo-classical writer Aschenbach, is filled with modernist techniques and the use of myths. Thanks to free-indirect discourse and interior monologues, it is possible for reader to understand how the protagonist feels and thinks. Mann tries to show the link between the sickness and art as well as death with the use of irony.

To blend reason and sympathy in a gentle irony that need not be profane: a technique, an inner atmosphere of some such kind would probably be the right one to include the problem I had in mind. Myth and psychology the anti-intellectual bigots would prefer to have these two kept for apart. And yet, I thought, amusing to attempt, by means of a mythological psychology, a psychology of myth (Mann, 1960: 67).

Additionally, he uses irony to show the gap between Aschenbach's self-knowledge and immoral desires for Tadzio, the young boy who he falls in love with.

Besides irony, Mann gives huge importance to the combination of myth and psychology. He is in favour of legends, history, and myths which are not "limited to

a continual repetition of past and praise of ancient practices but it is a mixture of the past and the present in an attempt to fulfil the past with the novelty of the present” (Sagedhi, 2018: 34). He creates a powerful combination by mingling man’s cultural history of myths and contemporary topics such as homosexuality. From the beginning, he uses same symbols again and again to foreshadow the decline of Aschenbach like the colour of red which stands for death and love. Venice, the place where the novella takes place, is also symbolic.

Venice: for centuries a soul journey within the European *topos* associated with creativity, beauty and splendour—and just as much with disease, decadence and death: nourishing and destructive, the tarnished glittering European whore, the inspiration of so much western culture’s creativity in music, art, literature and film (Astrachan, 1990: 63).

As a fairy city, it enchants Mann like it has done to Byron, Shakespeare, Jonson and others. At the turn of the industrial and urbanized century, Venice is like a paradise for the exhausted writers and poets. That is the reason why Mann choses this unique place as the setting of his novella which has included similar binary oppositions of beauty and decadence.

As for the synopsis, the book tells the story of fifty-year-old Gustav von Aschenbach who is a famous well-known and respected writer of his time. Aschenbach, who leads a disciplined, rational and strict life as an artist, wanders around Munich, the city he lives in. Suddenly, he comes across a stranger in front of a cemetery and “stranger’s perambulatory appearance” affects him very deeply. He starts to cringe for “a fervent youthful craving for faraway places” (Mann, 2004:5). As a rationalist and decisive man, he cannot stop his urge for travelling and decides to leave for some exotic places which, according to Aschenbach, can also a remedy for his writer’s block.

In a few days, Aschenbach sets off for an unknown island by the Adriatic Sea. However, he is not able to find the relaxation he looks for in this island. Therefore, he leaves the island and goes to Venice where he has been before. While going to Venice, he encounters a group of young people who are having fun. However, Aschenbach is disgusted particularly by a man who pretends to be young in spite of his old age. He seems like a clown with his painted face and casual clothes. Disturbed by the appearance of the old man, Aschenbach hires a gondola to

go to his hotel at the Lido yet he argues with the gondolier after he has not taken his order.

Finally, at the hotel, he creates a routine to himself such as getting prepared for meals, going to the beach and observing the environment. One day while sitting in the dining room, he recognises a Polish family with three children, two girls and a boy. The boy becomes the centre of Aschenbach's focus and he cannot resist the "godlike beauty of this mortal being." (52) In the beginning, Aschenbach, who seems to have fatherly feelings for the boy, starts to be obsessed with this fourteen-year-old Polish boy, Tadzio. He gets excited when he sees the boy at the hotel, in the streets, and especially on the beach where he goes every day to stalk the boy and watch him.

Unfortunately, as a man with poor health, Aschenbach is affected badly by Venice's suffocating weather. After coming back to the hotel from his walk, he impulsively informs the hotel about his leaving. In that very morning, he begins to feel regret because of his sudden decision. His regret increases when he comes across Tadzio but it is too late to change his mind. Luckily, when he goes to the station to leave Venice, he learns that his luggage has mistakenly been sent somewhere. Instead of getting angry, Aschenbach fills with joy since it means he can go back to the hotel and his lover-boy Tadzio. That night he understands that actually the reason why he has not wanted to leave Venice is Tadzio and he loves him.

This forbidden and homosexual tendency shocks both the reader and Aschenbach himself as he is an Apollonian, logical, and self-disciplined artist. As a restrained and temperate individual, he starts to lose his dignity and almost gets frenzy with the joy of love. He secretly follows him and his family everywhere, leans himself towards walls and whispers that he loves him; that is to say, Aschenbach begins to act like a rascal and desperate lover in spite of his world-wide fame and old age. He, disgusted by the old man who has pretended to be young, turns into the same clown like him. He cannot stop staring at him and from time to time, Aschenbach is disillusioned and believes that Tadzio is also into him.

Due to this unforbidden and dangerous love, he even refuses to leave Venice which starts to be invaded by cholera, a deadly illness. Even when all the tourists have left the city, he does not consider leaving as an option since Tadzio is still in there. Besides not leaving the city, he makes sure that Tadzio's family will not learn about the epidemic as well. He risks both his and his lover's lives just because he is

in a crazy state of mind. The previous rational and temperate writer turns into a mindless, reckless man in the hands of Eros, god of love. In the end, tired Aschenbach, who comes back from a stalking session, forgets all about the warning of viral food and buys some strawberries. However, the strawberries, which are not contaminated, infects Aschenbach with cholera. He dies alone and miserably on the beach while watching Tadzio's walking towards the sea.

4.2. APOLLO VERSUS DIONYSUS

Thomas Mann, who makes various allusions to Greek mythology, has created his controversial work *Death in Venice* under the influence of great scholar Friedrich Nietzsche (1844-1900). In his major treatise, *The Birth of the Tragedy*, Nietzsche mentions two opposite forces whose struggle results in the birth of highest art form, tragedy in ancient Greece. Nietzsche explains these two forces as

with the duality of the *Apolline* and the *Dionysiac* in much the same way as reproduction depends on there being two sexes which co-exist in a state of perpetual conflict interrupted only occasionally by periods of reconciliation (Nietzsche, 1999:14).

He believes that these two different poles are in the core of artistic creation since they are giving a fight to take the control over humanity. As for Nietzsche while Apollonian side of the tragedy deals with visual arts, the concern of Dionysian part is "non-visual art of music". By conflicting with each other all the time, they help to create provoking and powerful pieces of work. The combination of these two impulses can make it possible for a tragedy to be called successful. While Apollo brings in the formation of restrained and rational heroes, Dionysus gives birth to passionate and carefree ones.

'Apollo' embodies the drive toward distinction, discreteness and individuality, toward the drawing and respecting of boundaries and limits; he teaches an ethic of moderation and self-control... In literature the purest and most intense expression of the Apolline is Greek epic poetry (especially Homer). The other contestant in the struggle for the soul of ancient Greece was Dionysos. The Dionysiac is the drive towards the transgression of limits, the dissolution of boundaries, the destruction of individuality, and excess. The purest artistic expression of the Dionysiac was quasi-orgiastic forms of music, especially of choral singing and dancing (xi).

The conflict between these two powerful forces forms the basis of Mann's novella. His protagonist, Aschenbach, who is a rational, self-disciplined, and stoic writer, loses himself because of the Dionysian urges and temptation which are represented by Tadzio in the book. As a successful and restrained individual, he experiences a discrepancy between his old and disciplined life as a writer, and new carefree, impulsive, degenerated life as a lover. That is to say, Mann creates his main character with an internal conflict of "the Dionysian to Apollonian, impulse to repression, transgression to conventionality" which ends up with his Apollonian artist's death. By "underlying the contradictions of sexual difference", Mann tries to resolve this conflict between Apollonian and Dionysian forces (Hayes and Quinby, 1989: 159).

Some scholars believe that Aschenbach is drifted by his passionate urges easily because of the origins of his father and mother. His father was a strict Prussian and Aschenbach's "discipline was fortunately an inborn quality he had inherited from his father's side of the family" (Mann, 2004:14). As for his mother, she was a "daughter of Bohemian musical bandmaster" (11). Therefore, it can be concluded that "it was from her that the blood of the Dionysian poet flowed in him" (Hayes and Quinby, 1989: 164). Tadzio brings out the repressed and hidden parts of Aschenbach's mind and turns into a reason for his frightening and passionate bacchanalian dream. Aschenbach falls into hands of Dionysian "feminine" characteristics such as "receptivity, desire, hysteria, the overflow and redundancy of speech" (160).

Aschenbach, firstly, becomes a victim of his Dionysian side when he encounters a stranger tourist with "the brown hair beneath the straw hat with its colorful band" (Mann, 2004: 29). According to some critics, this tourist symbolises Hermes, the messengers of gods, also a "cunning trickster who moves freely between the mortal and godly worlds and a guide to the Underworld" (qtd. in Sizemore, 2014: 236). This stranger figure makes Aschenbach feel a sudden desire to travel to far-away places which is not a normal thing for a strict and disciplined artist like him. Hermes, who also appears in the shape of other characters such as gondolier and the old man on the ship, leads Aschenbach to Dionysian realms and his death (237).

However, the effect of Dionysus can mainly be observed in Aschenbach's bacchanalian dream which is full of mythological allusions. The satyr-like figures

and women and men, who act as if they have lost their minds, are usually depicted as a scene from Dionysian orgies. Aschenbach, is in his “terrifying dream”, which crushes “his resistance, a deep, spiritual resistance, and, having run their course, leaving his entire being, the culture of a lifetime, devastated, obliterated” (Mann, 2004: 126). At the beginning, he watches the crazy women who are “cupping their breasts in both hands and shrieking; men with horns coming out of their foreheads, fur loincloths, and shaggy torsos” from outside (127). However, the worshipping of “the *strangergod*”, Dionysus, or so-called Tadzio in the book, manages to drag him into the orgy. Aschenbach is shattered with shock and fear as a rational and restrained man who becomes a part of this madness.

Aschenbach’s regained detachment from all mankind was permanent; he could not overcome his distance. Nor could he hope for the actual pleasure of the flesh not, at least in this world. If he abandoned himself, if he gave up all order and even laid his life on the line, he might somehow join the orgy (Braverman and Nachmann, 1970: 293).

He realises that he is no more the old, reasonable artist who devotes his all life to moderation and temperance. Aschenbach is captured by Dionysus, the passionate and desirous god in the figure of Tadzio, a fourteen-year-old young boy.

To sum up, Aschenbach becomes a toy and turns into a helpless figure because of the spiritual intoxication that Dionysian side of his mind causes. He, as a defeated artist, accepts death without questioning since the battle between Apollo and Dionysus is beaten by Dionysus who is the reason why Aschenbach falls from the good graces. The embodiment of German personality characteristics, Gustav von Aschenbach with his “self-discipline, self-sacrifice, and subordination of self to a normative authority” is defeated by “the enjoyment of life” (Stackelberg, 1992: 39). The clash between these two powerful gods turns Mann’s protagonist into a sick and corrupted man and leads him into his volunteer death.

4.3. MANN AND ASCHENBACH

It is widely accepted that Thomas Mann is more or less like his protagonist, Gustav von Aschenbach who is depicted as a writer, as well. Both of them deal with the “eruption of suppressed desire, the dubious morality of aestheticism, and a

decadent author's attitude toward bourgeois life" (Shookman, 2004: 1). They share the same experiences and Aschenbach can be seen as Mann's alter ego by some critics (Shookman, 2003: 37). To illustrate, the circumstance that surrounds Aschenbach is from the real experiences of Mann. Between 26 May- 2 June 1911, Mann also travels to Venice with his wife, Katia and his brother, Heinrich and stays at the Lido in the Hotel des Bains just like Aschenbach does. He has received the news of Gustav Mahler's death which forms a basis for his main character. Additionally, Mann is attracted by a Polish boy, Wladyslaw Moes during this journey.

In an autobiographical sketch published in 1930, he recalled that nothing in that story is invented. The wanderer at the cemetery, the ship from Pola, the old dandy, the dubious gondolier, Tadzio and his family, an attempt to depart that was stymied by lost luggage, the honest clerk, and the street singer—all had existed in fact (2004: 42).

However, of course there are differences between their stories such as the owner of the lost luggage or Mann's returning from Venice in a safe and sound way.

Mann, who has carried the same problems with Aschenbach especially during his youth, explains that

Nothing is invented in *Death in Venice* ...; all that and anything else you like, they were all there. I had only to arrange them when they showed at once and in the oddest way their capacity as elements of composition. Perhaps it had to do with this: that as I worked on the story - as always it was a long-drawn-out job - I had at moments, the clearest feelings of transcendence, a sovereign sense of being borne up such as I had never before experienced (qtd. in Giobbi, 1989: 56).

Due to Mann's this statement which is the acknowledgment of Mann himself, scholars have started to believe in the similarities between his character and Mann. While some of them see Aschenbach as the alternative version of Mann, some other think Aschenbach is the poet who Mann has always wished to be since "the main works that the fictional poet is supposed to have written are those that Mann had attempted and abandoned during the previous decade" (Boes, 2014: 432). Moreover, Aschenbach is the successful version of Mann who has not been able to achieve the same success which he has done with the publication of *Buddenbrook* again.

Another similarity between Mann and Aschenbach is their mutual interest towards Venice and homosexual tendencies. Mann is enchanted by Venice just as

Aschenbach even though he can see the dangerous and corrupted side of the city. In his letter to his children, Mann writes that “ambiguous is really the simplest term one can use to define Venice...but it suits her in all its possible meanings, notwithstanding the fatuity and corruption which dominate her” (qtd. in Giobbi, 1989: 58). As for homosexuality, some critics assert that Mann expresses his repressed homosexual desires by means of Aschenbach character.

He was a man accused of having homoerotic relations, the father of three homosexual children, a man with a family history of artistic proclivity and mental illness, which was seen as a manifestation of degeneration. If he was the incarnation of *Bürgerlichkeit*, he was also the incarnation of the decadent artist yearning for a fulfilling life in a society which compelled him to behave according to their standards (Winkelmann, 1995: 9).

Mann, who has suspicions over his sexual orientation, is thought to be torn between Apollonian and Dionysian forces like his protagonist, Aschenbach. Despite being a father and a husband, he is still believed to be a man with homosexual tendencies which is forbidden by the society of his time as a result of which he may live his desires and passions through the character of Aschenbach.

However, Mann uses ironic distance to prevent the identification between his main character Aschenbach and himself as he is aware of the possibility of resemblance. Especially by killing his protagonist in the end, he distances himself from Aschenbach. The distance is also “revealed through the novella and enables Mann...to *endorse* different philosophical perspectives and ideas” (Vega- Encabo, 2016: 131). Like Joyce, he also gives his opinion on aestheticism and art through his character by keeping his distance. While his protagonist loses his way and dies under the magic of Dionysian urges, Thomas Mann consumes his unnamed and hidden impulses by experiencing them through Aschenbach and does not leave his comfort zone.

4.4. CHARACTERISTICS OF *BILDUNGSROMAN* IN *DEATH IN VENICE*

In spite of being able to be classified as an *Anti-Bildungsroman*, Thomas Mann’s novella, *Death in Venice* also carries some characteristics with traditional *Bildungsroman*. To begin with, the genre itself deals with the problem of

development of a young protagonist. However, as mentioned before, the development can be also taken from a specific time period of the protagonist. In *Death in Venice*, Mann tries to show “Aschenbach's development up to his fifties, narrated in historical retrospect by a severely ironic, omniscient voice as a novel of education” although his success can be discussed since it can be said that the hero experiences a reverse *Bildung* process (Hardin, 1991: 363). In addition to this, the lust for journey which is a personality trait of *Bildungsroman* hero can also be experienced by Aschenbach. He travels to Venice, a city which can both be associated with corruption and beauty just like the cities that are travelled by traditional *Bildungsroman* heroes since the city “is both the agent of liberation and a source of corruption” (Buckley, 1974: 21). However, the difference between Aschenbach and typical *Bildungsroman* protagonist lies in Aschenbach’s personality which is not suitable for that kind of sudden instinctive desires such as wanderlust.

It was wanderlust, pure and simple, yet it had come upon him like a seizure and grown into a passion—no, more, an hallucination... Thus it was that the sudden and belated impulse which had come over him was soon restrained and redressed by reason and the self-discipline he had practiced from an early age (Mann, 2004: 6-8).

As a disciplined and temperate artist, Aschenbach is not accustomed to leaving all the work behind and going wherever he wants. However, with the emergence of the man “of medium height, thin, beardless, and strikingly snub-nosed”, he begins to be dragged by his Dionysian impulses and immediately plans his trip to exotic places.

Indeed, this encounter scene is not only related to the theme of “journey”, it also touches upon one of the most outstanding motifs of *Bildungsroman* tradition, “epiphany”. As far as the motif of epiphany is concerned, it is known that “special moments of sudden insight” are called epiphanies through which the protagonist is enlightened and changes the course of his life (Baldick, 2001: 84). In the book, Aschenbach also experiences these spiritual manifestations and changes his Apollonian life style into Dionysian one. The first epiphany arrives with the emergence of a stranger tourist.

It may have been the stranger’s perambulatory appearance that acted upon his imagination or some other physical or psychological influence coming into play, but much to his surprise he grew aware of a strange expansion of his inner being, a kind of restive anxiety, a fervent youthful craving for faraway places, a feeling so vivid, so new or else so long outgrown and forgotten that he came to a standstill and—hands behind

his back, eyes on the ground, rooted to the spot—examined the nature and purport of the feeling (Mann, 2004: 5).

Aschenbach is filled with sudden and unexpected urges to travel after experiencing the first epiphany through this unwelcomed character. However, it can be deduced that he “arrives at a negative epiphany of inward surrender to Dionysus after decades of repressive self-control” since travelling to Venice is a step to his destruction (Hardin, 1991: 363).

Furthermore, Aschenbach gets through artistic epiphanies as a writer especially when he comes across Tadzio who is the representation of godlike beauty for him.

What discipline, what precision of thought was conveyed by that tall, youthfully perfect physique! Yet the austere and pure will laboring in obscurity to bring the godlike statue to light—was it not known to him, familiar to him as an artist? Was it not at work in him when, chiselling with sober passion at the marble block of language, he released the slender form he had beheld in his mind and would present to the world as an effigy and mirror of spiritual beauty? (Mann, 2004: 81)

He starts to question his Apollonian upbringing and lifestyle which have kept him away from the worth of real beauty. To justify his unacceptable thoughts and wishes, he even pictures a dialogue between Socrates and Phaedrus, who is trying to be seduced by his teacher, Socrates while learning philosophy of art, love, and beauty. He spends too much effort to persuade himself and the reader since the kind of love he feels for Tadzio is not natural particularly for the readers of that age.

One of the most impressive epiphany moments is the time when the reader and Aschenbach realise that his love for Tadzio is not a fatherly but a romantic one. Aschenbach, who decides to leave Venice with a sudden urge, starts to feel regretful and sorry when the real time for leaving arrives. He finds it difficult to inform the hotel about his change of mind since he finds it embarrassing as a decisive and rational artist whose major concern should be his health. However, his situation grows from bad to worse when he gets on the vaporetto and arrives at the train station. While “his pain and perplexity grew to the point of distraction”, he gets news of his missing luggage (69). Thanks to this misunderstanding, he would be able to turn back to his hotel and lover as “[f]rom time to time his breast still shook with laughter at the thought of this mishap, which, he said to himself, could not have

befallen even the luckiest of men at a more opportune moment” (71). He returns back to his hotel and understands the very reason of his excessive happiness with an arrival of an epiphanic moment.

So you're still here, too, Tadzio. But at that very moment he felt the casual greeting fade and vanish before the truth of his heart, he felt the rapture of his blood, the joy and agony of his soul, and acknowledged to himself that it was Tadzio who had made it so hard for him to leave (73).

This is the very moment when Aschenbach becomes conscious of his love for Tadzio and comprehends the very reason why he has not wanted to leave Venice behind with “a gesture of willingness, welcome, of calm acceptance.” (74). From that moment on, Aschenbach turns into a toy in the hands of Eros and spends his days in pursuit of his lover boy even if he humiliates himself. Finally, he dies on the beach as “he experiences an 'epiphanic' vision of the young man” (Giobbi, 1989: 56). Aschenbach believes that Tadzio is “smiling at him, beckoning to him” as if he wants Aschenbach to follow him (141). With this idea on his mind, he closes his eyes to the world. To conclude, Aschenbach idealises Tadzio through this epiphanic moment which arouses strong emotions in his heart and mind and he is sacrificed because of his passion and desire for Tadzio by the god Dionysus in a way.

4.5. CHARACTERISTICS OF *ANTI-BILDUNGSROMAN IN DEATH IN VENICE*

With the arrival of modernism, post-modernism and post-colonialism, the literary world has found itself in an inevitable need of change. The problems that the heroes fight with have transferred since the old traditions are not able to answer the need of human beings who are feeling lost and aimless especially after the World Wars (Rayment, 2017:7). The subjectivity starts to become the main concern of the writers and they have tried new techniques to portray their confused protagonists. Particularly during the post- modernist and post-colonial period, the demand has started to circle around telling the stories of the “Other”, being the voice of the “Unspoken” who are mostly lesbians, homosexuals, colonised, suppressed and so many others (Belizario, 2016: 385-388). Writers of the time have been searching for new ways to demonstrate “simultaneous subversiveness of patriarchal values” and unified subjectivity (Hayes and Quinby, 1989: 160). As a result of these changes, the

traditional *Bildungsroman* has also changed its form and themes it deals with. It has given way to the birth of *Anti-Bildungsroman* which can also be called as “reverse” or “um” *Bildungsroman* time to time (Demirtaş, 2015:75). *Death in Venice* can also be read as a part of this *Anti-Bildungsroman* with its subversive subject of homosexuality, the reverse *Bildung* of its main character, Aschenbach, and also its unconventional ending.

4.5.1. The Issue of Maturity and Artistic Growth

It has already been mentioned that a typical *Bildungsroman* demonstrates the developmental journey of a young hero “from childhood to adulthood in which young people takes responsibilities in their community” (Nordlén, 2009:2). In his necessary growth process, “family”, “schooling”, “exile”, “love”, “soul-searching”, “adolescence”, “maturity”, “alienation”, and “searching for a vocation” turn into real antagonists from time to time to be able to portray the quest of the hero who is constantly being tested by misfortunate circumstances (Buckley, 1974: 17-18). In case of a *Künstlerroman*, the focus is on the painful improvement process of the artist who is usually depicted from his early age to maturity in order to put forward the hardships, restrictions and inspirations he gets through. Additionally, the hero, who has usually in conflict with his parents especially with his father, is believed to pass through fixed stages under the name of “separation-initiation- return”. They represent “the departure from the native environment the adventure in the unfamiliar world, and the return with a new awareness of the world” after achieving self-acknowledgment and self-realisation (Golban, 2018: 12). When all of these elements are taken into consideration, it is obvious that Mann’s hero, Gustav von Aschenbach does not fulfil the necessities of a typical *Bildungsroman* hero.

To begin with, Aschenbach is not depicted from his childhood to maturity. The book starts when he is around fifty years old, in other words, he is already mature. In contrast to typical *Bildungsroman* hero, Aschenbach has already taken his place in society as a respected writer. Furthermore, while a *Bildungsroman* hero’s agony of getting married to a suitable partner is portrayed to reveal his effort of fitting in the given society, Mann’s hero comes into stage as an already married man with children.

...enjoying the respect that is in certain cases vouchsafed the intellect. The marriage he had contracted in his youth with a girl from a scholarly family was cut short, following a brief period of bliss, by the girl's death. It left him with a daughter, who was now married. He had had no son (Mann, 2004: 22).

Moreover, there is no evidence of conflicting with the family members since he is from a very successful and respectful one. It can be even said that instead of preventing him from being an artist, with their own artistic backgrounds, they become role models for their son. His ancestors have been "officers, judges, and civil servants, men who led disciplined, decently austere lives serving king and state" instead of indecent people (22).

A certain inner spirituality had manifested itself in the person of the only clergyman amongst them, and a strain of more impetuous, sensual blood had found its way into the family in the previous generation through the writer's mother, the daughter of a Bohemian bandmaster. She was the source of the foreign racial features in his appearance. It was the union of the father's sober, conscientious nature with the darker, more fiery impulses of the mother that engendered the artist—and this particular artist (12).

In other words, it is not appropriate to point his family as a hindrance to his artistic growth since he feels "serenely confident of his mastery" as an artist (9). Instead of trying to complete his apprenticeship like typical *Bildungsroman* heroes, he has already mastered in his art as "the author of a limpid and powerful prose epic dealing with the life of Frederick the Great; the patient artist who in his boundless diligence had woven a rich tapestry of a novel, *Maya* by name" and so many other successful works (11).

Aschenbach, who is "himself the product of the finest and ennobling aspects of European culture and education", has once become a young man, as well (Astrachan, 1990: 67).

...youth is excited only by the problematic, and Aschenbach was as problematic and unbending as any youth. He had overindulged the intellect, overcultivated erudition and ground up the seed corn, revealed secrets, defamed talent, betrayed art; yes, even as his works entertained, elevated, and animated the gullible reader, he, the youthful artist, held the twenty-year-olds in thrall to his cynical remarks about the questionable nature of art and artistic genius (19).

However, he has never been a typical young boy who needs to overcome various obstacles so that he can find his artistic purpose and voice. He has always been

“mature and ready for life in the world before his time. Barely out of school he had acquired a name for himself.” (12).

However, like most artists, he starts to suffer from writer’s block and believe that a journey can help him to give more efficient and precious works as a writer who puts “form over content” and “mind over body” in the service of Apollonian forces (Hayes and Quinby, 1989: 165). What he “needed a change of scene, a bit of spontaneity, an idle existence, a foreign atmosphere, and an influx of new blood to make the summer bearable and productive” (Mann, 2014:10). Therefore, he travels to Venice which seems like helping him produce at first since he writes an essay, “a page and a half of sublime prose based on Tadzio’s beauty” (86). However, everything starts to change when he is invaded by Dionysian urges. The readers begin to

see Aschenbach who has abided by his discipline, mastered his instincts, and achieved his goals as an artist—a writer well known for his novels where his characters overcome obstacles by owe their existence to a “defiant ascent to dignity” and who writes for those who strive for that same ascent—but is approaching the end of his artistic and physical life with trepidation (Sizemore, 2014: 236).

From that point, instead of showing a hint of progress both psychologically and artistically, Aschenbach experiences a reverse *Bildung* which causes him to act like a child in the pursuit of Tadzio.

Aschenbach, who suffers from the conflict between the ego (rational and conscious self) and the id (the irrational and unconscious side), degenerates himself and loses his dignity. He constantly tries to justify his deeds by establishing philosophical dialogues in his mind with famous philosophers.

After falling in love with the young Tadzio, Aschenbach repeats the Socratic claim that corporeal beauty pulls us out of our attachment to the world and its pleasures and reminds us of the spiritual realm. He uses Tadzio’s body and his beauty as a catalyst for his artistic powers and for him, as for Socrates, his beloved’s beauty is supposed to lead to the spiritual achievement (Sadeghi, 2018:26).

However, Aschenbach confronts with these statement at the end of the novella since Mann shows how the love for beauty can be fatal and disintegrated for an Apollonian artist like Aschenbach.

Aschenbach starts to be drifted away by his excessive emotions and behaviours by giving instant and unreasonable decisions. Instead of gaining experience through his journey, he loses the track of time and finds himself in severe conflicts and dilemmas. He turns into the old man who disgusts him while he is coming to Venice on the boat.

He was old, there was no doubting it: he had wrinkles around his eyes and mouth; the matt crimson of his cheeks was rouge...with signet rings on both forefingers, those of an old man. A shudder ran through Aschenbach as he watched him and his interplay with his friends. Did they not know, could they not see that he was old, that he had no right to be wearing their foppish, gaudy clothes, no right to be carrying on as if he were one of them? (Mann, 2014:29)

He is shocked by old man's fake persona and finds spending time with young people unacceptable in a disguise. However, Aschenbach, who is not still fully seized Dionysian impulses at the time, changes into this very man in the hands of a Venetian barber just to be admired by Tadzio, a fourteen-year-old boy. He is

unable to resist, indeed, full of hope for the outcome, watched his eyebrows arch more distinctly and evenly, his eyes grow longer, their brightness enhanced by a light line beneath the lids, ...saw his lips, anemic only a moment before, swell raspberry-red and the furrows in his cheeks and around his mouth, the wrinkles under his eyes vanish beneath face cream and the glow of youth—he saw, his heart pounding, a young man in his prime (Mann, 2004: 132).

He has the barber polish and dye him like a baby doll and finds it normal to wander around the streets of Venice with a made-up face and newly-dyed hair in order to hide his real age. He even cannot comprehend that his black hair, when it is compared with the old grey one, does not show him younger or more lovable since he turns into a clown with that colourful face.

It is not the only occasion that Aschenbach behaves like a child. Instead of showing progress, his development retreats to a child's. To illustrate, he follows Tadzio and his family through the streets of Venice secretly.

He had to stop when they tarried, duck into food stalls and courtyards when they doubled back; he would lose them, pursue them, hot and exhausted, over bridges and along filthy culs-de-sac, and endure moments of mortal shame when seeing them suddenly come towards him in a narrow passageway from which there was no escape (102).

He is suffering like a “drunk in both head and heart” because of the irrational and passionate love he feels. He does not care about disregarding his dignity and reason. However, maybe the most inappropriate and rascal moments are the time when Aschenbach is not able to leave Tadzio’s door “on the second floor of the hotel and pressed his forehead against the hinge in drunken rapture, unable to tear himself away even at the risk of being discovered and caught” (105). The former Aschenbach, who has been a temperate and rational man throughout his life, loses his power upon the new care-free and reckless one. He even cannot stop his stalking when he realises the family of the boy is keeping Tadzio away from Aschenbach as they are aware of his constant gazes and pursuits even if it is “terrible insult which racked his pride in hitherto unknown torment, yet which his conscience could not gainsay” (111).

To summarise, Aschenbach shows a reverse *Bildung* process with his childish behaviours and decisions in terms of handling the love issue. He starts a book as an Apollonian artist, fights with two forces, and gives up his Dionysian instincts which leads to his degenerated death. Furthermore, even if there is still an artist in the centre of the novella, he has already mastered in his art and gained the reputation which is wished by most of the *Künstlerroman* heroes. The work can still be a proper example for *Bildungsroman* and *Künstlerroman*, if the development process can be accomplished successfully. However, from the moment Aschenbach settles in Venice, the reader is not able to witness a progress in terms of personality and cultivation which reveals the novella as an exemplary *Anti-Bildungsroman*.

4.5.2. The Issue of homosexual love

Homosexuality has always been a matter of debate when it comes to define it, to state the reasons behind this tendency, and to express how to handle it. According to a hypothesis, it is

presented which regards homosexuality neither as an aberration of ‘normal’ human sexuality, i.e. heterosexuality, nor as a ‘defect’, genetically transmitted from parent(s) to offspring. Nor is homosexuality regarded as the regrettable result of accidental circumstances.

Homosexuality, it is maintained, is simply inherent in the human reproductive strategy; an option which evolved during the millions of years of human evolution as a solution for problems inherent in a polygynic, yet social species living in relatively small groups: homosexuality diminishes intra-male competition on the 'reproductive market' (Schuiling, 2004:67).

In addition to this definition, it is also believed that homosexuality does not only depend on one condition to emerge; the environmental and genetic factors also affect a person's sexual orientation. Contrary to common belief, it is not also a psychiatric disease to be cured or a "disturbance of brain development". However, these realities do not change how some people understand homosexuality especially from the religious point. It is a very common assumption that it is a very "immoral behaviour" which used to be severely punished in some circles (68).

Homosexuality, which generally ensues when "certain conditions are met" as mentioned above, sometimes waits until a "perceived image of a member of their own" appears to arouse homosexual impulses in a person as in the case of Aschenbach who has not been aware of his homosexual urges until he sees Tadzio (69). Mann gives place to this homosexual love in his book *Death in Venice*, when it has not been a common subject to handle during his era. The topic is beyond of his time as the period when Mann has written the novella covers Germany under fascism. Homosexuality, "sexual acts between males" is outlawed in Germany in 1871 and "the German Homosexual Rights Movement" suffers from these legislation "under the Weimar Republic". As can be seen, Mann tries to write his novella in such a society in which "misogyny and homophobia" reign (Hayes and Quinby, 1989: 170). He also deliberately chooses a suitable place to portray his unconventional topic more freely as Michael Moon asserts

in the early years of this century Venice had a unique reputation as the stock place for refined upper-class men to 'disintegrate' and give into their suppressed homoerotic longings (consider Mann's *Death in Venice* . . .) [and] . . . male-homosexual tourists commonly made contact with men of Venice's large lower-class population of gondoliers and sailors, some of whom engaged in prostitution (qtd. in Hayes and Quinby, 1989: 170).

However, the topic and the city he has chosen to handle, have become the matter of debate. During the time when Mann has written *Death in Venice*, people are divided into groups in the sense that how they deal with the matter of "homosexuality". Some

of them have ignored it completely, some of them have been offended by this reality, and some others have tried to look at it from a symbolic perspective. No matter how far its scope has widened, it is still accepted as “an evil of society and a taboo issue” (Winkelman, 1995: 10).

Accordingly, it is not surprising that Mann has started to be criticised positively and negatively by various scholars since the subject he has chosen is controversial. The discussions, dealing with Mann’s own sexual orientation, have aroused among the literary circle. Critics are not in the tendency of blaming Mann with homosexuality since they have believed that he does not have to be a homosexual to write about homosexual love. In the meanwhile, “Thomas Mann, like many suspected of deviant sexual inclinations, still strove to uphold his dignified persona by assuming and publicly defending a heterosexual orientation” (11-12). He uses his diaries to mention that the intended topic is actually a fall of a hero rather than the issue of homosexuality in order to preserve his esteemed and respected image.

In *Death in Venice* I wanted to present a man who at the summit of success, honor, fame, and fortune finds no refuge in art but instead runs aground, physically and psychologically, on an insurmountable passion...Only to make the plunge from the summit into the depths appear as fateful as possible did I choose for my hero homosexual love (qtd. in Shookman, 2003: 19).

In spite of these kinds of explanations, it is still thought that Mann has been trying to hide his “degenerate” and “immoral” homosexual tendencies. The reason why Mann has given place to aesthetical discussions in his work is believed to be sprung from his attempt to “minimize or deny the homoeroticism” in *Death in Venice* (Winkelman, 1995: 15). He is believed to hide his real purpose behind aestheticism while contemplating about love and beauty by means of his protagonist Aschenbach.

For beauty, my dear Phaedrus, and beauty alone is at once desirable and visible: it is, mark my words, the only form of the spiritual we can receive through our senses and tolerate thereby. Think what would become of us were the godhead or reason and virtue and truth to appear before our eyes! Should we not perish in the flames of love, as did Semele beholding Zeus? Hence beauty is the path the man of feeling takes to the spiritual, though merely the path, dear young Phaedrus, a means and no more (Mann, 2004: 84).

Aschenbach tries to justify his volatile love and immoral tendency towards the young Tadzio by debating with Phaedrus under the coverage of beauty and aestheticism. One of the major themes of the *Bildungsroman*, “ordeal by love” is subverted into a homosexual love affair which is not a familiar subject even for a modernist work. The discussion on art and aestheticism, which is generally used when falling love with a person from the opposite sex as in the case of Joyce’s hero Stephen, is applied to Aschenbach’s unconventional and “degenerate” love affair by Mann. In this point, it can even be said that *Death in Venice* may also show *Anti-Künstlerroman* characteristics since his artist protagonist does not show any artistic growth and abuse his artistic skill in favour of praising his unacceptable love which is not approvable not only because it is towards the same sex but also towards a much younger individual. However, with the use of “irony on various levels”, Mann manipulates his reader to be able to write a story of “forbidden love”. His death is also seen ironic since his

"narratological" death may be the ultimate penalty for transgressing the boundaries of bourgeois, Wilhelmine society; Aschenbach may have succumbed to the absolute taboo, but he nonetheless dies a beautiful death, a *Liebestod*, rather than an ugly, bitter, pathological death. He may have lost the Apollonian but, upon following Tadzio's final gesture, he still achieves the ultimate wish-fulfilment in his Dionysian union with the beloved object (Winkelman, 1995: 93-94).

That is to say, Mann, in a way, secures his place in society by letting his main character die due to his disagreeable tendencies even though he does not punish him with a painful or disturbing death. Interestingly though, cholera, the disease that Aschenbach dies of, is associated with “anal eroticism that psychoanalysis has discovered in the history of homosexuality” by Hanns Sachs and even the death of the protagonist is found disturbing by some circles (Shookman, 2003: 32).

Over and above, Mann’s handling the matter of homosexuality is associated with Foucault’s acknowledgment on the relationship between “prohibition” and “stimulation” by Winkelman. Foucault states that prohibiting a certain act causes stimulation as in the event of homosexuality. He puts forward that “...the ‘putting into discourse of sex’, far from undergoing a process of restriction, on the contrary has been subjected to a mechanism of increasing incitement” (qtd. in Winkelman, 1995: 15). Therefore, in *Death in Venice*, even if Aschenbach tries to hide his real feelings, he channels his desires for Tadzio into the discourse on aestheticism. In

other words, the “sublimation and codification of homosexual desire in *Death in Venice* is not just a masking of the taboo; it likewise serves as an affirmation of the desire” (16). Mann, indeed, creates a thrilling and exciting sexual atmosphere by blurring the homosexual focus in the book with his pervert representation of wrong-headed artist.

Aschenbach, who gives a fight between Apollonian and Dionysian forces, turns into an embodiment of binary oppositions in the book. Mann’s pioneer novella foreshadows the post-modernist and post-colonial topics in a way by giving a voice to “the Other” under the roof of *Bildungsroman*. The polarities of “masculine-feminine”, “homosexual-heterosexual”, “Apollonian-Dionysian” and “rational-restraint” have become the major concerns which is a subversion from a traditional and even modernist *Bildungsroman* tradition that used to deal with love between opposite sexes. While typical *Bildungsroman* hero is rejected by a woman or a man from counter sex, Aschenbach gives a battle against his desires and unacceptable love towards a younger boy from his own sex. This unusual subject turns the book into an example of *Anti-Bildungsroman* with its dealing with forbidden love, yet it is not the same forbidden love as in the case of Stephen Dedalus who has experienced a sexual intercourse with a woman by contradicting with main religious belief. Stephen is committing a religious sin which is a common theme of the most *Bildungsromane*, Aschenbach gets beyond the conventional limits and represents a new theme of homosexuality which is not known how to deal with in the society he lives in.

Due to his uncontrollable passion for Tadzio, Aschenbach shows a “degradation of his personality” who used to have Apollonian characteristics such as rationality, order, discipline, and temperance. He makes a fool out of himself by stalking Tadzio around the streets and letting the barber apply make-up on his face like the old man with whom he has encountered on the boat. He sacrifices “his fastidiousness, a more worthless goal than the most perverse of sexual contacts” (Braverman and Nachmann, 1970: 296). He tries to beautify himself more as any normal lover who will do the same things to attract his beloved one.

Like any lover, he wished to please and dreaded the thought that it might be impossible. He added cheery, youthful touches to his wardrobe, wore jewels, and used scent; he spent long hours several times a day at his toilet, coming to table bedizened, excited, and tense. Gazing at the sweet youth who had won his heart he was sickened by his aging body: the

sight of his gray hair, his pinched features filled him with shame and despair (Mann, 2004: 130).

In an overwhelming state, he lets the barber turn him into a clown-like figure with its dyed hair and face. He cannot suppress his sexual desires and longing for Tadzio's love anymore and is controlled by his libido and driven by his inner instincts.

The "godlike countenance or perfect body" of Tadzio makes him unable to leave Venice which is surrounded by the disease of cholera. Leaving Tadzio behind already means death to Aschenbach. That's why he also makes sure that the Polish family does not learn about the epidemic. Even if almost all the foreign tourists have started to leave the city, he continues his routine of watching Tadzio along the streets and especially on the beach every day. The old half-rational and crafty Aschenbach who tries to justify his attraction towards Tadzio in his imaginary dialogue with Phaedrus by saying "the lover is more divine than the beloved, because the god dwells in the former, not the latter, which is perhaps the most delicate, most derisive thought ever thought by man and the source of all the roguery and deep-seated lust in longing", is enslaved by his passionate desires especially after confessing his affection with the words "I love you!" at the end of chapter four (84).

Aschenbach, who degrades himself by stalking Tadzio and even listening to him in front of his hotel door, starts to believe that when the matter is love, it is normal to show signs of cowardice such as "genuflections, oaths, importunate supplications, and servile behaviour" (106). The most important thing for Aschenbach has been Tadzio's not leaving and staying in Venice without knowing the fact about cholera.

Thus Tadzio stayed on, and Aschenbach, in his beleaguered state, occasionally had the feeling that flight and death might eliminate all life standing in his way and leave him alone on this island with the beautiful boy; indeed, when he sat in the morning by the sea, his gaze—heavy, injudicious, and fixed—resting on the object of his desire, or when, as evening fell, he resumed his undignified pursuit through the narrow streets clandestinely haunted by loathsome dying, things monstrous seemed auspicious and the moral code null and void (129-130).

In other words, under the spell of Tadzio's love, Aschenbach is unable to act reasonably and ignores the fact of disease that is spreading among the streets. The only act which he is willing to perform is stalking and watching the young boy.

Finally, Aschenbach, who gets exhausted after his pursuit of Tadzio with his newly made-up face and hair, buys some strawberries from a local shop even if everyone has been warned in order not to purchase any food since they can be contaminated. He dies because of these strawberries and his carelessness which is sprung from his uncontrollable affection towards Tadzio. This unusual theme makes the novella an example of *Anti-Bildungsroman* since the matter of homosexuality is ahead of Mann's time to deal with. The theme of "love" is a common motif in almost all *Bildungsromane*, yet it is maybe the first time the readers of the genre come across with a love towards opposite sex and also love towards a much younger boy. To summarize, Mann, intentionally or unintentionally, creates a hero with homosexual tendencies in a very strict regime and this common theme for post-modernist or post-colonial works turn *Death in Venice* into an *Anti-Bildungsroman* with his character's deviating love affair.

4.5.3. The unconventional ending

One of the best-known characteristics of the *Bildungsroman* is associated with its ending.

As a genre devoted to the depiction of individual maturation, the *Bildungsroman* would seem at first glance to have an almost unlimited range: everyone grows up and learns to fit more or less successfully into a given society (Graham, 2019: 11).

The grown-up heroes of the *Bildungsromane* reconcile with the society that they live in after experiencing some misfortunes and being tested by several hardships. The books end up with a kind of "compromise" in favour of the community and society. The most preferred way of compromise is marriage in traditional *Bildungsroman* as it is more or less a social contract (Moretti, 1987:22). In addition to this, the hero can get a vocation which suits the demands of the society best. In all these situations, instead of keeping himself from the community, he finds some solutions to be a part of the given society.

As "the novel's most celebrated theme, "compromising" with the society aims at the hero's happiness by giving it a great value (7). The hero, who "has actually been predestined to succeed", completes his apprenticeship and becomes the master of his destiny. Accordingly, Eckermann states that "the whole work seems to

say nothing more than that man, despite all his follies and errors, being led by a higher hand, reaches some happy goal at last” (qtd. in Buckley, 1974: 12). The young hero, who leaves his home and family for the sake of freedom and development, comes to terms with social forces and institutions in the end. He turns into be a happy and compatible person after his search for identity ends.

However, with the arrival of Modernism, the scope of *Bildungsroman* has changed. The problematic endings have started to be preferred by the modernist authors such as alienation or exile. In this respect, Moretti claims that the most used theme of marriage gives its place to alienation in late *Bildungsroman*. The hero does not achieve happiness easily since there is a certain conflict between what the hero wishes for and what society demands. Instead of being a part of the given society, he tries to ease his complex and disturbed inner world (93-97). This new protagonist may choose to exile himself from his family, friends, and country as in the case of Joyce’s Stephen. Nevertheless, it is another way of compromising with society since the hero prefers to complete his *Bildung* in another place where he can express himself more freely.

This well-known characteristic of “compromise” takes a different path in *Death in Venice*. Instead of finding a way of reconciling, Mann kills his hero at the end of the book. His hero, Aschenbach fails in terms of development and cannot comprehend the meaning of his life. He does not return from his trip as a more productive writer or alienate himself from the society and go on his life. Instead, Mann gives an end to his protagonist’s life which is not a conventional ending for traditional or modern *Bildungsromane*. Aschenbach dies because of his inability to create a balance between his Apollonian past and Dionysian impulses. His consuming passion turns him into “a grotesque parody of youth” which is very unusual for the *Bildungsroman* hero that gains respect and tolerance as a self-actualised individual through the end (qtd. in Mann, 2004: ix).

Mann fills his novella with several foreshadowing elements to foretell Aschenbach’s demise. He chooses Venice as the setting which is both a place of beauty and decadence. Like the hero himself, Venice is also destroyed by the epidemic. Moreover, the stranger, who is the reason why Aschenbach wishes to travel in the first place, is believed to lead to his death in the form of Hermes (Sadeghi, 2018:27). Along with the stranger, strawberries which symbolise passion

can also be seen as a foreshadowing element. However, one of the most apparent symbol of death is the gondola image.

That strange conveyance, coming down to us unaltered from the days of the ballads and so distinctively black, black as only coffins can be—it conjures up hush-hush criminal adventures in the rippling night and, even more, death itself: the bier, the obscure obsequies, the final, silent journey (Mann, 2004: 36).

As Aschenbach states that the gondola itself turns into an image of black coffin as a final vehicle which will lead him to his demise. Finally, Tadzio emerges as a messenger like Hermes who calls Aschenbach to the underworld on the beach (Sadeghi, 2018:30). He closes his eyes as an exhausted warrior who is defeated during the combat between his inner desires and outer restraints.

But to him it seemed as if the pale and charming psychagogue out there were smiling at him, beckoning to him, as if, releasing his hand from his hip, he were pointing outward, floating onward into the promising immensity of it all. And, as so often, he set out to follow him (Mann, 2004: 142).

Aschenbach, who is disillusioned by Tadzio's glimpse, follows him to death in a state of Dionysian frenzy. His "lifelong denial and repression of his own instinctual bases, once triggered by homo-erotic impulses" are released and become the reasons of his destruction like a real tragedy (Astrachan, 1990: 73). In a way, Aschenbach is sacrificed for the sake of Dionysus to complete the worshipping ritual. Mann's choosing this unusual ending becomes the very reason why the novella can be read as an example of *Anti-Bildungsroman* since there is no compromising with the society. Mann neither lets his hero alienate himself from the society nor reconcile with the world around. This problematic ending cannot even be found in a modernist *Bildungsroman* as Mann deals with the post-modernist and post-colonial topics. To conclude, *Death in Venice* contributes to this flourishing genre by converting its main themes and characteristics.

CONCLUSION

The *Bildungsroman*, which is difficult to describe, has always been a popular but untranslatable word. Deriving from the early German words *Bild* and *Bildung*, its meaning has changed from its religious connotation into a more secular one. With the arrival of Enlightenment and the impact of Martin Luther on religion, the old definition of “moulding oneself into God’s image” has gained another meaning of “the concept of self-formation, education, or cultivation (Gadamer, 2004:8). The new man aims at cultivating and improving himself by focusing more on power of the mind instead of just attaining God’s mercy in afterlife.

During the late eighteenth century, this undefinable term has started to be used for a new genre in which it is possible to witness the development of a young protagonist who searches for identity and meaning of life while being tested by some misfortunate circumstances in terms of his family life, vocation, love affairs, alienation, and so on. The hero of this new literary type, the *Bildungsroman*, is the combination of Romantic, Byronic and picaresque protagonists. He tries to start a journey to complete his apprenticeship and become a master of his own life both in a metaphorical and sometimes literal sense. Thanks to this characteristic, the novel is sometimes called as the “novel of apprenticeship” through which the hero completes his circle of life and achieves cultivation of mind just like a master (Howe, 1930:4). However, this process only becomes possible after contradicting with the community he lives in. He comes to terms with the given society by means of marriage or getting a proper job so as not to be a misfit. In a way, he achieves happiness after gaining experience and learning his lessons.

However, this traditional definition and characteristics of the genre has changed with the arrival of modernism, post-modernism and post-colonial periods as a flourishing genre (Redfield, 1996: 42). The focus starts to be on subjectivity rather than objectivity. The experiences and psychology of the hero gain importance since he now lives in a shattered and meaningless world that has been affected by the World Wars very negatively. Therefore, the major concern of the modern writers has become projecting the “inward stated of consciousness” (Bradbury 1976: 393). James Joyce, Virginia Woolf, and Thomas Mann are among these authors who are interested in portraying their protagonists’ inner world rather than dealing with

detailed description of the outer space. James Joyce, particularly, has contributed a lot to the modern literary world with his use of stream-of-consciousness technique which makes it possible to see the flow of thoughts in the protagonist's mind without a specific timeline, in other words, without a chronological order (Saha, 2016: 22). Moreover, the use of inner dialogues and free-speech have influenced most of the modern writers of the time. As for post-modernism and post-colonialism, these movements make it possible for writers to handle unconventional themes and ostracised people around the world. The controversial subjects such as religion, sex, and politics have begun to be the major topics of the literary works of the period while dealing with the problems of "the Other" like homosexuals, colonised, or black people (Rayment, 2017: 14). Thanks to this new tendency, readers from these groups have found a chance to hear their own voices in literary circles.

Under the influence of these transformation in literary world, the traditional *Bildungsroman* has to change its scope and characteristics. It has started to be divided into sub-categories such as *Entwicklungsroman*, *Erziehungsroman*, *Künstlerroman*, and *Anti-Bildungsroman*. Another reason why these sub-genres have occurred actually is not being able to be given an exact definition to the genre. While *Entwicklungsroman* is accepted as a novel which shows development of the hero especially in a physical way, *Erziehungsroman* is defined as the novel of education with its focus on schooling of the protagonist. As for *Künstlerroman*, it has shown the artistic development of the sensitive artist and it is one of the literary sub-genres which has given a special heading in this dissertation since the analysed works, *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and *Death in Venice* are exemplary works of this sub-category. While Stephen Dedalus, the protagonist of *A Portrait* has exiled himself from the restricted society to be able to express his artistic sensitivity freely, Gustav von Aschenbach from *Death in Venice* has already been a well-known artist with his distinguishing talents and has been looking for an inspiration to get rid of his writer's block. The other sub-genre, which has been analysed within these literary types, is *Anti-Bildungsroman* since Thomas Mann's untraditional novella *Death in Venice* has included some characteristics of this type with its reverse-developed homosexual protagonist and unexpected ending.

In the light of these periodical changes, with which traditional *Bildungsroman* has taken a different path, James Joyce has written one of his outstanding novels, *A*

Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man in 1916. Deriving from his old book, *Stephen Hero*, the work tells the story of a young artist-to-be, Stephen Dedalus who chooses self-imposed exile to complete his artistic growth in a stronger and freer world. The period, when Joyce writes his book, is a complicated time with the political and religious turmoil. His protagonist, Stephen, is also affected by these desperate circumstances especially because of the conflict between Irish nationalist and the Catholic Church. As a special, talented, and different child, Stephen's artistic development is portrayed from his childhood to maturity as in the traditional *Bildungsroman*. Joyce makes it possible for the reader to comprehend the world as Stephen does thanks to his modernist techniques and styles. The experiences which he gets, the problems which he deals with are expressed as Stephen apprehends them and by this way, the reader understands the reasons why Stephen has to leave all of his friends, family, and the country behind to complete his improvement.

As in the case of any *Bildungsroman*, Stephen is also tested by misfortunate events from the beginning. His family turns into a hindrance in front of his desires and future goals as an artist. The carelessness of his father with his alcohol problem and strict Irish nationalism alienate Stephen from him and his mother's devout Christianity and religious doctrines keep Stephen away from her and the religion she believes in. Furthermore, unlike traditional *Bildungsroman*, topics such as politics and religion become the centre of Joyce's novel with his modernist techniques and concerns. Stephen, who is raised as a Christian, starts to question his religion after having a sexual intercourse with a prostitute and witnessing wrong-doings of the priests. Due to his tremendous sufferings as a sinner, he contemplates about being a priest instead of an artist despite his artistic gift. However, when he experiences a moment of epiphany, which is a common characteristic of *Bildungsroman* tradition, Stephen gets that it is not possible for him to continue his life as a member of Catholic Church. He, instead, decides to start a university to have an artistic education and improve himself.

The new and decisive Stephen expresses his concern about aestheticism and art while talking to his friends. However, nothing satisfies him in the circle he lives in. He does not find his friend's opinions reasonable and Ireland seems like a monster which devours his own children when someone has to save it from its engagement with England. He even does not want to speak his national language of

Ireland since he believes that his own ancestors have given up on their language to take the language of the repressive England. Under these circumstances, Stephen moves away from his careless family, shallow friends, strict religion, and useless nation. He finds exile as the only solution to his problem and leave his country to find a better and an open-minded place for his artistic growth. The theme of exile turns the novel into a modern *Bildungsroman* with its distance from traditional ending of getting married or finding a proper vocation for himself in the given society. Joyce, like he himself has done, exiles his hero from the restricted society while making sure that the reader perceives the world as Stephen does.

As for Thomas Mann's *Death in Venice*, the period when the book is written is also worth mentioning since Mann is influenced by the circumstances while creating his protagonist, Gustav von Aschenbach. Under the Nazi Germany, the writers' imagination and creativity are restricted and the subjects which they can mention in their books are limited. This has also been valid for Mann who has left his country, Germany because of the attitude it maintains during World War I. He leaves his country because of the "undemocratic structure of Wilhelmian society" (Stevens, 2010:36). He feels a dreadful sadness and terror for the sake of German society since both the ideas of its winning and losing the war horrify him. He believes Germany would be damaged equally whatever the result will be. Even though he loves his country dearly, he is aware of the hostile and antagonistic atmosphere which hinders his development as an artist. However, in a country, which shows prejudice against different groups such as Jews or homosexuals, he manages to create a gay protagonist who experiences a conflict between his rational and passionate side.

Aschenbach, who appears in the novella at the age of fifty, is already a well-known writer with his marvellous literary works. However, this respected and lovable artist goes through a transformation after encountering with a stranger in front of cemetery and in contrast to his disciplined and dignified personality, fills with desire to travel. Mann, who has been influenced by Nietzsche's famous dichotomy, bases his character on the discrepancy between Apollonian (logic and order) and Dionysian (passion and desire) forces. The difference between these two forces have been explained by Nietzsche as

with the duality of the *Apolline* and the *Dionysiac* in much the same way as reproduction depends on there being two sexes which co-exist in a

state of perpetual conflict interrupted only occasionally by periods of reconciliation (Nietzsche, 1999:14).

According to him, these two opposite poles, which are the necessities of the birth of highest art form, tragedy, should conflict with each other to create a powerful piece of art. By being influenced by this great philosopher, Mann portrays his protagonist as a person who is reasonable and restrained person, yet he turns into a care-free and passionate figure after falling in love with a fourteen-year-old Polish boy, Tadzio in Venice. The more he watches Tadzio, the more he loses himself. He follows him around the streets and refuses to leave the town even if the disease of cholera has started to spread all over the place. Both the reader and Aschenbach himself are shocked because of this sudden tendency towards Dionysus. The old Apollonian, self-disciplined, and restrained artist starts to lose his dignity and like the satyrs in a Dionysian orgy gets delirious with passion and joy. In the end, he dies because of this disease and Dionysian extremism while watching Tadzio on the beach.

While the protagonist's lust for journey and the moments of epiphanies can make the novella an example of traditional *Bildungsroman*, it would be more appropriate to read the book as an *Anti-Bildungsroman*. Although the genre does not have to tell the story of a person from his childhood to maturity, it has to show a development in the character. In the case of Aschenbach, instead of getting rid of his writer's block and developing himself as an artist or an individual, he experiences a kind of reverse *Bildung* or development under the impact of Dionysian urges. Despite his old age, he stalks the boy around everywhere, listens to his room secretly, confesses his love, refuses to leave the sickly city, and applies make-up to look younger like an irrational child. Furthermore, the matter of homosexuality is not a common theme for both traditional and modernist *Bildungsromane*. Even though the book has written in modernist period, it reveals the characteristics of the post-modern or post-colonial literary novels with its unconventional themes. Mann, whose homosexual orientation has also been debated, chooses a unique topic for the major concern of his book and differentiates it from the conventional *Bildungsroman* tradition. The ending of the book has also made it an exemplary work of *Anti-Bildungsroman* since it is not common for traditional and modern *Bildungsromane* to end with the death of the protagonist. The hero compromises with the society and tries to fit in with a hope of better future or alienates himself from the given society

again for a better future. However, the ending which Mann chooses for his hero does not show any optimistic assumptions for the future and it turns the novella into an *Anti-Bildungsroman*.

In conclusion, the *Bildungsroman* tradition which is open to any kind of transformation and improvement will “become an even more significant literary form in the future than it has been in the past” with its flourishing characteristic (Gohlman, 1990: 9). Its dealing with real human beings and complex individuals makes it favourable since the individuality and subjectivity are the most preferred themes of the literary world in such a meaningless and complicated world. The more people will search for ways to ease their loneliness and alienation, the more *Bildungsromane* will be produced. With its focusing on self-development, self-actualisation, and cultivation, the *Bildungsroman* will always find its place in the hearts of keen readers.

WORKS CITED

I. Books

- Abrams, M.H. (1988). *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Alter, R. (1965). *Rogue's Progress: Studies in the Picaresque Novel*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Anderson, C. G. (1986). *James Joyce*. London: Thames and Hudson.
- Argyle, G. (2002). *Germany as Model and Monster: Allusions in English Fiction, 1830s-1930s*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Baldick, C. (1991). *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bakhtin, M. (2010). *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Beebe, M. (1964). *Ivory Towers and Sacred Founts: from Goethe to Joyce*. New York: New York University Press.
- Beja, M. (1992). *James Joyce: A Literary Life*. Columbus: Ohio State University Press.
- Belanger, J. (1916). "Introduction". *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. By James Joyce. Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Classics.
- Belge, M. (2015). "Sonsoz". *Sanatcının Bir Genç Adam Olarak Portesi*. Istanbul: İletişim Yayıncılık.
- Bishop, P. (2004). *The Intellectual World of Thomas Mann, in The Cambridge Companion to Thomas Mann*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bloom, H. (1970). *Romanticism and Consciousness*. New York: Yale University Press.
- Boes, T. (2012). *Formative Fictions: Nationalism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Bildungsroman*. New York: Cornell University Press and Cornell University Library.
- Bolaki, S. (2011). *Unsettling the Bildungsroman: Reading Contemporary Ethnic American Women's Fiction*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Bradbury, M. (1976). *Modernism*. New York: Penguin Books.

- Buckley, J.H. (1947). *Season of Youth: The Bildungsroman from Dickens to Golding*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Castle, G. (2006). *Reading the Modernist Bildungsroman*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.
- Childs, P., Williams, R. J. P. (1997). *An Introduction to Post-Colonial Theory*. New York: Prentice Hall
- Cuddon, J.A. (1999). *The Penguin Dictionary of Literary Terms and Literary Theory*. London: Penguin Books.
- Demirtaş, O. (2015). *The Bildung of Bildungsroman: Joyce, Winterson & Kincaid*. MA Thesis, Dogus University, Translation Studies, Istanbul.
- Edel, L. (1955). *The Modern Psychological Novel*. New York: Grove Press.
- Ellmann, R. (1959). *James Joyce*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fargnoli, A., Patrick, M. (2006). *Critical Companion to James Joyce: A Literary Reference to His Life and Work*. New York: Facts on File.
- Foucault, M. (1972). *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. New York: Routledge.
- Fulford, A., Hodgson, N. (2016). *Philosophy and Theory in Educational Research: Writing in the margin*. New York: Routledge.
- Gadamer, H.G. (2004). *Truth and Method*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Gillie, C. (1975). *Movements in English Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Given, L. M. (2008). *The Sage Encyclopaedia of Qualitative Research Method*. Los Angeles, Calif: Sage Publications.
- Goethe, J.W. (1899). *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Travels*. Translated by Thomas Carlyle. London: Chapman and Hall.
- Gohlman, S.A. (1990). *Starting Over: The Task of the Protagonist in The Contemporary Bildungsroman*. New York & London: Garland Publishing.
- Golban, P. (2003). *The Victorian Bildungsroman*. Kütahya: Dumlupınar University Press.
- (2018). *A History of the Bildungsroman: From Ancient Beginnings to Romanticism*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Graham, S. (2019). *A History of the Bildungsroman*. Cambridge: Cambridge

- University Press.
- Hardin, J.M. (1991). *Reflection and Action: Essays On the Bildungsroman*.
Columbia, South Carolina: University of South Carolina Press.
- Holman, C. H. (1992). *A Handbook to Literature*. New York: Macmillan
- Howe, S. (1930). *Wilhelm Meister and His English Kinsmen: Apprentices to Life*.
New York: Columbia University Press.
- James, W. (2007). *The Principles of Psychology Volume I*. New York: Cosimo
Classics.
- Johnson, J. (2008). "Introduction". *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. Oxford:
Oxford University Press.
- Joyce, J. (2004). *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man and Dubliners*. New York:
Barnes & Noble Classics.
- Joyce, S. (1971). *The Complete Dublin Diary*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Jeffers, T. L. (2005). *Apprenticeships: The Bildungsroman from Goethe to
Santayana*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kern, S. (2011). *The Modernist Novel: A Critical Introduction*. Cambridge:
Cambridge University Press.
- Kociatkewicz, J. (2018). *Towards The Anti-Bildungsroman*. Berlin: Peter Lang
GmbH, Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften.
- Levin, H. (1941). *James Joyce: A Critical Introduction*. New York: New Directions
Publishing.
- Lewis, P. (2000). *Modernism, Nationalism, and the Novel*. Cambridge: Cambridge
University Press.
- Lutwack, L. (1984). *The Role of Place in Literature*. New York: Syracuse University
Press.
- Mann, T. (2014). *Death in Venice*. London: HarperCollins Publisher.
--- (1960). *A Sketch of My Life*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Marigny, J. (2013). *Vampires: Restless Creatures of the Night*. New York: Abrams
- Martin, W. (1986). *Recent Theories of Narrative*. Ithaca and London: Cornell
University Press.
- Matz, J. (2004). *The Modern Novel: A Short Introduction*. Malden: Blackwell
Publishing
- Miller, K. A. (1985). *Emigrants and Exiles: Ireland and the Irish Exodus to North*

- America*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Miller, M.A. (2006). *Masterpieces of British Modernism*. London: Greenwood Press.
- Mitchell, B. (1976). "A Portrait and the Bildungsroman Tradition". *Approaches to Joyce's Portrait: Ten Essays*. London: University of Pittsburgh Press.
- Moretti, F. (1987). *The Way of the World: The Bildungsroman in European Culture*. Thetford, Norfolk: Thetford Press.
- Mundt, H. (2004). *Understanding Thomas Mann*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.
- Necatigil, B. (2006). "Onsoz". *Venedik'te Olum*. By Thomas Mann. Istanbul: Can Yayınları.
- Nicholls, P. (1995). *Modernisms: A Literary Guide*. Hampshire and London: Macmillan.
- Nietzsche, F. (1999). *The Birth of Tragedy and Other Writings*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Norburn, R. A. (2004). *James Joyce Chronology*, ed. Norman Page. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Onega, S. (1996). *Narratology: An Introduction*. London and New York: Longman.
- Redfield, M. (1996). *Phantom Formations: Aesthetic Ideology and the Bildungsroman*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.
- Ritter, N. (1992). "Death in Venice and the Tradition of European Decadence." *Approaches to Teaching Mann's Death in Venice and Other Short Fiction*. New York: Modern Language Association of America.
- Saunders, M. (2010). *Self-Impression: Life-Writing, Autobiografiction, and the Forms of Modern Literature*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Searle, L. (2015). "New Criticism". *The Johns Hopkins Guide to Literary Theory & Criticism*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.
- Seret, R. (1992). *Voyage into Creativity: The Modern Künstlerroman*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing.
- Shookman, E. (2003). *Thomas Mann's Death in Venice: A Novella and Its Critics*. New York: Camden House.
- (2004). *Thomas Mann's Death in Venice: A Reference Guide*. London: Greenwood Press.

- Siljander, P., Kivela, A., Sutinen, A. (2012). *Theories of Bildung and Growth Connections and Controversies Between Continental Educational Thinking and American Pragmatism*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- Silverman, H.J. (1989). *Derrida and Deconstruction*. New York: Routledge.
- Spencer, T. (1963). "Introduction". *Stephen Hero*. By James Joyce. New York: New Directions.
- Spinks, L. (2009). *James Joyce: A Critical Guide*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Srinivasan, S. (2019). *Liberal Education and Its Discontents: The Crisis in the Indian University*. Abington, Oxon: Routledge.
- Stackelberg, R. (1992). "Teaching Mann's Short Fiction: A Historian's Perspective." *Approaches to Teaching Mann's Death in Venice and Other Short Fiction*. New York: Modern Language Association of America.
- Summerfield, G., Downward L. (2010). *New Perspectives on the European Bildungsroman*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Swales, M. (1978). *The German Bildungsroman from Wieland to Hesse*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Wordsworth, W. (1967). "The Prelude". *Lyrical Ballads*. Ed. Brett and Jones. London: Routledge.
- Zimbaro, V.P. (1992). *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man Notes*. Lincoln, Nebraska: Cliff Notes.
- Ziolkowski, T. (2004). *Hesitant Heroes: Private Inhibition, Cultural Crisis*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

2.Articles

- Astrachan, G. (1990). Dionysus in Thomas Mann's Novella, 'Death in Venice'. *Journal of Analytical Psychology* 35(1): 59-78. Doi: 10.1111/j.1465-5922.1990.00059. x

- Aver, D. (2015). *The English Bildungsroman in The Age of Modernism*: Virginia

Woolf's *Jacob's Room* and The Psychological Insight into Character Formation. MA Thesis, Namık Kemal University, English Language and Literature, Tekirdağ.

---(2015). Golban, P., Aver, D. A Modernist Insight into Character Formation: The Bildungsroman and Its Thematic Perspectives in *Jacob's Room*. Retrieved February 20, 2019, From

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/303523401_A_Modernist_Insight_into_Character_Formation_The_Bildungsroman_and_Its_Thematic_Perspectives_in_Jacob's_Room

Belizario, F. (2016). "For A Post-Colonial Queer Theory: Coloniality of Gender and Heteronormativity Occupying the Borders of Translation". *Gender, Human Rights and Activisms - Proceedings of the 5th International Congress in Cultural Studies, Edition: 1*. Coimbra: Gracio Editor.

Boes, T. (2004). Aschenbach Crosses the Waters: Reading *Death in Venice* in America. *Modernism/modernity* 21(2): 429-445. Doi: 0.1353/mod.2014.0039.

---(2006). Modernist Studies and the *Bildungsroman*: A Historical Survey of Critical Trends. *Literature Compass* 3(2): 230-243. Doi: 10.1111/j.1741-4113.2006.00303.x

--- (2008). A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man' and the 'Individuating Rhythm' of Modernity. *The Johns Hopkins University Press* 21(2): 429-445. Doi: 10.1353/mod.2014.0039

---(2008). Apprenticeship of the Novel: The *Bildungsroman* and the Invention of History, ca. 1770-1820. *Comparative Literature Studies* 45(3):2 69-288. Doi: 10.1353/cls.0.0047

Braverman, A., Nachman, L.D. (1970). The Dialectic of Decadence: An Analysis of Thomas Mann's *Death in Venice*. *The Germanic Review: Literature, Culture, Theory* 45 (4): 289-298. Doi: 10.1080/19306962.1970.11754858

Bubíková, S. (2011). The Literary *Image of Man in the Process of Becoming*: Variations of the Bildungsroman Genre in English and American Literature. *American and British Studies Annual* 4: 9-23. Retrived February 20, 2019, From

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/323018867_The_Literary_Image_o

[f Man in the Process of Becoming Variations of the Bildungsroman Genre in English and American Literature](#)

- Cañadas, I. (2006). A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man: James Joyce, the Myth of Icarus, and the Influence of Christopher Marlowe. *Estudios Irlandeses 1* (1): 16-22. Doi: 10.24162/EI2006-1247
- Castle, G. (2003). Coming of Age in the Age of Empire: Joyce's Modernist Bildungsroman. *James Joyce Quarterly 40* (4): 665-690. Doi: 10.1353/jjq.2012.0090
- Conor, S. (2015). *Bildungsroman*, Print Culture, And The Multiple Versions of A *Portrait of The Artist As A Young Man*: "In The Smithy Of My Soul". BA Thesis, University Delaware, English with Distinction, Delaware.
- Dumont, L. (1986). Are Cultures Living Beings? German Identity in Interaction. *Man 21*(4): 587-604. Doi: 10.2307/2802899
- Dyson, A.E. (1971). The Stranger God: 'Death in Venice'. *Critical Quarterly 13*(1). 5-19. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8705.1971.tb00639.x>
- Egri, P. (1968). The Function of Dreams and Visions in "A Portrait" and "Death in Venice". *James Joyce Quarterly 5*(2): 86-102. Retrieved March 15, 2019, From https://www.jstor.org/stable/25486678?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents
- Elaati, A.A.N. (2016). Postmodernism Theory. Doi: 10.13140/RG.2.1.4515.0327
- Engholt, I.B. (2010). Tales of Truth and Imagination Generic ambiguity in James Joyce's *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and Virginia Woolf's *Orlando*. MA Thesis, University of Oslo, The Department of Literature, Area Studies, and European Languages, Oslo.
- Ergin, S.C. (2005). English Bildungsroman in the 1st Half of the 20th Century. MA Thesis, Dumlupınar University, Division of Western Languages and Literature, Kutahya.
- Ever, S. (2013). The Modernist *Bildungsroman*: End of Forms Most Beautiful. PhD Thesis, Duke University, Graduate Program in Literature, Durham.
- (2017). An Apprenticeship in Immaturity: Witold Gombrowicz's *Ferdynand* as an *Anti-Bildungsroman*. *SEFAD 38*: 393- 406. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21497/sefad.377435>

- Faridpour, A., Quliaeinia, H. (2012). The Ordering Process of Narrative in James Joyce's *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. *The Journal of Teaching Language Skills (JTLS)* 4(2): 120-132. Retrieved March 15, 2019, From http://jtls.shirazu.ac.ir/article_500_a6d1ea5210b1d4c4acf19674c1585bf0.pdf
- Giobbi, G. (1989). Gabriele D'Annunzio and Thomas Mann: *Venice, Art and Death*. *Journal of European Studies* 19(1):55-68. Doi: 10.1177/004724418901900103
- Golban, P. (2017). An Attempt to Establish a Bildungsroman Development History: Nurturing The Rise of a Subgenre from Ancient Beginnings to Romanticism. *Humanitas* 5(10): 111-141. Doi: 10.20304/humanitas.340639
- Greenberg, C. (1980). Modern and Postmodern. *Arts Magazine* 54(6). Retrieved March 20,2019, From <http://www.sharecom.ca/greenberg/postmodernism.html>
- Hayes, T., Quinby, L. (1989). The Aporia of Bourgeois Art: Desire in Thomas Mann's "Death in Venice". *Criticism* 31(2): 159-177. Retrieved March 15, 2019, From https://www.jstor.org/stable/23113351?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents
- Hirsch, M. (1979), The Novel of Formation as Genre: Between Great Expectations and Lost Illusions in *Studies in the Novel*. *Genre Norman NY* 12 (3), 293-311. Retrieved February 23, 2019, From <https://mmu.rl.talis.com/items/80A39792-6381-5746-EE5F-6AAFC86EE2BF.html>
- Knafo, D. (2009). Freud's Memory Erased. *Psychoanalytic Psychology* 26(2): 171-190. Doi: 10.1037/a0015557
- Koopman, H. (1982). German Culture is where I am: Thomas Mann in Exile. *Studies in 20th Century Literature* 7(1): 5-20. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.4148/2334-4415.1111>
- Korichi, A. (2018). The Journey from Alienation towards Self- Realization in James Joyce's Bildungsroman: *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. MA Thesis, Kasdi Merbah University, Faculty of Letters and Languages, Ouargla.
- Mann, T. (1946). A Message from Thomas Mann. *The English Journal* 35(6): 287-288. Doi: 10.2307/807758

- McGinn, B. (2016). The Changing Shape of Late Medieval Mysticism. *Church History* 65(2): 197-219. Doi: 10.2307/3170288
- Neimnah, S. (2013). The Anti-Hero in Modernist Fiction: From Irony to Cultural Renewal. *Mosaic* 46(4): 75-90. Doi:10.1353/mos.2013.0036
- Nordenbo, S.E. (2002). *Bildung* and the Thinking of *Bildung*. *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 36(3): 341-352. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9752.00280>
- Nordlén, L. (2009). The Journey from Innocence to Experience: Philip Pullman's *His Dark Materials* as a female Bildungsroman. Teacher Training Program Thesis, Högskolan i Gävle University, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, Gävle.
- Rayment, A. (2017). Literary Realism, Modernism and Postmodernism: A Comparative Introduction. Chiba University, Japan. Retrieved March 20, 2019 From https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318787087_Literary_Realism_Modernism_and_Postmodernism_A_Comparative_Introduction
- Riquelme, J.P. (2013). Modernist Transformations of Life Narrative: From Wilde and Woolf to Bechdel and Rushdie. *Modern Fiction Studies* 59(2): 461-479. Doi: 10.1353/mfs.2013.0038
- Root, T.G. (1960). Stylistic Irony in Thomas Mann. *The Germanic Review: Literature, Culture, Theory* 35(2): 93- 103. Doi: 10.1080/19306962.1960.11787004
- Sadeghi, Z., Sasani, S. (2018). Myth plus Psychology' in *Death in Venice*. *Journal of Humanistic and Social Studies* 9(1): 21-35. Retrieved March 21, 2019, From https://www.academia.edu/37072153/Myth_plus_Psychology_in_Death_in_Venice
- Saha, S. (2016). Understanding The Stream of Consciousness Text: A Linguistic Perspective. *International Journal of Linguistics and Literature (IJLL)* 5(2): 21-26. Retrieved March 21, 2019, From https://www.academia.edu/23318144/UNDERSTANDING_THE_STREAM_OF_CONSCIOUSNESS_TEXT_A_LINGUISTIC_PERSPECTIVE
- Schuiling, G.A. (2004). Death in Venice: The homosexuality enigma. *Journal of Psychosomatic Obstetrics & Gynecology* 25(1): 67-76. Doi: 10.1080/01674820410001737469

- Sewerin, M. (2014). The Deconstruction of Maturity in Joyce's *Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. BA Thesis, Stockholm University, Literature, Goloubera.
- Sheeba, S. (2017). Postmodern literature: Practices and Theory. *Excellence International Journal of Education and Research* 4(2): 181-190. Retrieved March 11, 2019, From https://www.researchgate.net/publication/328449584_Postmodern_literature_Practices_and_Theory
- Sizemore Jr. J. T. (2014). An Analysis of Art Represented in Classical Mythology in Mann's *Death in Venice*. *International Journal of Arts & Sciences* 07(05): 235-241. Doi: 10.13140/2.1.4276.4482
- Standlee, W. (2010). George Egerton, James Joyce and the Irish *Künstlerroman*. *Irish Studies Review* 18(4): 439-452. Doi: 10.1080/09670882.2010.515850
- Stephens, E.D.B. (1962). The Stream of Consciousness Technique in The Novels of James Joyce. MA Thesis, Atlanta University, The Faculty of Atlanta University, Atlanta, Georgia.
- Stevens, S.N. (2010). Venice as No-Place: Liminality and the Modernist Interpretation of the Myth of Venice. MA Thesis, Oklahoma State University, Bachelor of Arts in English, Stillwater, Oklahoma.
- Thamarana, S. (2015). Origin and Development of Bildungsroman Novels in English Literature. *International Journal of English Language, Literature and Humanities* 3(6):21-26. Retrieved February 20, 2019, From https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282876442_Origin_and_Development_of_Bildungsroman_Novels_in_English_Literature
- Traschen, I. (1965). The Uses of Myth in "Death in Venice". *Modern Fiction Studies* 11(2): 165-179. Retrieved March 15, 2019, From https://www.jstor.org/stable/26278799?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents
- Varickayil, R. (1980). Social Origins of Protestant Reformation. *Social Scientist* 8(11): 14-31. Doi: 10.2307/3516750
- Vega- Encabo, J. (2016). Philosophy by showing: On Philip Kitcher's *Deaths in Venice: The Cases of Gustav von Aschenbach*. *Teorema* 35(2):125-140. Retrieved March 15, 2019, From

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/316943601_Philosophy_by_showing_On_Philip_Kitcher's_deaths_in_Venice_The_cases_of_Gustav_von_Aschenbach

Wawrzycka, J. (2017). Tell Us, Aren't You an Artist?' (sh 26) –Revisiting Joyce's Künstlerroman. James Joyce Italian Foundation Conference, University Roma Tre. Retrieved March 15, 2019, From https://www.academia.edu/35777599/Revisiting_Joyces_K%C3%BCnstlerroman.pdf

Winkelmann, C. (1995). Distance and Desire: Homoeroticism in Thomas Mann's *Death in Venice*. MA Thesis, McGill University, Department of German, Montreal, Quebec.

Yılmaz, D. (2017). A Study On Bildungsroman in the Mid-Victorian Period. MA Thesis, Ege University, English Language and Literature, İzmir.

CURRICULUM VITAE

1990 doğumlu olan Melisa İNAL, 2012 yılında Kocaeli Üniversitesi İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı bölümünden mezun olmuştur. Aynı sene yine Kocaeli Üniversitesi Fen Edebiyat Fakültesi Batı Dilleri ve Edebiyatı Anabilim Dalı İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı yüksek lisans programına başlamış ve 2019 yılında mezun olmuştur. 2012-2013 Güz Yarıyılı boyunca Kocaeli Üniversitesi Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulunda sözleşmeli olarak çalışmış olan Melisa İNAL, 2013 yılından beri Gebze Teknik Üniversitesi Yabancı Diller Bölümünde Öğretim Görevlisi olarak çalışmaktadır.



:

