T.C KOCAELİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ

SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİSTÜSÜ

GAZETECİLİK ANABİLİM DALI

GAZETECİLİK BİLİM DALI

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF ONLINE NEWSPAPERS IN TURKEY AND IN BENIN IN THE CONTEXT OF MEDIA ECONOMY

(YÜKSEK LİSANS TEZİ)

Nonvignon Claudel HOUNTON

KOCAELİ 2021

T.C KOCAELİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ

SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİSTÜSÜ

GAZETECİLİK ANABİLİM DALI

GAZETECİLİ BİLİM DALI

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF ONLINE NEWSPAPERS IN TURKEY AND IN BENIN IN THE CONTEXT OF MEDIA ECONOMY

(YÜKSEK LİSANS TEZİ)

Nonvignon Claudel HOUNTON

Doç. Dr. Aysel ÇETİNKAYA

KOCAELİ 2021

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Karar No: 07.07.2021/16

Contents

Abstract

The last two decades have seen media industry continuously evolving. With the arrival of new technologies and the İnternet, journalism adapted and has developed new habits, new methods and new economic dynamics. By changing the production and the distribution processes, online journalism also created a new economy. Even if the changes that occur in media industry are global, the journey of newspapers online can vary from a country to another one depending on the social, economic and technical environment they are. The purpose of this study is to investigate how online newspapers in Turkey and Benin are experiencing the changes brought by technology in media sector and to identify the similarities and disparities within this process. Based on qualitative research method, how industry structure and changing technologies affect the conduct and performance of media industries is investigated.

İn terms of online journalism development, Turkey is one step ahead of Benin though the changes online newspapers are undergoing remain quite the same. Content production, presentation and distribution in online newspapers in Turkey created new positions and new skill demands. But in Benin, these positions are not yet noticeable. Moreover, as in Turkey, advertisement remains the main source of income of online newspapers in Benin while staff and technical infrastructure is the biggest source of expenses.

Keywords: Media Economics-Online Journalism-Turkey-Benin

Özet

Son yirmi yıldır medya endüstrisinin sürekli gelişme ve değişim gösterdiği görülmüştür. Yeni teknolojilerin ve internetin yaygınlaşmasıyla birlikte gazetecilik bu yeniliklere ayak uydurmak zorunda kalmış; yeni alışkanlıklar, yeni yöntemler ve yeni ekonomik dinamikler ortaya çıkmıştır. Çevrimiçi mecra, üretim ve dağıtım süreçlerini değiştirerek yeni bir ekonomi de yaratmıştır. Medya sektöründe meydana gelen değişiklikler küresel olsa bile, gazetelerin çevrimiçi yolculuğu, bulundukları sosyal, ekonomik ve teknik ortama bağlı olarak ülkeden ülkeye farklılık gösterebilmektedir. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Türkiye ve Benin'deki çevrimiçi gazetelerin medya sektöründe teknolojinin getirdiği değişimleri nasıl yaşadıklarını araştırmak, bu süreçteki benzerlik ve farklılıkları tespit etmektir. Çalışmada, nitel araştırma yöntemine dayalı olarak, değişen teknolojilerin medya endüstrilerinin işleyişini ve ekonomik dinamikleri nasıl etkilediği araştırılmaktadır. Çevrimiçi gazetecilik gelişimi açısından bakıldığında Türkiye'de çevrimiçi gazetelerin geçirdiği değişimler benzer olsa da, Benin'in bir adım önündedir. Türkiye'de çevrimiçi gazetelerde içerik üretimi, sunumu ve dağıtımı yeni pozisyonlar ve yeni beceri talepleri yaratmıştır. Ancak Benin'de bu pozisyonlar henüz fark edilmemektedir. Ayrıca, Türkiye'de olduğu gibi Benin'de de reklam, çevrimiçi gazetelerin ana gelir kaynağı olmaya devam ederken, personel ve teknik altyapı en büyük gider kaynağıdır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Medya Ekonomisi-Çevrimiçi Gazetecilik-Türkiye-Benin

Abbreviations

ARPA: Advanced Research Projects Agency.

ARPANET: Advanced Research Projects Agency Network.

BİTNET: Because İt's Time Network.

DARPA: Defense Advanced Projects Agency.

EARN: European Academic and Research Network.

NCP: Network Protocol Control.

R&D: Research and Development.

SCP: Structure-Conduct-Performance.

SEO: Search Engine Optimization.

SERP: Search Engine Result Page.

OPT : Office des Postes et Télécommunications.

TÜVEKA : Türkiye Üniversiteler ve Araştırma Kurumları Ağı.

TV: Television.

UCLA: University of California, Los Angeles.

UK: United Kingdom.

URİ: Uniform Resources İdentifiers.

US: United States.

UUCP: Unix-to-Unix Copy.

WCP: Write-Check-Publish.

Introduction

For a very long time, neither information nor the media was part of the economic field. According to Nathalie Sonac, they remained only in the field of disciplines such as sociology, political science, etc. But from the years 1950-1960, micro-economic approaches on the media were developed before experiencing a strong interest in the years 1980. This new science which develops until in the years 2000 will make it possible to understand the peculiarities of information as an economic good and the different economic models applied in the media industry.

New information technologies have brought the media to a critical point of change. With the advent of digital and the Internet, the media have undergone very profound changes which have brought about another dynamic in the information society and in the media industry. By changing practices and habits the Internet is defining the future of media around a new form of journalism: Online journalism. Online journalism, which has evolved within the traditional media industry, is receiving much attention in an ever-changing industry.

The internet as a catalyst for change in the media industry has kept pace with countries according to their ability to put in place the necessary infrastructure for its optimal use. Arrived in Turkey in the early 90s and in Benin later, the speed of the internet's spread in the two countries will haven't been the same. With the emergence of social media in the early 2000s, readers' information consumption habits changed, subjecting the media in both countries to an internet-oriented transformation process. While the media in Turkey went online earlier than in Benin, the processes of change have remained the same.

This research, which targets online newspapers with a print version, aims to identify the role played by online newspapers in the media economy. Taking into account the market structure, sources of income and expenses of online newspapers, this study seeks to establish a link between advertising and online journalism in both Turkey and Benin. By comparing online newspapers in the two countries, the aim is

to highlight the similarities and disparities in the economic dynamics underway in the media sector.

Part 1

1   Media Economics Concept

Within media industry, there are many economic concepts that explain how the industry is structured and how media companies work as economic institutions. İn this part, the history of media economics, its definition and its particularities are going to be addressed. The economic theories and models in application in media industry are also going to be described.

1.1   History of Media Economics

Before the emergence of the media economics as a science and field of study, the media have existed in the past with economic models that have changed over time and according to the purpose of these media. It would be interesting to take a look at the economic functioning of the media at a much more distant past.

Since ancient times, men have always felt the need to learn and communicate with one another. However, the earliest forms of journalism (collection and distribution of information) were rather similar to intelligence. This collection and distribution of information was initiated by kings and emperors. Some authorities in their kingdoms were in charge of collecting this information, which would be used for the proper management of the kingdom or territory. Information was also brought from abroad by ambassadors, consuls or emissaries. These were mainly territories identified as important places for trade or places that would be potential threats. This form of information gathering was therefore funded by states for their own interests. From this point of view, the information collected was not a good to sell but a management tool or at the service of the effective management of the State (Picard R. G., 2006).

Later in the Middle Ages, the world witnessed the birth of an elite of traders. For their commercial activities, they began to fund the collection of information around the world. They paid correspondents in cities and other countries to help them gather political and economic information for their businesses. This information, which was only for commercial purposes, was not intended for wide distribution. They were kept

in secret. In the thirteenth and nineteenth century, newspapers supporting aristocratic ideology appeared. They were always at the service of traders and financed by a certain elite. Even then, revenues from the sale of information were not sufficient to make the production and dissemination of information a profitable business. On the one hand, newspapers and press activities were subsidized by revenues from printing activities. On the other hand, political parties, governments and merchant associations were the main sources of funding for the media.

It was not until the late nineteenth century and the beginning of the twentieth century to witness the emergence of the model of financing the mass media. This advance was made possible thanks to the industrial revolution and urbanization. The mass could buy cheap newspapers but the newspapers were financed by advertising revenues, that is to say the money from the sale of advertising. This method of financing has resulted in a split of newspapers into two categories. The first category of newspapers is that of newspapers of a high quality but whose funding is still based on advertising. On the other hand, there were lower quality newspapers less funded by advertising. This model is best known for the financing of mass media for the collection and distribution of information (Picard R. G., 2010).

It means that historically, news and information were not for sale though its gathering and production require some important financial means. Even after news has become a commercial good, they have never been commercially viable products. Before the application of media economics as a science, there has been media economics but without any interest to studies.

1.2   Media Economics as a Science

For several decades, the media have been at the heart of many studies and sciences without necessarily being seen as an economic discipline. But recent decades have revealed that the media can also be a field of economic studies.

Christiansen and Lechman provided a brief history of how media economics emerged and got interest with time. Media economics was not addressed in a very deep way as media scholars didn't realize the link between economics and their discipline.

Media were seen more in relationship with sociology, history, psychology and political sciences than with economics (Christiansen & Lechman, 2016). Picard asserts that even the business executives working in the media sector ignore the connections between media and economics (Picard R. G., 2006). Media economics as a field of study gained interest in the 1980s since media firms have experienced turbulent times in recent years. But some authors still maintained that media economics emerged in the 50s (Christiansen & Lechman, 2016). Media economics enhanced and become more visible after the "soul searching" following the infamous the stock market crash called "Black Monday" in 1987 after which business enterprises started to re-think and re-organize their structures. In addition to the financial stresses and volatility experienced by firms in general, media firms have encountered technological forces and organizational change as they seek to stay in business and a rapidly changing environment. Otherwise, media economics wouldn't have been so important (Alexander, Owers, Carveth, Hollifield, & Greco, 2004, p. 3).

Atli and Yilmazata have succeeded in figuring out the relationship between media, economics and media economics. By defining all of them, they have showed how media and economics have mixed up. In their treatise on neuroeconomics and media economics, media is said to be consist of every broadcasting and narrowcasting medium such as newspapers, magazines, TV, radio, billboards, direct mail, telephone, fax, and internet. While economics is defined as the social science that seeks to describe the factors, which determine the production, distribution and consumption of goods and services, media economics is a holistic approach towards the economic policies and practices of media firms and industries. Moreover, both authors stressed that economics has proven to be a highly relevant factor in understanding how media conglomerates and the mainstream media are operating as commercial, profit orientated players (Christiansen & Lechman, 2016, p. 37).

From this point of view, it can be said that media economics as a field of study is an intersection between economics as a science and the media as a sector of activity. In other words, it is economics applied to the media. It combines principles of both the study of media and communications with the examination of economic principles and their application in managing firms in the sector.

Economics is also a valuable subject area for media scholars. Most of the decisions taken by those who run media organizations are, to a greater or lesser extent, influenced by resource and financial issues. So, economics as a discipline, is highly relevant to understanding how media firms and industries operate (Doyle, 2002, p. 1).

Media economics is a term employed to refer to the business operations and financial activities of firms producing and selling output into the various media industries.

According to Alev Söylemez, companies operating in the various media industries depend on market rules like other companies operating in other sectors and try to maximize their profits with the decisions they have made under the conditions available. Media economics examines the process in which these activities take place by considering consumption, distribution and also processes of change and defines the principles that emerge during this process. Media economics, in the broad sense of the term, can be defined as a field of research where economic theory is the basis (Söylemez, 1998, p. 5).

The context of scarce resources, technological and organizational constraints, responses to preferences of consumers, and the distributional aspects of whose tastes and preferences will dominate is pervasive in all economic analysis. Media economics focuses on the consideration of the genre of goods and services comprising the media segment of the economy (Alexander, Owers, Carveth, Hollifield, & Greco, 2004).

In the present time, due to rising insecurity after the debt crisis and market shape-up, media economics has become an ever more valuable tool of analysis for professionals as well as for academics (Christiansen & Lechman, 2016).

1.3 Definition of Media Economics

Many authors interested in media economics or media industries issues have tried to formalize a definition of media economics. Some have firstly defined economics before reporting it to the media field.

Economics is said by Parkin to be the study of how people make choices to cope with scarcity while Colander assumed that economics is the study of how human beings coordinate their wants and desires, given the decision-making mechanisms, social customs and political realities of the society (Colander, 2006, p. 2).

According to Picard, in the economic system, the media meets the needs and demands of four different groups by allocating resources to create news and information. He said that media economics is the way media operators try meet the informational and entertainment needs and wants of society and advertisers with the available resources. Picard sorted these groups in 4 categories. These groups are media promoters or shareholders, viewers or readers, advertisers, workers in media companies (Picard R. G., 1989, p. 9).

Media promoters and shareholders want to protect their firms and make their holdings endure, reach more income from their investments, grow their firms and thus want return on their investments. Viewers and readers want to easily get good quality media and service products at the lowest possible price. Advertisers seek media who can help reach readers or viewers they want to attract at the lowest cost with the highest quality service. As for workers in media companies, they want high wages, equal and fair treatment, safe and good working environments. They also want to be rewarded for their efforts (Çetinkaya, 2019).

Albarran assumed that media economics it the way media industries use scarce resources to produce content and satisfy many wants and needs (Albarran A. B., 2002).

Doyle's approach of media economics is the effect of a range of issues including international trade, business strategy, pricing policies, competition and industrial concentration on media firms and industries (Doyle, 2002, p. 2).

Other studies have also focused on the microeconomic and macroeconomic aspects of the media. Microeconomic studies target consumers, firms or the sector as a research unit. As for macroeconomic studies, they consider the entire news and information sector as a research unit (Lacy, Walter, & Nieubaeur, 1995, p. 5).

On the one hand, media economics takes into account microeconomics that analyzes the general economic system at the national level in the media sector. Microeconomics examines market structure, consumption, behaviors, relationships between producers and consumers. On the other hand, media economics includes microeconomics that focuses on the market, firms and consumers. Macroeconomics, in turn, focuses on the political economy, total production and consumption, economic growth, labor and inflation. While microeconomics studies the competitive behavior of media firms and market performance, the macroeconomic perspective requires an analysis of public media policy and its impact on general media consumption and investment (Albarran A. B., 2002, pp. 4-5).

1.4   Particularities of Media Economics

It is commonly said that media industry is different from all the other industries and sectors owing to the value of the product sold by media firms. Moreover, many scholars have proved that the business in media sector has some features that makes it very different from other businesses. For example, Blumler and Nosster have noticed that media have some interesting and unusual feathers (Blumler & Nossiter, 1991).

As cultural goods are not used up as they are consumed, the application of economic theory and economic perspectives in the context of media is different. This makes media different and makes media not to comply with the law of economy that is based on scarcity (Doyle, 2002).

1.4.1 Type and Value of Media Product

Media content is said to be ''cultural good'' as it uses to enrich our cultural environment as film, television broadcasting, books and music do. These goods are usually bought because of the value of the information, the message or the meaning they carried rather than the medium. So, media products are not consumed as material but as intangible and meaningful products (Albarran A. , 1996).

The value of media products that are news depends more on the content than on the container. That is to say that the message, the meaning conveyed by content is more important that the mean used to deliver it. The value of media content lies in its

intellectual quality not in the paper, the ink or the videotape that is used to publish the text or images. Media content consumers are not buying the medium or the material itself. In other words, the audiences are not buying the material, but the immaterial quality carried by the medium. As the value of media content is tied up to immaterial, it does not get used up or destroyed in the act of consumption. For example, the fact that someone consumes a TV program doesn't diminish someone else's opportunity of viewing it. The same program can be watched by other viewers and supplied over to other consumers. Due to that particularity, media are also called ''public goods'' in contrast with private or normal goods that will get used up as they are consumed (Doyle, 2002).

1.4.2 Dual Product

Media firms used to sell their product to two different and separate markets: audience and advertisers. That's what Picard referred to as ''Dual product'' (Picard R. G., 1989, pp. 17-19). These two commodities are: content (television programs, newspaper copy, magazine articles, etc.) and audiences. First, media firms sell entertainment and/or news to readers, listeners or viewers. Then the audiences that have been attracted by the content are a kind of output that can be also sold. This second output is usually packaged, priced and sold to advertisers (Doyle, 2002). So, Lavine and Wackman have seen media as a bridge between advertisers and audiences (Lavine & Wackman, 1988, p. 254).

Media economy strongly rely on advertisement because the price their products are sold are not sufficient to cover the investment to produce the output. So, media firms are obliged to sell audiences to advertisers to compensate for the gap. A big part of media firms' income doesn't come from readers, listeners or viewers but from advertisers (McQuail, 1992).

1.4.3 Scale and Scope Economies of Media

Economies of scale are one of the most important and predominant characteristics of media firms. Generally, scale economies are concerned with the benefits of specialization and division of labor applied within large firms. Any industry

where marginal costs are lower than average costs, economies of scale are said to be there. In media sector, marginal costs refer to the cost of supplying a product or service to one extra consumer whereas average costs are the total costs involved in providing the product or service, divided by the total number of users who watch, read, listen to or consume it. Generally, marginal costs in media industry tend to be low and can even be zero in some cases. As marginal costs are always lower than average costs, the most the audience increases, the most the average costs decrease (Doyle, 2002).

Gottinger has demonstrated that in network industries, fixed costs are proportional to the total costs of the products. Revenues don't depend on the firm's size and the average total cost decreases as production increases. He assumes that the most important entity in network industries is information. Developing or producing a new product can be very costly whereas producing it again after it has been launched is necessarily cheaper. A product can be reproduced at zero marginal cost (Gottinger, 2003).

According to Alev Söylemez, economies of scale are generally defined as monetary savings that provide efficiency in the use of factors due to reasons such as the growth of the firm's production scale and the opportunities provided by technical developments in the industry (Söylemez, 1998).

Through a discussion on the dynamics of information technology-based network businesses, Michael Mauboussin shows how the business model of an information-technology based network business is different from its traditional counterparts. He demonstrated that information-technology based network business has success after reaching a critical mass in term of demand, rather than supply. Mauboussin listed 4 factors on which depends the importance of information technology-based network businesses on global economy. Successful network business exhibit high returns on capital and margins. First, the physical capital needs of information technology-based networks are lower than in the past. Unlike physical networks, as information networks grow their need for capital decreases. Secondly, profitability for many industries is supply oriented. That is to say, more production is needed to reduce unit costs. The information technology-based network system acts on demand so increasing demand

leads to new demands. The higher the number of users on the network is, the more likely it is for new users to join the network. Thirdly, information networks develop faster than physical networks. Rapid development brings a rapid increase in the number of users. The reduction in computer and network costs increases the number of people who reach these technologies. Finally, although networks spread regionally, their consequences are global (Mauboussin, 2004).

Economies of scope are also known to be present in media industries. Media firms apply scope economies to reduce the average cost of production. Economies of scope are said to be the economies available to firms large enough to engage efficiently in multi-product production and associated large scale distribution, advertising and purchasing (Lipsey & Chrystal, 1995).

Economies of scope and economies of scale are both important characteristics of the economics of media. While economies of scale aim to reduce costs by increasing production outputs, economies of scope focus on achieving cost advantages by manufacturing different products within the same organization to reduce total cost (Apilioğulları, 2014).

As showed by Moschandreas, diversification is an important tool used when there are economies of scope. The total cost of the diversified firm is low compared with a group of single-product firms producing the same output (Moschandreas, 1994, p. 155). Diversification strategies are increasing in media industries and it's a proof that economies of scope are applied.

1.4.4 Perishable Character of News and Time Pressure

All media scholars agreed that news is a very perishable good, so it makes news to be a particular economic commodity. According to Söylemez, news loses its value after its production and distribution have to be performed in a very short time (Söylemez, 1998, p. 22). Denis McQuail asserts that the fact that news' lifetime is not more than a few hours results in a great time pressure on the production and distribution processes (McQuail, 1992). The fact that news is constantly changing and the shortness of news' lifetime show that media products are perishable (Baytar, 2006).

Online newspapers have shorter time to write and publish their news because of the fickleness of news (Çetinkaya, 2019).

With the advent of new technologies, audiences can more quickly reach news. Media managers, to present news in a very quickly and in a short time have started a competition. The most important factor to make news reach audiences is time. As a result of network society, Castells has developed the theory of ''timeless time''. In network society, time is continuous and 24/7. This rhythm has affected journalism practice and has changed the circulation of news. In online newspapers, time and speed pressure are more felt. Nowadays, a bulk of online newspapers' revenues is based on advertisement tied up with clicks. That is to say that ad revenue is generated through clicks. The more people click, the most revenue will be generated. To get many clicks newspapers are then obliged to quickly publish news as fast as they can. Generally, the first online newspaper to publish information about a topic uses to get more clicks. Time has become more important for publishing news. The other reason for speed and time pressure over online papers is that contents get more quickly stale. When news is published by one online newspaper, it starts to become stale for the others. So, online newspapers have started to compete to be the first to present the news and differently (Çetinkaya, 2019) .

1.5   Media Economics: Theories and models

This part addresses the different theories and models used in media economics. They are: İndustrial organization theory, the theory of the circulation spiral, Niche market model, media market model and umbrella model.

1.5.1 Industrial Organization Theory

Industrial organization focuses on the organization of market. It applies the economic theory of price to industries. It is a field of economics dealing with the strategic behavior of firms, regulatory policy, antitrust policy and market competition. Industrial organization applies the economic theory of price to industries made of a group of companies whose role is to supply good and services to buyers' groups. (Hoskins, Mcfadyen, & Fnn, 2004)

The SCP paradigm has been widely regarded as an important device for understanding the essential relationships between market structure, the strategic behavior of firms and performance.

The SCP paradigm belongs to the field of industrial economics. First developed by Mason in 1939 and refined by Bain in 1968, it has since been widely used to analyze industries and competitive strategies. This paradigm maintains that there is a unidirectional causal link between the structure of the market, the behavior of the firms involved and the performance. In other words, the structure of the market affects the behavior of firms in an industry and this in turn affects performance. "Structure" refers to the institutional, environmental and physical factors that influence interactions among firms. It has traditionally been measured in terms of market concentration (supply and demand), existence and intensity of barriers to entry, degree of differentiation of supply (products, services), standards and regulations in force, etc. "Conduct" means what firms do and how they do it. This includes positioning, R&D, production, pricing, distribution strategies, etc. This also includes general strategy variables such as collusive practices or even mergers and acquisitions activities. "Performance" refers as much to results for the industry as a whole as for individual firms. It was generally measured in terms of profitability, production efficiency, technical progress, growth, etc (Mbengue, 2005).

1.5.2 The Theory of the Circulation Spiral

The circulation spiral model is a kind of concentration induced by advertisement and circulation. According to that theory, a big circulation attracts much advertisement and much advertisement attracts more reader. In a situation where there are two rival companies, the one who has the biggest circulation is likely to win while the small circulation holder stays in a kind of vicious circle (Çetinkaya, 2019).

Such a model shows that small newspapers don't have a big chance to survive. Because a newspaper who doesn't have a big circulation cannot seduce the advertisers to get advertisement from them and when there is not advertisement there's no reader. To sum up, circulation induces advertisement increase or fall which also induces

readers increase or fall. This situation condemns small newspapers to collapse (Gabszewicz, Laussel, & Sonnac, 2003).

Robert Picard assumes that circulation spiral is making it difficult for small newspapers both to enter the market and to stay. He explains it by the fact that big circulation newspapers are taking a big part of advertisement and then are becoming essential for consumers. The surviving chance of small newspapers is really reduced (Picard R. G., 2003).

It's known that media used to sell their product to advertisers and readers. While advertisers are looking for big circulation newspapers, readers are looking for serial offers and local advertisement. As this shows the correlation between media, advertiser and reader, the fall of the circulation will directly induce the fall of readers number because the advertisers will be gone. When the circulation declines, advertisements demand decreases. Advertisement decrease also induces circulation fall that affects readers' interest for the newspaper (Baseman, 2003).

It is important to notice that though advertisers that into account the circulation, it is generally not enough for advertisers to decide. There are also other factors the field (sport, economy, environment, etc.), the target group of the newspaper (Baytar, 2013).

1.5.3 Niche Market Model

As Dimmick addresses the competition and coexistence within and among media organizations and industries, he uses a bioecological theory - the theory of the niche - to explain the competitive processes in the field of media (Dimmick., 2003).

Based on Dimmick's explanations, Niche theory is a observed when industries occupy niche market in the same that biological species occupy ecological niches. How media industry adapts to competition engendered by new media and technologies (Mierzejewska, 2011).

It may be also relevant to explain what niche market is in order to see concretely its application in the media field. Niche market is the subset of the market on which a

specific product is focused. The market niche defines the product features aimed at satisfying specific market needs, as well as the price range, production quality and the demographics that it is intended to target. A niche market is a segment of a larger market that can be defined by its own unique needs, preferences, or identity that makes it different from the market at large (Sheehan, 2019).

The study run by Dimmick, Yan Chen and Zhan Li in the United States of America about the competition between new media and traditional has shown that by providing utility and gratification to consumers, a new medium may have effects on existing media due to the new solutions it provides to old needs or more contemporary needs. According to that study, the Internet has a competitive displacement effect on traditional media in daily news domain. Researchers found that the internet has the broadest niche on the gratification opportunities dimension, providing users satisfaction with more needs than any of the traditional media on this dimension (Dimmick, Chen, & Li, 2004).

1.5.4 Media Market Model

Media market model is essentially concerned with the media sector market, the structure of ownership and the structural analysis of the media field.

In this model, it appears that there are five (5) ownership types: vertical, horizontal, cross or diagonal, multinational and conglomerate. Vertical ownership is said to concern different stage of production and distribution of media. Horizontal refers to the ownership of distinct but similar media products. For example, a media company can own magazine, radio, newspaper, television and books. As for diagonal ownership, it is a cross-ownership of diverse media businesses. That is to say the company produces two or more types of media (Pickard, 2015).

As far as conglomerate is concerned, it is used to define a media company that owns several companies that provide products and services in the media industry. Media conglomerates are basically vertically integrated companies. A multinational media company has facilities and other assets in at least one country other than the main (Kaplan, 2017).

In addition, media ownership structure can also be used to refer to the public or private nature of the media. This is about who owns a media company. According to Helle Sjøvaag and Jonas Ohlsson, ownership of news media takes many forms: state ownership, family ownership, party ownership, trust ownership, public or corporate ownership (Sjøvaag & Ohlsson, 2019).

A state-owned media is a channel or a media owned and controlled by a state. It means that the state has control over the policy and the content. Nowadays, as the tendency toward privatization and commercialization or joint ownership increase, total state control over media is diminishing (Ace Project).

Family ownership is concerned with media that are founded by families or have a family foundation as the majority owner or controller of the organization. These kinds of media tend to be entrepreneurial or patriarchal (O'Hara, 2020).

As for party-owned media, they are media that just happen to be owned by political parties. Some government media are also seen as party-owned media when the ruling party and government have been intertwined (Ace Project).

As far as media market analysis is concerned, it is important because it provides information about the market, the issues within it and answers to some questions concerning the current situation in the market. The information provided by media market analysts are used by 5 main groups that are politicians, regulatory authorities, companies, investors and researchers (Ramstad, 1997) :

Structured analysis of the media market is useful for politicians because it helps better understand the issues concerning the structure-culture-agency. Analysis of media market also provides useful information concerning employment, economic and market structures in an industry that is very important in the development of modern society.

Regulatory authorities make use of the media market analysis to evaluate the compliance of media companies with current regulations. It's also a tool that can be used to decide whether regulations need to be revised or new regulations must be introduced.

Media companies need the results of the structural analysis of the media market to develop and apply adequate strategies necessary to face competitors. It also plays a complementary role of evaluation of new business opportunities because it provides an overview of the structures in the market and general characteristics.

A good overview of the market and the competitors in it is helps investors to make the best investment decisions. The results of structural analysis of media market can be of important use.

For theory building, testing, analysis and reports, researchers need structural analysis of market. That is also important in media economics fields.

1.5.5 Umbrella Model

This model was referred to for the first time in 1975 by James Rosse to analyze the inter-community and the inter-layer competition between newspapers. According to Rosse, media market developed for 3 reasons. He mentioned the completion with other media, the changes inherent to ads market and the changes in demographic structure (Rosse, 1975).

The Umbrella model has been also discussed and developed by many scholars such as Benjamin Compaine, Stephen Lacy, Lennart Weibull and Sigurd Høst, who uses Compaine as a primary source to introduce the Umbrella model in the Scandinavian literature for the first time (Gustafsson).

The original version of the model envisages the newspaper market as consisting of four tiers, which compete with one another. Newspapers compete with newspapers on other tiers, either" above" or" below". The top tier consists of metropolitan dailies having regional market coverage. The second tier consists of satellite city dailies, which differ from the first tier in that they have more confined markets.

The third tier is made up of suburban dailies serving the immediate hinterlands around the metropolis and cities. The fourth tier, finally, does not contain daily newspapers, but rather weeklies and 'shoppers'. Thus, the definition of what constitutes a"

newspaper" is very broad, catch-all (Gustafsson).

Part 2

2　Outset and Development of Online Newspapers in Turkey and in Benin

Before addressing the birth, the evolution and the expansion of online newspapers both in Benin and in Turkey, it's important to review how the internet and new technologies appeared and how they entered and transformed media industry.

2.1　New technologies

The new information technologies spread rapidly to the globe in the mid-1970s to the mid-1990s. One of the features of the technological revolution that followed the expansion was the use of the technologies produced for developing new technologies and equipping the world with information technologies (Castells, 1999).

Thomas Friedman define globalization as the inexorable integration of markets, transportation systems, and communication systems to a degree never witnessed before – in a way that is enabling corporations, countries, and individuals to reach around the world farther, faster, deeper, and cheaper than ever before, and in a way that is enabling the world to reach into corporations, countries, and individuals farther, faster, deeper, and cheaper than ever before. According to Friedman, developments in microchip technology have caused the computing power of computers to increase. The combination of innovations in computer technology with innovations in telecommunication technology has revolutionized the speed, amount and distance of information. And these developments are constantly going on. By switching from single channel broadcasting to cable satellite broadcasting through new communication technologies, the amount of information in the world has increased. In particular, access to information via the internet has become quite easy, and even the databases of the libraries are accessible from the internet, which has greatly increased the amount of information (Friedman, 2005).

2.2 Internet and Internet development

Along with communication technologies, the internet, which is a global communication tool, has become a tool used by millions of people, especially after the 90s. With the Internet, time and space limits have disappeared, and communication has changed both in corporate and individual terms (Çetinkaya, 2019).

Chuck Martin assumes that the Internet is made up of thousands of networks and billions of small pieces of information. This network, which encompasses the world, can be defined as a large box containing millions of pages, each carrying thousands of potential pieces of information on almost any subject that may come (Martin C. , 2018).

One year after the Soviet Union's first manned campaign with the Sputnik satellite in 1957, US President Eisenhower instructed the establishment of the Advanced Research Projects Agency 'ARPA'. ARPA has undertaken a number of initiatives that have led to changes in technology history, which can be regarded as the pioneer of the information age on a large scale. One of these initiatives was the idea of Paul Baran, who worked at Rand Corporation between 1960 and 1964, to design a communication system that would not be affected by any nuclear attack. This system, which is basically a package-key strategy, will enable the network to operate independently from the command-and-control centers, so that the message units could find their own way within the network and be gathered at any point in the network with a consistent meaning. (Castells, 1999)

As a result of the studies, ARPANET, the first generation packet switched computer system, which can be called the first computer network, has been revealed. This network structure is called 'Internet Protocol'. ARPANET, which was realized by connecting scientific research environments where the Pentagon supports money for military purposes, was used as an experimental environment in the process of new computer connection techniques and networking in the process. (Çetinkaya, 2019)

ARPANET was created technically between 1969-1982 with a distribution protocol called Network Control Protocol (NCP). On October 29, 1969, ARPANET

delivered its first message: a "node-to-node" communication from one computer to another. This test was made between a computer located in a research lab in UCLA and another at Stanford. In the 1970s, internet keeps growing as Robert Kahn and Vinton Cerf developed Transmission Control Protocol and Internet Protocol, or TCP/IP. That's a communications model that set standards for how data could be transmitted between multiple networks. During the Cold War era, ARPA was restructured as the Defense Advanced Projects Agency (DARPA). In 1973, DARPA started a research program that will examine the technologies and techniques that will enable the connection of various types of packet networks with each other. The purpose of this program is to develop communication protocols related to packet networks that enable transparent communication between networked computers. This situation was named as "Internetting Project" and the "networks system" that emerged as a result of the research was named "Internet". (Andrews, 2019)

DARPA developed the e-mail service, one of the most used services of the internet in the first half of the 1970s, and this service was used mostly for military purposes until the 1990s. The protocols system developed as a result of the research conducted within the scope of the "Internetting Project" was named as "TCP / IP Protocol Binary" after the first two protocols appeared under the name of "Transmission Control Protocol-TCP and Internet Protocol-IP" (Darpa).

TCP / IP is designed as a command and protocol below it to access remote computers. TCP then began to be used with IP to send data in the form of message units between computers on the Internet, and TCP / IP has become the Internet's primary communication language or protocol. ARPANET officially switched to TCP / IP protocol on January 1, 1983. When TCP came later in 1984, the port exceeded 1000 and since this date, the domain name system (Domain Name Server) DNS started to be used. ARPANET totally disappeared in 1990 because it becomes outdated in terms of technology. The online world really started in 1980, when computer scientist Tim Berners-Lee invented the World Wide Web. (Andrews, 2019)

The development of the internet is actually entirely tied up with the invention of the World Wide Web. Basically, the project named ''World Wide Web'' was designed

and developed so that the scientists working in the universities and the institutes of the world can instantly exchange information. The idea behind is to create a spare where people can share information (Darpa).

The first website was created at the European Organization for Nuclear Research (CERN). It was hosted on the computer NeXT of Tim Berners-Lee. While the address of the first site and server was info.cern.ch, the first webpage address was http://info.cern.ch/hypertext/www/TheProject.html.   On April 30, 1993, CERN released the World Wide Web software into the public domain. Then he released a next version of the free license application, a safer way to maximize its distribution. In doing so, it allowed the web to weave (Cern).

The page mainly included information related to the ''www'' project, including a description of what hypertext is, technical details for creating a web server, and links to other servers, which were added as and when as they became available. The first message displayed on the first website is as below:

'' *Everything there is online about W3 is linked directly or indirectly to this document, including an executive summary [2] of the project, Mailing lists [3], Policy [4], November's W3 news [5], Frequently Asked Questions [6].* '' (Cern).

2.3   From Web 1.0 to Web 4.0: Timeline and Definitions

Web 1.0 was the logical continuation of what Tim has done. It is said to be the first generation of World Wide Web defined as ''*an information space in which the items of interest referred to as resources are identified by global identifier called as Uniform Resources Identifiers (URIs)*''. Web 1.0 was very passive in nature and did not allow users to interact. Tim himself considered it as a ''read-only'' web because websites were made of static pages which users can only visit and read. It lasted from 1989 to 2005. (Choudhury, 2014)

After the Web 1.0 comes the Web 2.0. The term Web 2.0 was used for the first time in 2003 by Dale Dougherty before being published in 2004 by O'Reilly Media which he co-founded with Tim O'Reilly. Tim O'Reilly defines the Web 2.0 as '*the business revolution in the computer industry caused by the move to the internet as*

platform, and an attempt to understand the rules for success on that new platform. Chief among those rules is this: Build applications that harness network effects to get better the more people use them'' (O'Reilly, 2006).

There are so many differences between the two versions of the web. Unlike the Web 1.0, the Web 2.0 is participative and read-write web. With Web 2.0, the web was no more unidirectional. Users can interact, modify and collaborate for better contents of the web. Web 2.0 is recognized mainly with services such as blogs, wikis, really simple syndications (Rss), Mashups, etc. (Aghaei, Nematbakhsh, & Farsani, 2012)

As for Web 3.0, it's called the third generation of the web. It was referred to as the third generation of the web by John Markoff of the New York Times in 2006. The Web 3.0 is '' a *supposed third generation of Internet-based services that collectively comprise what might be called 'the intelligent Web' such as those using semantic web, microformats, natural language search, data-mining, machine learning, recommendation agents, and artificial intelligence technologies which emphasize machine-facilitated understanding of information in order to provide a more productive and intuitive user experience*." According to Spivack, the Web 3.0 is a more connected, open, and intelligent, with semantic Web technologies, distributed databases, natural language processing, machine learning, machine reasoning, and autonomous agents (Spivack, 2007).

Also known as symbiotic web, the Web 4.0 is a stage of the web where there will be interaction between human and machines in symbiosis. Though there's not yet an exact definition the Web 4.0, the idea behind is to build more powerful interfaces such as controlled mind interfaces. It's a read-write-execution-concurrency web that will use artificial intelligence to become an intelligent web (Aghaei, Nematbakhsh, & Farsani, 2012).

To sum up, the internet has moved from a very basic stage to an outstanding maturity within a quite short period of time and still keeps an unpredictable face in store. The Web 1.0 was just made of static web pages linked with hyperlinks while the Web 2.0 was more innovative by changing the status of users from spectators to actors. It brought blogs, social networks, wikis, etc. The semantic web also called Web 3.0

doesn't have any conventional definition because people keep asking what exactly it is. But it is accepted to be a mature version of the previous web. As for Web 4.0, it's still an unknown stage of the Web.

2.4   Advent of the Internet in Turkey

The first step to the internet in Turkey was experienced thanks to the connection between the EARN/BITNET (European Academic and Research Network/Because It's Time Network) in 1986 with the Turkish Universities and Research Institutions (TÜVEKA). But later in 1991, the Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey and the Middle East Technical University launched a project to reinforce the previous connection which was not so good enough to face the technological needs. As a result of that project, the first experimental connection was realized in 1992 via X.25 to Holland. On April 12, 1993, the very first connection of 64 kbps to the internet in Turkey was realized through the TCP/IP protocol of the National Science Foundation Network (Sayımer, 2008).

In April 1993, Turkey has been connected to the global internet for the first time thanks to the cooperation between the Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey and the Technical Middle East University as part of the State Planning Organization project. For a long period of time, this line of 64 kbps was the only exit point of the country from the Middle East Technical University. In 1995, other universities such as Bilkent University, Bosphorus University and Istanbul Technical University were connected to the internet after Ege University which was connected in 1994 (Karaduman, 2005).

2.5   Advent of the Internet in Benin

Compared to other countries of the world, Benin got access to the internet quite late. The internet came to Benin in 1995 on the occasion of the organization of French speaking countries (OIF) summit in Cotonou. In 2011, just 3,5% of the population Benin was using the Internet (Jdn, 2011).

For that summit, Benin got an internet access gateway of 64 kbps via a subsidiary of France Telecom. The purpose was to cover the summit. The connection was

managed by the national operator called OPT. About a year later, due to the development of the Internet in Benin, OPT's infrastructure was becoming more and more limiting. But Benin benefited from the American project "Leland Imitative" which intended to strengthen the presence of twenty African countries on the information highways. Leland Imitative works directly with the national operator. After signing the contract on January 9, 1997, the international connection from Benin was raised to 128 kbps in early 1998, via the American service provider MCI. The project runs over three years. Note that long before the OPT connection, some rare Beninese had enjoyed the Internet (email) since 1994 thanks to the company Benin Online Service System company which offered the West African sub-region access by UUCP (Lohinto, 1999).

2.6   Conceptual Framework of Online journalism

İn this section, online journalism will be addressed in all its theorical dimensions: definition, content production, presentation and distribution processes.

2.6.1 Definition of Online Journalism

As the fourth kind of journalism, Jo L.H. Bardoel and Mark Deuze defined online journalism as gathering and distributing news on the Internet. They argued that the changing aspects of journalism have been a problem for researchers to agree on an exact definition of journalism. Furthermore, they sustained that in the context of the internet, the technological dimension should be taken into account since online journalism is different from the other kinds of journalism. Online journalism is characterized by a main feature that is the online or wired computer-mediated communication environment (Bardoel & Deuze, 2001).

For Jim Hall, Online journalism means using journalism methods and technics to gather information in other to inform the audience via the internet (Hall, 2001).

According to Xu Xiaoage, Online journalism can be described as the reporting and the dissemination of news on news websites, news channels of portals or Web editions of tradition news media (Xiaoge, 2012).

Online journalism is also referred to as journalism 2.0 by Muhammad M. Abdul-Mageed opposing it to traditional where news collection, reporting, dissemination, and analysis were controlled by institutions. For him, journalism means, the use of new technologies in collaborative news making and news analysis by lay persons with (minimal) web publishing skills, much as Web 2.0 refers to the use of similar technologies to foster user-generated content and user-to-user interaction (Muhammad , 2008).

To sum up, we can describe online journalism as the media share of digital revolution. It's the meeting point of traditional journalism, the digital and the internet. It combines the core journalism skills of reporting, editing, features and programs.

Online journalism application can be observed in two ways. The first application is the fact that traditional or conventional media move to online (internet) environment. The second one is concerned with media whose content are exclusively edited and published on the internet. These media are using all the possibilities presented by the internet development to keep their contents update (Çetinkaya, 2019) .

Pavlik found a new form of news emerging in the online world as contextualized journalism, which is multidimensional and can produce more engaging reporting and more complete information, in the process benefiting democracy by better informing a global citizenry (Pavlik, 2001).

According to Pavlik, there are 5 dimensions of contextualized journalism. These are the width of communication methods, hypermedia, the participation of a high audience, dynamic content and adaptation.

The width of communication methods is the fact that online journalism can benefit from possibilities such as text, graphic animation, sound, video and 360 degree video that are available. These allow traditional to go beyond their limits in term of quality of content. As far as hypermedia is concerned, it's a clickable structure that leads to another online content. The third feature of online journalism that is audience participation brings audience from a passive state to a very high state of participation. In one word, audiences' activism in online journalism era is more remarkable than in the time of traditional media. A dynamic content which is the fourth feature makes

contents continuously changing according to the trends, the events. In digital environment news can be personalized in a way that has never been possible before in traditional media (Pavlik, 2001).

Deuze differentiates multimedia journalism from printing press, television and radio as a fourth type of journalism to figure out the difference between multimedia journalism from online journalism. He describes multimedia journalism as publication on web pages of contents created on different formats. But multimedia journalism and online journalism have some common points thanks to technological convergence. Furthermore, multimedia is a feature of online journalism (Deuze, 2004).

Deuze categorized online journalism practices into four groups. He defines four particular types of online journalism and defines them in terms of key characteristic of online publishing: Mainstream news sites, Index & category sites, Meta & comment sites and Share & discussion sites (Deuze, 2003).

Mainstream news sites are referred to as the most widespread form of news media production online that offer a selection of editorial content and a minimal, generally filtered moderated form of participatory communication. Deuze explains that the contents here can be characterized as originated (produced originally for the web) or aggregated (shoveled from a linked parent medium, 'framed' or 'deep-linked' from an external source) (Deuze, 2001).

Deuze assumes that index and category sites are not mentioned among the mainstream organizations as it's attributed to certain search engines, marketing research firms, agencies and sometimes enterprising individuals. Journalists here offer links that lead to another news sites that already exist on the web. These sites don't offer original editorial content but do offer areas for chat or exchanging news (Muhammad , 2008).

The third category that is Meta & comment sites comprises news media and media issues in general. These sites are regarded as media criticism or alternative media voices. The contents are produced by journalists and basically discuss content found elsewhere on the internet. This ''journalism about journalism'' is intended to be a watchdog. The aim is to contribute to the further professionalization of journalism.

Many of these sites exist as online journalisms in that they collect, annotate and comment upon sources of news all over the web, focusing explicitly on issues and angles that they feel the 'mainstream' journalists have not covered or not sufficiently (Deuze, 2003).

Share & discussion sites are said by Deuze to be platforms where editorial inspection is reduced and where the participatory feature of internet is more felt. This type of online journalism has also been described as 'group weblogs', offering personal accounts of individuals about their experiences on the internet (Deuze, 2003).

2.7 Content Production, Presentation and Distribution Process in Online Journalism

Why traditional journalism is different from online journalism is how news is produced and distributed. Here, content production, the presentation of news online and how news is distributed are addressed.

2.7.1 Content Production

İnternet has drastically changed many practices in journalism, especially in news production. Mitchelstein and Boczkowski argued that four main changes occurred in the information production process: modifications in editorial workflow, alterations in news-gathering practices, acceleration of temporal patterns of content production, and the convergence of print, broadcast, and online operations (Mitchelstein & Boczkowski, 2009).

Pressure on journalists has increased because they have to carry out many tasks in a very short time. The new environment and medium is forcing them to combine news-gathering and various story-telling techniques in different media formats (Cawley, 2008). That's what Bromley named multiskilling which presents the multiple skills needed by journalist to face the new work challenges (Bromley, 1997).

From search to publishing, all the process of news production has been changed or affected. Journalists have to seek news or report-worthy issues differently than it's done before. The information-gathering process has experienced major change since

the late 1990s leading journalist to be continuously surfing the İnternet to look for story ideas or trends around (Nicholas, Williams, Cole, & Martin, 2000). İnternet brought the need for news organizations to publish continuously during the day. This led to a lack of time for journalists to properly search and cross-check. This makes them to dash the traditions off (Quandt, 2008).

2.7.2 Content Presentation in Online Journalism

News production and distribution have never been more dynamic and independent than today. İn this view, the internet enables greater access to a more varied source of news. The current online news ecosystem ends a period in which news monopolies controlled the news and Access to it. İn this part of the work, how online media present news nowadays is going to be addressed.

2.7.2.1 Use of Multimedia and İnfographics

As said by Deuze, multimedia in journalism is the presentation of a news story package (on a website) using two or more media formats such as spoken and written word, music, moving and still images, graphic animations, including interactive and hypertextual elements (Deuze, 2004). One of the greatest features and the changes the İnternet has brought to journalism and media field is undeniably the use of multimedia. While traditional newspaper can only illustrate news stories with photos, the digital makes it possible to use text, photo, audio and video. Thanks to convergence, all can be used on the same or different webpages (Aktaş, 2007). A story that could require thousand words to be told is now told with just a picture. Some question marks let by texts in the readers minds can also be moved away with pictures or videos (Karli & Çetinkaya, 2018).

İnfographics is a term used to name the process that consists of visualizing data or ideas that tries to convey complex information to an audience in a way that can be easily and quickly understood (Smiciklas, 2012). But visual, content and knowledge are the three key elements according to Siricharoen (Siricharoen, 2013). İnfographics is made of information and graphics and literally means the use of graphics to convey information. They are used to tell stories, convey ideas or explore issues through

graphics (Ferreira, 2014). Valero Sancho also provide a clearer definition of infographics. He describes it as an informative contribution carried out by means of iconic and typographic elements that allows or facilitates the understanding of events, actions, news or some of their most significant aspects, and accompanies or substitutes for the information text (Valero Sancho, 2001).

Though the use of infographics in journalism is not a new practice, it has been notice an increasing interest for it in the digital age especially in online newspapers (Ferreira, 2014). Woo counts that the mid 1900s witnesses the adoption of infografics in the mass media. İt was the time when publications such as Fortune magazine, Businessweek and Popular Mechanics began to use "infographics" regularly to convey data and complex information (Woo, 2015). The use of infographics starts in the 80's in American newspapers with the advent of color and as newspaper design was first used as a tool to make things clear. Based on some studies, Hang mentioned two main factors that explain the increasing interest of newspapers to İnfographics. They are the development technology and the editors' awareness of the fact that İnfographics can supplement text, help readers better understand stories (Hang, 2016).

Since newspapers started moving to the İnternet, İnfographics has gained more interest and come to the forefront of the most used practices today (Altin, 2017). Online newspapers are aware of the big quantity of information flowing every day and which they need to process in a way that readers can easily read and understand. Online newspapers then want to put maximum information in minimum space with clear understanding (Siricharoen, 2013). İnfographics is useful in online journalism because it has an informative function through a presentation of facts that enhance aesthetic and interactivity. İt brings together multimedia, interactivity and hypertextuality to allow the users trace an autonomous path (Pinto, 2017).

2.7.2.2 Search Engine Optimization (SEO) news

Search Engine Optimization (SEO) is a practice nowadays widely used in digital marketing to draw traffic to a website. Specifically, Search Engine Optimization is enabling a website to appear in top result lists of a search engine for some certain keywords (Yalçın & Köşe, 2010).

Veglis and Giomelakis define SEO as the practices aimed to increase the visibility and traffic a website or a web page receives from organic search engine results. The higher and more frequently a site appears in the Search Engine Results Page (SERP), the more visitors it will receive from the search engine's users. SEO is one of the leading and most influential activities in the field of online marketing (Veglis & Giomelakis, 2015).

According to Lluis Codina and others, the use of Search Engine Optimization is entirely tied up with the series of changes brought to the journalism field by the İnternet. They argued that those changes are mainly related to the new modes for disseminating the news via digital platforms. And the development of search engines together with the increase of competitiveness for information, result in an increasing dependence of media on Search Engine Optimization (SEO) (Lopezosa, Noci, & Codina, 2020).

As the principle of SEO is to show the most relevant websites in response to the searches of users (of the İnternet), media are consequently trying to maximize visibility on their websites and their different platforms. These last years, newsrooms have started working with SEO specialists for search engine positioning strategies. And the use of SEO technics in newsrooms has obviously changed news production and presentation routines. To allow search engines to find a content as relevant, it has to obey some technical requirements and that's why digital media contents or news presentation changes. With SEO application in newsrooms, news presentation has changed in a way that doesn't always enable the convergence between the best journalism and the best SEO practices (Dick, 2011).

SEO entrance in newsrooms has literally changed norms and practices. İt results in a direct impact on journalistic workflow and creates new challenges. News organizations redirect and redefine the news making process, among other things, around clickstream and SEO notion of news due to the convergence dynamics and the new challenges that face journalism as a whole (Spyridou & Veglis, 2012).

İt's even said that SEO has become the forefront and journalistic principles are being thrown out the window. Content is no longer being created for their readers but

simply for numbers and higher ranking, leading to sensationalized articles and clickbait. Though SEO helps journalists and their editors to understand what their audience wants and make that content is being seen and shows you what works, Thomas Broady believes that this type of technology is negatively affecting journalism. He argued that journalists' writing styles are suffering because Google's algorithm isn't human and don't pick up on emotive writing, the algorithm will pick out keywords so the headline and first paragraph must get to the point (Uognewspaper, 2019).

But regardless of the conflict between SEO rules and journalism writing principles, driving traffic is also an important key for media to survive. Richmond argues that SEO rules are as important as any of the Ws and inverted pyramid rules known in journalism as sacred (Richmond, 2008).

Unlike Richmond, İglesias-Garcia and others defend that all possible contradictions between SEO rules and journalism's ones have to be resolved in favor of journalistic criteria. They argue that journalistic principles must have primacy over SEO rules. While summarizing the new news production process to WCP acronym that stands for Write-Check-Publish, they stressed on the SEO Checking when all contradictions must be solved (Iglesias-García, García-Carretero, Codina, & Pedraza-Jimenez, 2016).

Though newsrooms are hiring SEO specialists, scholars argue that journalist are also performing some basic SEO tasks and have to improve their skills in SEO rules to fit the changing news production routines. For example, journalists can analyze search trends to identify newsworthy items and timeless topics, and converts them into news stories, reports, etc. that can be used to position content on Google. They can also use basic SEO actions such as optimization of headline, image and text for search engines on the news story (Lopezosa, Noci, & Codina, 2020).

Findings from Codina and others' interviews with both journalists and SEO specialists in Spain stated that the best strategy for positioning a website is a combination of the different types of SEO that are on-page SEO, off-page SEO and

technical SEO. But technical SEO is considered to be the most important (Lopezosa, Noci, & Codina, 2020).

According to Malaga, SEO strategies or process can be divided into four major categories that are key word research/selection, search engine indexing, on-page optimization and off-page optimization (Malaga, 2008). OnPage and OffPage factors are the features or properties of a page that help or hinder a search engine positioning. OnPage factors are totally concerned with the website's content such as keywords, appropriate content and internal link structure. The creator of the page has totally control over it. As far as OffPage factors are concerned, they include all the effort made away from the site like inbound links received from other websites and from mentions on social networks by social actors (Iglesias-García, García-Carretero, Codina, & Pedraza-Jimenez, 2016) .

İn past years, many studies and scholars have highlighted the importance of Search Engine Optimization in media field. And the increasing competitiveness in media sector has made SEO a must and made their survival almost dependent on it.

2.7.2.3 Data Journalism

Data journalism is said by Antonopoulos and Karyotakis to be a way of enhancing reporting and news writing with the use and examination of statistics in order to provide a deeper insight into a news story and to highlight relevant data. İn the digital era of journalism, it has become popular to disseminate information to the public via interactive online content through data visualization tools such as tables, graphs, maps, infographics, microsites, and visual world. The depth examination of such data sets can lead to more concrete results and observations regarding timely topics of interest according to Antonopoulos and Karyotakis. Moreover, data journalism may also reveal hidden issues that seemingly were not a property in the news coverage (Karyotakis & Antonopoulos, 2020).

Jessica Mariani argues that data journalism is important because it helps gather, filter and visualize what is happening beyond what the eyes can see. She identifies three broad types of data journalism. Traditional investigative data journalism finds

stories in the data with or without visualizations. The second type or data journalism is using the data to tell a story or explain a complex problem. İt involves graphics or visualizations. Another type is about providing a service or a tool that tells the reader something personally relevant (Mariani).

The difference between data journalism and other kinds of journalism is that date journalism gives the possibility to combine traditional journalism with the ability to tell a compelling story with the sheer scale and range of digital information now available (Mariani).

2.7.2.4　　News Games

News games can be defined as the use of game design element principles in non-game contexts aims at giving the user intrinsic or extrinsic motivation for engaging with content, often by giving the user a task linked to a scoring system, timer or other gauge of performance (Deterding, Björk, Nacke, Dixon, & Lawley, 2013). The general goal of news game is to motivate the user to improve his knowledge or change his behaviors (Hamari, Koivisto, & Sarsa, 2014).

İn the context of journalism, news games are part of the rise of news games across a variety of industries. The practice emerges not only from the news organizations' desire to deliver news value to audiences but also to drive traffic to their websites. The adoption of news games by news organizations also focuses on creating discrete news consumption experiences (Wojdynski, 2016).

Some scholars define news games as computer games used to participate in the public sphere with the intention of explaining or commenting on current news (Sicart, 2008). That is to say, news games fulfill the role of informational content or editorial content (Wojdynski, 2016). Above all, it seems clear that the core point of news games is interactivity. News games give the users control over elements and give them ability to discover, explore and understand. From that perspective the reason why news organizations engage in news games may to have audiences interacting with content or entertaining while consuming news. As the news consumption on mobile platforms

is rapidly growing and news consumers across the world are getting their news via smartphone or tablet, why news organizations invest in games (Wojdynski, 2016).

Games created by news organizations can take many forms as Wojdynski identified: identity quiz, knowledge quiz, simulation and topical play (Wojdynski, 2016).

İdentity quiz: Also called customized quiz, identity quiz allows the user to answer a series of questions in a multiple-choice format to find out the answer to a question that is usually framed to provide information about the user. These questions engage users in a kind of amusement where they are interacting with an online oracle seeking a dose of self-knowledge. At the end of the quiz, the user receives customized payoff in the form of information about himself.

Knowledge quiz: Unlike identity quiz, knowledge quiz requires the use to submit information that are less personal. By offering the user a series of answer from which they choose, knowledge quiz is based on a challenge principle. It allows users to gauge their ability to answer some questions that measure their knowledge. The quizzes can be based on news stories or very general.

Simulation: Simulation based games to engage in virtual actions where he approaches actions that take place in the real world. İn the context of news, simulations can be used to increase the degree of empathy between the news consumer and the subjects of the news story. This is usually done using animation, first-person perspective, and some sort of virtual experience. In most cases, the simulation ends after a set amount of time has elapsed, or a specific goal has been reached, and the player receives a grade based on their performance in the virtual task. Simulations allow the user to act in the role of one of the subjects in a news story.

Topical play: These kinds of games don't engage the user in content-related issues. Users are attracted to news organizations' site on the basis of the gameplay experience. Although they are similar to other digital games, they have ties to a news organization or a news topic.

2.7.3 Content Distribution in Online Journalism

To reach readers and to make them consume news, news organizations are using mainstream news sites, social media platforms, paying subscription and mail newsletters to which this subtitle is dedicated to.

2.7.3.1 Mainstream News Sites

Mainstream news sites are one of the great features of the development of the İnternet that ushered media in a new dynamics: online journalism. The new global revolution led to the launch of the first publishing online platforms in the mid-1990. Since ''The Star-Tribune'' has launched its online news website in April 1994 in the USA and followed by the ''The Daily Telegraph'' in Britain, the world has witnessed a tremendous growth of online newspapers. Some global major events that occur in the 1990s have supported how important publishing online was because of immediacy and interactivity (Rafeeq, 2014). İn the early 2000s, mainstream news sites were the widespread form of Online journalism. Deuze claimed that newspapers publishing online at that time were mainstream news sites (Deuze, 2001). Before the expansion of Social media, they were widely known as the fastest source of distribution of information in the modern world (Masouras & Papademetriou, 2015). According to Foust, two key advantages of online journalism over traditional journalism are immediacy and interactivity. While immediacy allows users to access information at the right time, interactivity gives them a control over it (Foust, 2011).

Some years after the advent of web-based information, almost all media organizations worldwide have gone online to fit the new news needs of their audience. Because the İnternet reduces the cost of producing and distributing information, many newspapers that didn't exist offline were born on the İnternet in the last years (Wang, Zeng, Zhu, Zheng, & Wang, 2012). Those online newspapers also called digital-native news publishers or ''born on the web news outlets'' has become as many as news portals (Pew Research Center , 2019).

The pace in online news consumption has been faster than anticipated (Ofcom, 2018). Many researches and surveys run in the last decade have shown that individuals

all around the world are more and more consuming news online (Newman, Dutton, & Blank, 2012). Online news portals have become the primary news source for more and more users as they easily have access to them (Wang, Zeng, Zhu, Zheng, & Wang, 2012). As online news portals grow, so do audiences and digital advertising revenues with technology companies playing a large role in the flow of both news and revenues (Pew Research Center , 2019).

Wang and others stated that most of news portals don't generate the information themselves though the amount of news they publish is very large. They reprint or re-post news articles generated by other news portals. Such practice allows news organizations to publish plentiful of information and to grab the attention of users (Wang, Zeng, Zhu, Zheng, & Wang, 2012).

2.7.3.2   Social Media Platforms

Online newspapers in seek of more audience are using various methods. One of the most widespread ways of reaching audiences that news organizations have been using is social media. They are strongly outreaching and engaging audiences through social media. A survey conducted in the USA in the mid-2019 showed that social media platforms such as Facebook, Twitter and İnstagram are widely used by news organization with official presence (Pew Research Center , 2019).

Lately, media organizations have started using social media to enhance their role in news production and distribution (Newman, Dutton, & Blank, 2012). As individuals are done with the days when the majority of people bought a paper in the morning, watched the TV news in the evening, they have developed new news consumption habits from how they get the news to where they get it. İn 2016, a survey conducted in the UK revealed that the primary platform people are reaching most of their news through is social media (Ofcom, 2017). Findings of a similar and more recent survey in the US has showed that social media has become the main source of news online. 64,5% of more than 2,4 billions of internet users receive breaking news from Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, Snapchat and Instagram instead of traditional media (Martin N. , 2018). Pew Research Center found in 2018 that Facebook is far and away the social media platform Americans most commonly use for news. YouTube which

has 21% of the users getting news from there is followed Twitter with 12% of the users. However, the prominence of each social media platform depends on its overall popularity and the extent to which people see news on. Other social media like İnstagram, Linkedİn, Snapchat have a smaller part of Americans getting news from social media platforms. The demographics of social media news consumers revealed that individuals are getting news from platforms according to their ages, their education level and many other criteria (Shearer & Matsa, 2018). While news organizations burst into social media to meet and find their audience where they are using most of their time, it's becoming more and more difficult to distinguish news from purely new media and entertainment. A report of Ofcom stated that social media is blurring the boundaries between news and content. On social media, news is said to be aggregated alongside other content, providing a convenient 'one-stop shop' for content (Ofcom, 2018).

Rather than the users' news intake, the real concern here is the reasons why news organizations burst into social media and how they are engaging with their audience. Mary Hiers stated that newspapers have discovered that having a social media strategy builds their audience and brand, drives website traffic, and improves revenue development features like premium subscriptions, advertising, and custom job boards (Hiers, 2014). İt's then clear that the main reason why news organizations started settling down on social media with official accounts is to conquer more audience and drive traffic to their websites.

As news consumption rises, so does competition. To keep up with the competition, news organizations are using different methods to drive traffic and engage with users. Bite-sized videos are very common on social media. They are easy to consume and have the benefit of drawing more audience to the more complete versions on the websites of the news organizations. On Twitter for example, news organizations are spots that gave a small insight to a larger article. These are generally bite-sized chunks that conveyed a greater message (Eşsiz, 2018). Generally, users are reaching news organizations' websites via breaking stories on social media. A survey showed that 57% increase in traffic on news sites referred from social media (Martin N. , 2018). News organizations are more and more creating high quality content and

easy to share content in a way that can spike readership. İncreasing their websites traffic also makes them engage regularly with users on social media (Hiers, 2014).

The spine of the battle for gaining audience is obviously supported by the revenue that can be reached by ads. As in traditional newspapers, advertisers are always looking for newspapers with big audience. With newspapers with strong presence on social media, advertisers want to reach a big audience. Advertisers are ready to take advantage of increased readership as big news stories can cause spikes in website traffic (Hiers, 2014).

2.7.3.3 Paying Subscription

Another way online media are using to distribute news and reach users is subscriptions. Online subscription allows publishers to establish a direct financial relationship with readers and supplement volatile digital advertising revenue and to make news profitable though revenue sources for media in general is becoming narrow. Online paid news are ''reserved'' news or ''high quality'' news. These are generally news readers can't have full access to if they don't have a subscription. Readers who are ready to pay for news enjoy a privileged status among audience (Watson, 2019). However, the market of people willing to pay for news is small and the potential for growth is limited. As revealed by statistics, many European countries have a slight part of the general audience subscribing for news. İn 2019, France and Spain had 10% of news subscribers while UK had 9% and 8% for Germany. Norway and Sweden have the highest percentages and growth of paying readers with respectively 34% and 27%. The US stayed stagnant since 2017 with 16% (Labarbera, 2019).

Besides, the appeal of online news subscriptions stems from disinformation campaigns, clickbait, and bias reporting that are driving people straight to doubt. İn spite of the unpredictable future of subscriptions, some news organizations are profiting immensely from online subscriptions. The New York Times earned about $400 million from online subscription in 2018 (Labarbera, 2019).

2.7.3.4   Mail Newsletters

A newsletter is a letter regularly sent by mail to a mailing list or subscribers. At the beginning, it was a marketing method with a commercial purpose. It is used to inform subscribers about discounts, new products or just tells about a new product to be released. İn E-commerce, it's a very fast and almost free way to reach bigger number of new potential customers. The ultimate goal of newsletters in e-commerce is to increase sales (Journal du net, 2019).

E-commerce methods has inspired media and news organizations to conquer new subscribers. Edmond Espanel says that a newsletter is a mini newspaper sent by email and which is a practical way to follow the news without needing to go through the news sites (Espanel). Brief.me which is exclusively a newsletters site is said to have gone from 5000 subscribers early January 2018 to 8000 subscribers one year later (Loisel, 2019).

The French weekly newspaper ''Le journal du Dimanche'' started experiencing daily newsletters since 2019 and has then found the ''best way to offer a content that goes directly to the readers''. Though it's a weekly newspaper, ''Le journal du Dimanche'' publishes every evening ''Le journal du Demain'' which is a digital edition sent to subscribers by email. The editor of ''Le journal du Dimanche'' Cyril Petit assumes that it's also a way to reconquer the lost readers. İn some weeks of experience, ''Le journal du Dimanche'' has gain 40% increase of subscribers. As said by the editor, newsletters help develop paying subscriptions (Loisel, 2019).

Worldwide, news organizations have engaged in that new way to hunt audience. Newsletters which have been used for years in e-commerce as a marketing tool have become a must for newsrooms.

By using newsletters, The Washington Post wants to send breaking news email alerts for major news whenever it breaks (The Washington Post). As far as The New York Time is concerned, it wants readers to ''the best of each issue with long reads, cover stories and columns like The Ethicist, Diagnosis and Eat'' (Nytimes). The Guardian propose the readers to sign up in order to get the day's headlines and

highlights emailed directly to them every morning (The Guardian). All the newsrooms are also offering readers the option to subscribe to any topic they may be interested in. Topic such as Politic, Economy, Environment, Sport and much more have they own dedicated newsletters the reader can choose to subscribe to.

Part 3

3 A Research on Online Journalism Economics in Turkey and Benin

This part of our study is going to address the new economic changes and practices brought by online journalism and how online news organizations are adapting to those changes. The purpose, the importance, the limits, the method and the results of the research will take place in this chapter.

3.1 The Problem of the Research

The arrival of New Technology and the İnternet in media field has lead news organizations to a new and changing economic dynamic. While deleting some expenses sources from the news production and distribution process, online journalism creates a new economy.

Paper which was one of the great expenses source for newspapers has been remove and left its place to digital. While news organizations needed to buy paper for every publication, online journalism can use endlessly the same place without necessarily the need to pay for it. The disappearance of paper, big source of expense causes media organization to save money and make more profit. That's why many news organizations all around the world join the new trend which is to go online. As reported by Comscore, news websites is increasing every year as well as users.

İn spite of the changes noticed in media industry, ads remain the main source of income for news organizations. Logically, news organizations online are fighting to get a big part of the ads cake as it's in conventional newspapers. Knowing that advertisers' first criteria to give ads online is the number users, news organization are trying their best to keep users spend more time on their websites and platforms. Basically, advertisers are choosing news websites were users click and spend the most time. This is making online newspapers develop different technics to direct and hold users on their websites. The part of the cake news organizations take mainly depends on the success they record in publishing and making their news read.

3.2   The Purpose of the Research

One of the purposes of this study is to identify the role played by digital versions of conventional newspapers in media economics. Moreover, it's intended to know the relationship between ads and online journalism taking into account the structure of the market, the income sources and expenses structures. Considered as a business, online newspapers have to invest into technology infrastructures, production and distribution processes to expect making profit. The greatness of the business, the structure of the production and the conditions in the sectors are mainly influencing the business' needs in investment.

These questions are going to direct the quest for data:

Research question 1: How are press businesses affected by the changes witnessed in media industry due to technologic development?

This question intends to search the changes that media businesses are undergoing owing to the development of technology. İt obviously wants to investigate how these changes reflect on ads sources.

As users are changing their habits towards how they are reaching news and contents, advertisers also are doing so. İn the second part of the study, we are going to examine how media organizations the changes created on content and content consuming.

Research question 2: What are the basic trends that can be mentioned within the production and distribution of content in online journalism?

This question will help investigate what online newspapers are taking into account for news production as well as for distribution. It will also help identify what channels they are using for distribution.

Research question 3: What king of employment has online journalism created? Does journalist need new skills or competence?

With this question, the aim is to explore the new kind of jobs created by online journalism. İt will also probe if internet's use in media sector force journalist to have new skills.

İnternet and technology creates convergence that cancel the limits between newspapers, radio and television. Nowadays, text, sounds, images and graphics can be all used on one channel and online newspapers are working according to that. So journalist have to be able to produce multimedia contents.

Research question 4: What are the income and expense sources of online newspapers? Does technical infrastructures cost dependence on ads increase?

İt's known that the main source of income of newspaper is advertisement whereas the biggest source of expense is printing and distribution. This question searches an answer for what the main expense source in online newspapers is where printing and distribution don't exist. The question also considers if there is any other source of income other than ads. The other answer that is searched is to know if the dependence of technical infrastructure cost on ads has increased.

Research question 5: İf newspapers depends on ads, are editorial content under the influence of advertisers?

İt's been said that ads are the most important source of income of newspapers and without ads it's almost impossible for newspapers to survive. The point of this question is to study the effect of newspapers' dependence on ads on editorial content. İt aims to see if ads influence the news or if advertisers do.

Research question 6: With the development of technology what are the new kinds of ads that appears and how does the content of ads change?

Online ads appear with online journalism that keep shaping it. The purpose of this question is to know the kind of ads that are taking place in news online. İt also intends to see what have changed within ads online. The advent of online journalism has induced a decrease of ads in traditional newspapers leading them more and more to online. Online ads have some many specificities that couldn't be found in conventional newspapers.

3.3   The İmportance of the Research

The advent of the internet brought about a new dynamic in the media world in the 90s. As the Internet became a channel and medium of information from the second half of the 1990s, this new field became a scientific curiosity. The new dynamic that has thus emerged in the media has attracted the attention of researchers who began by devoting their time and research to it. Rather, early research focused on the definition of online (internet) journalism, its characteristics and what differentiates it from traditional journalism.

While a new field of research has just emerged, research has been limited to a few aspects of online journalism. Articles focused more on the content of online journalism as well as the characteristics of online news. They have not taken too much into account the economic dynamics that have thus been created in the media industry. This is why this research gains all its importance by focusing on these economic dynamics that have arisen in the media sector. Our study is particularly interested in investments, sources of income and new economic trends underway in online media in Turkey and Benin.

This study is also so important because it takes into account advertising which remains one of the most important sources of income in both traditional and online media. İt consider how online newspapers contents have become highly important to attract advertisement, thus to make online media businesses earn money.

3.4   The Scope and Limits of the Research

This study based on media economics presents the historical and economic development or online newspapers in Turkey and Benin. İt investigates the product, market, competition, income and expense structures in online newspapers in both countries.

In addition to online newspapers which are not affiliated with any organization, other media such as radio, television or agencies, are present online through websites where they write and distribute the information. Nowadays, non-profit organizations and civil society organizations also do online broadcasting. For the purposes of this research, only online newspapers that have a print version will be taken into account.

In other words, this study focuses on online newspapers backed by a print journal. The institutionalization of conventional newspapers and the fact that they are considered more in academic research works also determines their inclusion in this study.

This research particularly takes into account the relationship between advertising and online journalism. Advertising is given this special place because it remains one of the media's most important sources of income of all time. As the blast of newspapers, it has been proven the impact of ads on media content and that is why it is important to see if advertising also impacts online newspapers content.

3.5   The Sampling of the Research

The sampling of the research is determined by purposive sampling. Furthermore, export sampling will be used because of the scope and the purpose of the study.

Also known as judgmental, selective or subjective sampling, purposive sampling relies on the judgment of the researcher when it comes to selecting the units that are to be studied. Generally, the investigated sample is quite small when compared to other sampling types such as probability sampling techniques. Unlike probability sampling, the method used in purposive sampling is not to make random selection from a population with the intention to make generalizations.

''The main goal of purposive sampling is to focus on particular characteristics of a population that are of interest, which will best enable you to answer your research questions. The sample being studied is not representative of the population, but for researchers pursuing qualitative or mixed methods research designs, this is not considered to be a weakness. Rather, it is a choice, the purpose of which varies depending on the type of purposing sampling technique that is used. For example, in homogeneous sampling, units are selected based on their having similar characteristics because such characteristics are of particular interested to the researcher. By contrast, critical case sampling is frequently used in exploratory, qualitative research in order to assess whether the phenomenon of interest even exists'' (Lund Research Ltd , 2012)

The main target of the research is made of the online newspapers that have a paper version in Turkey and in Benin. The sampling of the study is based on purposive sampling which helps choose from those newspapers we think are very active in the

online journalism industry. We also rely on some worldwide known organizations specialized in measuring audiences and advertising across platforms. This study considers the biggest audience holders 5 newspapers in Turkey and 5 of the biggest audience holders in Benin.

The list of the five more visited news websites has been found thanks to Alexa, an Amazon.com. According to Alexa's ranking in 2020, the news portals in the board below are among the top sites in Turkey (Alexa, 2020).

Ranking	Site Daily
1	Hurriyet.com.tr
2	Milliyet.com.tr
3	Sozcu.com.tr
4	Yenisafak.com
5	Sabah.com.tr
6	Akşam.com.tr
7	Posta.com.tr

These online newspapers list has been created from a list of 100 top websites in Turkey. The newspapers mentioned in the table above has then been created by us from the first newspaper mentioned in the list of Alexa to the last one. We have contacted all these newspapers for interview but we couldn't get any reply from Sabah, Akşam, Sözcü. Alternatively, Cumhuriyet and Yeni Çağ newspapers have been contacted to participate in the research. The newspapers where we got answers from are mentioned in the table below:

Organ	Name and Surname	Responsibility	Date of interview
Hurriyet	Gülgün Yavuz	General overseer	19.05.2021
Milliyet	Gülgün Yavuz	General overseer	19.05.2021
Posta	Mehmet Çoşkundeniz	Publication director	11.05.2021
Cumhuriyet	Ozan Yurtoğlu	Publication director of Cumhuriyet website	21.06.2021
Sözcü	Ozgan Saçkan	Publication director	22.06.2021
Yeni Çağ	Orhan Can	General Director of Digital Department	22.06.2021

As Benin is concerned, the top news websites are as below (W3newspapers):

Ranking	Site daily
1	Quotidien-lematinal.net
2	Lanationbenin.info
3	Lanouvelletribune.info
4	Levenementprecis.com
5	Matinlibre.com
6	Lepotentiel-benin.info
7	Les4verite.bj

As said above, to collect the information in Benin a Google form has been prepared and sent. People mentioned in the table below are those who replied and filled the form:

Organ	Name and Surname	Responsibility	Date of interview
Matin Libre	Bertran Houanho	Publication director	21.04.2021
La Nation	Paul Amoussou	Publication director	27.04.2021
La Nouvelle Tribune	Marcel Zoumenou	Editor-in-chief	30.04.2021
Les 4 Vérités	Blaise Tossou	Publication director	03.04.2021
Le Potentiel	Adrien Atinkpato	Publication director	10.05.2021

3.6   Research Technique and Data Collection Tools.

For this study, qualitative research technique has been used. Semi-structured question form has been used to collect the data. Because of the pandemic, it was not possible to do face to face interview as initially planned. Though it has been suggested to do the interviews by zoom, none of our interlocutors has really given a positive feedback for that. We have sent a question form in word format. They answered the questions and sent the document back to us. For people we had to meet in Benin, after contacting for the first time, we create a Google form which they filled and submitted.

These interviews are run between the 21st April and 22th June 2021.

3.7   The study's findings

The findings of the study have been set up by analyzing the answers provided by our interlocutors. According to the questions of the research, the results have been addressed under titles.

3.7.1 Ongoing Technologic Changes Effects on the Press Business in Turkey and in Benin.

This subtitle is dedicated to the research question number 1 which is looking for an answer to how technologic changes have affected the press business. İt's about to highlight the very changes that occur in media industry in general and particularly in terms of media economy.

İn Turkey, according to Mehmet Çoşkundeniz, Publications Coordinator of Posta Newspaper, it was decided to start publishing online since 2009 as their competitors started moving to the İnternet. ''We started publishing online because all of our competitors have switched to this type of publishing.'', he said. (Çoşkundeniz, 2021)

The journey online of Hürriyet newspaper started with the desire of newspapers to exist in digital and has evolved into online publishing "within the scope of the publication policy of the newspaper". Hürriyet, as revealed by Gülgün Yavuz went online in 1997 and therefore is among the pioneers of publishing online in Turkey (Yavuz, 2021).

Moving to the İnternet has undoubtedly involved some changes both in the media industry and in the advertisement world. Advertisers has been forced by the new trend even if they don't give up on existing in the traditional newspapers. Çoşkundeniz assumes that ads incomes online are more and more increasing but printed newspaper still brings the big part of ads revenue of Posta. '' While the advertising revenues of the printed newspaper decrease each year, the revenues of our digital media are increasing.'', recognized Mehmet.

Answering the question to know which one of printed or online newspaper is bringing more incomes, Gülgün Yavuz stated: ''10 or 15 years before, I would say that the printed newspaper brings more ads income. But the situation has changed now. Advertisers prioritize digital''. That is to say in spıte of the changes ongoing, printed newspaper is still bringing more ads income to Hürriyet than online.

As for Cumhuriyet, it started publishing online in 2008, meaning thirteen years ago. As explained by Ozan Yurtoğlu, Cumhuriyet presence on the İnternet was a

decision of the board which also decided the politics online of the newspaper. ''The board has also decided that publication online should have the same quality as the printed newspaper'', highlighted Ozan Yurtoğlu. For Ozan Yurtoğlu, ads incomes are almost the same both in Cumhuriyet print and online newspaper. He also acknowledges that the ads incomes are varying from time to time online. He especially highlights the fact that during corona time, people have been consuming more and more news online since they are at home. '' As people are constantly at home during the pandemic, internet reading rates have increased, which also contributed to advertising. In addition, there is an increase in advertisements on the founding anniversaries of the newspaper and on national holidays'' he clarified (Yurtoğlu, 2021).

Yeni Çağ newspaper went online about 18 years ago but has become active in the last 15 years as confessed by the digital department director, Orhan Can who ''don't know'' how the decision to go online was taken as it's previous to his start at Yeni Çağ. Regarding the ads income of Yeni Çağ, Orhan can thinks it's a commercial information he can't not give. But he explained that the online newspaper's ads incomes are increasing as the audience is growing. ''When you grow (in audience), ads incomes also grow. İt's directly proportional to click rate.'', he argued (Can, 2021) .

''Sözcü started its publication life in 2007. Its increasing effectiveness over the years has made it necessary for our newspaper to start its activities in online publishing. With the demand of our readers and the increasing interest in digital publishing, it was decided to publish on the internet as well'' explained Ozgan Saçkan (Saçkan, 2021).

İn Benin, Matin Libre newspaper was launched in august 2014 with both printed and online versions. Apart from the fact that the Newspaper comes out in the digital and İnternet era, the launch of both printed and online versions is explained as the wish to make the difference with all the newspapers that already exist. ''We had to start very strong with anything that is new technology such as website, social media, downloadable apps, etc.'', assured the publication director Bertran Houanho. Even if the main element was the printed version of the newspaper, it was also compelling to adapt to the demands of the time (Houanho, 2021).

İn 1996 when La Nation went online, it was a decision of the board of directors to get update with the new technology changes in media sector. '' The changes underway in the media sector must certainly have left officials of that time no choice'', argued Paul Amoussou the publication director of La Nation adding that was a step to future for the printed newspaper who exists since 1969. (Amoussou, 2021).

Created in 2001, La Nouvelle Tribune joins Benin newspapers concert online by 2010 and for the same reasons as its predecessors thanks to the newspaper's director's will to see the gazette in the new and future trend that is providing news online. ''La Nouvelle Tribune is among one of the first newspaper to be online in Benin'', claimed the editor-in-chief, Marcel Zoumenou. New technologies left no choice to La Nouvelle Tribune (Zoumenou, 2021).

As for Les 4 vérités, the newspaper's managing board decided to start publishing online as ''interest for printed newspaper starts to fall''. Publishing online has become a must to continue existing in the media industry. The publication director recognizes that the pressure of the internet on media industry has been increasing these last days. (Tossou, 2021).

Though it has a big audience Le Potentiel exists only in printed version until 2019 when it has been decided to create a website. ''İt was important to go online to face the competition becoming very fierce. Competition is not only economical, but it has mainly to do with the rapidness in giving the news'', assumed Adrien Atinkpato, the publication director.

As news starts to go online, advertisers also followed. Even if Bertran Houanho recognizes that advertisers are not used to being on the İnternet, it's real that more and more ads are present on newspapers' website. ''Advertising online hasn't yet become a habit for most of advertisers'', affirm Houando to say that advertisers are still faithful to printed newspapers. Matin Libre's ads incomes increase from time to time but heavily depends on ads in the printed newspaper. According to Houanho, many advertisers still prioritize print newspapers because above all, they need ''archives''. (Houanho, 2021).

La Nation also obtains most of his advertising revenue from the print newspaper. And the revenues in the paper journal continue to increase from time to time depending on the period (Amoussou, 2021).

La Nouvelle Tribune also is still taking the big part of its ads revenue form print newspaper but online ads are increasing not in terms of revenue but in terms of quantity. Zoumenou said that La Nouvelle Tribune is having more and more ads on its website but the revenue can't still equal the one of print newspaper (Zoumenou, 2021).

''As years pass, the website is welcoming more and more advertisers. The reforms we performed on it last year showed that the site has become more popular and is attracting more advertisers. And with the changes underway, we are foreseeing ads increase in a very close future'', explained Blaise Tossou. He recognizes that some advertisers remain attached to print because of some reasons (Tossou, 2021).

There's no variation for Le Potentiel where print newspaper ads revenue is the main. But Adrien Atinkpato has qualified that he doesn't know what time will show because the website is very young. ''İt too early to say that print newspaper will keep bringing consistent incomes as today'', he argued.

Compared to Benin, Turkey's newspapers have started publishing online earlier. Although the İnternet enter Turkey almost at the same time as in Benin, consuming news online goes faster in Turkey than in Benin because mainly probably of digital literacy rate that's still low in Benin. Turkey's newspapers are one step ahead of Benin's ones in terms of publishing online. For example, Le Potentiel which is one of the popular newspapers in Benin created its website just 2 years back. That's to say, even if publishing online is seen in Benin as a future stake, moving online has not been that speed.

Moreover, it's clear that advertisers have turned to the İnternet as newspapers start going online both in Benin and in Turkey. İn terms of revenue, both Turkey newspapers and Benin newspapers ads revenue are mainly coming from print newspapers. Ads online are increasing but still can't not bring as much revenue as print newspapers.

3.7.2 Production and Distribution Processes in Online Journalism in Turkey and in Benin.

To the question to know if the content in print newspaper is the same as in online, the publication coordinator of Posta, Mr. Mehmet Çoşkundeniz replies as below:

''In traditional journalism, the number of news that can be put in a newspaper is limited. Therefore, the choice is made more carefully. Many factors are taken into account. Factors such as opinion groups such as civil servants, workers, local governments, health, and education are important in the selection of news. In addition, the news are selected by the common mind of the editor and editorial staff of the newspaper. For this, at least 2 meetings are held a day. In digital publishing, speed is important. Therefore, almost all news is put on the website. However, the news with more clicks takes bigger and top upper place than the others.''

Addressing production and distribution processes in online journalism, Gülgün Yavuz has mainly highlighted the fact that time is very important. '' In journalism, all details are thoroughly investigated and will be published in the newspaper to be printed in the evening. The news is created as a result of hours of preparation for the newspaper. In digital, especially breaking news are served first and details are added later. Of course, there are news that have been spent hours on them, this is especially true for hot news. The speed issue is not that important in newspapers but is a key factor in digital'', described Gülgün Yavuz who also points out the fact that space in newspapers are so limited that all details cannot be put unlike digital where there's no space limitation.

About how news is presented on the internet, Posta and Hurriyet presented the differences from different perspectives. Çoşkundeniz assumes that news in print newspaper is not presented in the same way online because the main factors online which are time and speed play important roles. There's no time to deepen break news with expert views or past related event. These can be added with time but are not necessary at the first publication unlike print newspaper where the news have to be supported by expert views, past research, etc. On her side Gülgün said that the news

published in the print newspaper is published in the same way online apart from the difference that there is possibility to put as much as pictures online. She also argued that because of the limitation of space in print newspaper, a longer version of an article can be found online according to the importance it has to the public. Çoşkundeniz also mentioned the usage of ''plenty'' photos and galleries online talking about how contents are created online.

Reaching more and more audience is a key point of the competition between newspapers online. That's why newspapers online are trying everything to find the audience where it may be. Both Posta and Hurriyet are using social media such as Facebook, twitter, etc, to reach more audience.

'' There are some differences. But the priority online is speed. It is important to enter the news first and increase its readability. Visibility is also very important. Of course, our main criterion here is to report in line with our publishing principles. The news published first in the morning on www.cumhuriyet.com.tr are the news of the printed newspaper. Basically, we publish them in the same way. However, if we see a headline or a separate aspect that needs to be read or to be highlighted, we can transform the news.'' (Yurtoğlu, 2021)

Orhan Can also acknowledge that the content online is different from the one in traditional newspaper. ''Though they may look similar, there are big differences between online news and content in traditional newspaper. İnternet is like a living organism, you need to keep it alive and hot. İn traditional journalism, you have much time to correct a news unlike online where there's not time especially when it comes to breaking news'', he analyzes. He also adds that corner posts can't be changed even online whereas the other news can be changed according to the publishing politics of the newspaper (Can, 2021).

As said above by other journalist, Ozgan Saçkan from Sözcü makes the same observation: '' As there is no space limitation, the topics are covered in a richer and deeper way. While photographs, videos, graphics and audio accompany the written texts, the presentation of the texts can be different from the newspaper. News in the newspaper is often carried over to the Internet as it is. However, if the interviews are

too much in volume for the newspaper, the full version is put on the internet.'' (Saçkan, 2021)

In general, even if newspapers' websites seem to be autonomous, the reality is that they depend on the print newspaper. Paul Amoussou and Marcel Zoumenou affirmed that the contents are the same both in the print newspaper and on the website while Bertran Houanho and Adrien Atinkpato point out some differences between the online content and the print content of their newspapers. ''Sometimes, the content is the same but not always. İt varies according to many factors (length of articles, development of events, etc)'' explained Bertran who added that some news is only published on the website. ''All the news published in the print newspaper is systematically published on the website. But not the inverse. Some news cannot wait until the newspaper is printed and has to be served as hot. The website is good for such news'' declared the publication director of Les 4 vérités, Blaise Tossou.

While all the news published in the print newspaper are published online, there are some extra news online. Websites are active and are updated according to the trends during the day unlike the print newspapers which need to wait for the next day.

Like a global trend, Beninese newspapers are no exception. To reach more and more readers, they apply to post on social networks. All the people interviewed acknowledge that they are using social media to reach more people and generally younger people who are consuming more and more news online. ''We hold a Facebook page where we share the links of the news published on the website. We don't share the content but a link to the content in a way that readers have to visit our website'', confessed Bertran Hounaho.

It has also been noticed that news organizations are using WhatsApp groups for the expansion of news. ''The journalists used to share the news to the Whatsapp groups they belong to and that's a very speed way to reach more people especially when the title is attractive'', added Adrien Atinkpato.

Apart from the fact that İnstagram is not a very popular social media in Benin. News organizations are mainly using Facebook and Twitter to expand news and reach

more audience. But WhatsApp is also a common means that news organizations are using in Benin to spread news.

Turkey and Benin newspapers websites are not just copies of print newspapers. Even if they interrelated, there many differences between news websites and print newspapers. The first difference unlimited space online that allow to publish longer articles than in print newspapers. Moreover, websites can be updated many times a day while print newspapers have to wait the next day before any update. İt's about how speed news is published online. The core point of the competition between news organizations is also based on the speed.

İt has been found that social media is a common and popular way for news organizations to spread news and reach more audience. While Facebook, Twitter and İnstagram are used by news organizations in Turkey, Benin newspaper are using also WhatsApp groups to share links to their sites.

3.7.3 New fields of Employment and Skills in Demand in Online Journalism.

Data collected from the different interviews in Turkey clearly showed that in online journalism, new fields of employment and new skills are required from journalists. Çoşkundeniz mentioned some positions such as SEO editor, social media editor, product development specialist, static content producer (except hot news, content such as health, education, relationships, sexuality to answer people's questions), are some of the new positions that didn't exist and are now current in online journalism news production and distribution processes. Regarding the new skills demanded, he is very firm: '' Definitely, there are new skills in demand''. He went further regretting that there's ''unfortunately no appropriate schooling for those skills. ''New media departments don't meet these needs. Students graduated from these departments are not able to create content nor to choose news. They learn all these after starting working.'', Çoşkundeniz complained (Çoşkundeniz, 2021).

As for Hürriyet, the diagnostic is the same. ''The journalist who will work in digital should have a better knowledge of technology. He needs to be keen on social

media'' said Gülgün Yavuz. She also defines today's journalist as someone who is ''well informed about the world, interested in history, has a social circle, has a good command of foreign languages, is active in social media, has strong human relations and of course loves the journalism profession'' (Yavuz, 2021)

Cumhuriyet's website publication director Ozan Yurtoğlu talked about editor as a new position that appears in the work chain in online journalism. He assumes that ''entering the news correctly with video, content, visual and technical capabilities of truly competent people, called editors, now requires a new name other than the old definitions''. He also points out the fact that ''new generation journalism is internet''. His profile of today journalist is quite clear: '' the simplest and most basic rule is ten finger keyboard control. Apart from that, video content on the internet, command of social media, and effective mental ability to scan the news in the archive in a short time are indispensable'' (Can, 2021).

Ozgan Saçan thinks that journalists who are open to technological innovations and can keep up with them come to the fore more in this period. Competent use of the necessary tools for news production and presentation is a must for online publishing (Saçkan, 2021).

New fields of employments and skills demands in online journalism is also recognized in Benin. ''Apart from the knowledge of basic journalism rules, today's journalists have to be image reporters unlike the past. The ability to take good pictures and if necessary, record videos is very important'', explained Bertran Houanho. He added that there was no webmaster position before but now it's needed for the online newspaper.

The interview with Paul Amoussou helped to find that community manager is a new position born amid the changes that came along with online journalism. Even if La Nation don't have yet a community manager, they are planning to have as revealed by its publication director. To the position of community manager, Blaise Tossou added web designer that may not have to do directly with journalism.

Both in Turkey and in Benin, new fields of employments have appeared. SEO editor, social media editor, video editor, product development specialist are new positions created by online journalism in Turkey. But in Benin, none of these positions are yet available according to the interviews data. Webmaster, community manager are the only posts mentioned. That's to say, Turkey is one step ahead. Moreover, the skills required from journalists are almost the same in Turkey and in Benin. Apart from having good knowledge of basic journalism rules, today's journalists have to be multi-skilled. They have to be image reporters, have a good command of the İnternet and of foreign languages.

3.7.4 Revenue and Expenses Sources in Online Journalism in Turkey and in Benin.

Undeniably, advertisement is the biggest source of income of news organizations. İn this section, the core point is to investigate whether online newspapers have another source of income apart from ads.

3.7.4.1 Revenue Sources in Online Journalism in Turkey and in Benin.

Posta newspaper website has two sources of income according to Mehmet Çoşkundeniz. They are advertisement and sponsoring but the biggest source still remains ads which can be found on the website in forms of Banner, native, programmatic, Google, retargeting (Çoşkundeniz, 2021).

Speaking in the name of Hürriyet, Gülgün Yavuz acknowledged that only advertisement is the only one source of income of the two newspapers online. And all models of advertisement are used to ensure this income (Yavuz, 2021).

Even if he recognizes that the biggest part Cumhuriyet's income source is advertisement, Ozan Yurtoğlu adds that the newspaper has an e-newspaper version where subscriptions also bring money. Without explaining how, he also refers to social media where they are gaining money (Yurtoğlu, 2021).

As for Yeni Çağ newspaper, Orhan Can is very firm. ''For now, there's no other income than advertisement'' (Can, 2021). Same at Sözcü where ''advertisement and

subscriptions are the sources income. But the main source of in income is advertisement'' according to Ozgan Saçkan (Saçkan, 2021).

İn Benin, the situation remains the same. All the people interviewed for the research recognized that advertisement is the main income source of their newspaper online. But all types of advertisement are not available yet. The interviewed people generally mentioned banner and native advertisements.

100% of the income of newspapers online in Turkey and in Benin comes from advertisement. But unlike Turkey where advertisement types such as Banner, native, programmatic, Google, retargeting are used there are only banner and native advertisements used in Benin online newspapers.

3.7.4.2 Expenses Sources in Online Journalism in Turkey and in Benin.

İn print newspaper, the main source of expenses if known to be paper. But online, the main expenses sources are staff and infrastructure. Çoşkundeniz and Yavuz agreed that apart from the outgoings on the staffs, their newspapers are spending more and more money in technical infrastructure and software technology. Yurtoğlu addressed another side of the expenses in online journalism based on Cumhuriyet's experience:

'' The biggest source of expenses in online journalism is subscription to news agencies fees. For any new picture or video, new subscription is needed. Moreover, compared to traditional journalism, fewer people are needed to work. İt makes it easier in terms of expenses.'' (Yurtoğlu, 2021)

Can and Saçkan went in the same direction assuming that apart from staff salaries, internet subscription fees are the main expenses sources of their newspaper.

On the other side, Benin newspapers' expenses sources are almost the same with the only difference that internet connection cost is still very high in Benin as highlighted by all the people interviewed as part of the research.

İn Turkey and in Benin Online newspapers have the same sources of expenses: Staff and technical infrastructure. But it has to be noted that internet connection cost is high in Benin and implies big expenses for online newspapers.

3.7.5 Content and Ads Relationships in Online Journalism.

''All companies that advertise to digital publishing in Turkey care about the number of clicks. Since this is the only criterion, I don't think they are very selective when advertising to us or any other publication'' explained Mehmet Çoşkundeniz. That's to say, advertisers are going to newspapers which have the more visitors on their sites.

Unlike his colleague from Posta, Yavuz don't agree that the number of clicks is the only one criterion that advertisers are taking into account. She explained that the power of the brand is very effective here and important figures in the organization are the reason to be preferred.

The other point of the research was to know if advertisers have any influence on the content. But both Posta, Hürriyet and Milliyet haven't recognize that advertisers have any influence on the content.

''At Cumhuriyet, there's no practice like changing the news because the advertisers want. News is the most important thing for us. The advertisers adapt to that'', defended Yurtoğlu who is supported by Saçkan. ''We don't take into account criterion set by advertisers while writing contents. Our contents respect the right of people to news. We proceed on the path of shedding light on the truth.'', he argued.

Unlike all the other interviewees, Ozan Can is the only one who recognize that ads have influence on the content giving the example of his newspaper. ''Ads compulsorily influence the content.'', he responded. ''Ads are elements that make you lose or gain readers. Some readers can even give up reading you just because of ads. Without ads, you cannot live. Without clicks, you cannot have advertisements and thus cannot have any income. Without income, you cannot pay salaries'', justified Can.

As Benin is concerned, the ''seriousness'' and the audience of the newspaper are said to be the criteria advertisers are taking into account. ''At the first sight, audience is the most important thing for advertisers but to go beyond audience. İf you have big audience and you are not a serious newspaper, i am not sure advertisers will come to you'', said Paul Amoussou.

In general, audience and the number of clicks is the criteria advertisers are taking into account to advertise in a newspaper both in Turkey and in Benin.

Conclusion

This study focused on the different economic dynamics underway in the media industry in both Turkey and Benin. After the media started publishing online in the 1990s, online newspapers became quite important today.

This research focused on the development of online newspapers in Turkey and Benin and the various changes underway in the process of news production and distribution. By also addressing the place of advertising in online journalism, this study attempts to find an answer to the sources of income and expenditure of online newspapers. Seven (7) questions are investigated during the research.

The answers to the first question which investigated how press businesses are affected by the changes witnessed in media industry due to technologic development, showed that that the production process of news has changed both in Benin and in Turkey in terms of what is considered as news online with the factor of speed and time. Speed and time have become that important online that it changes what may not be called news in traditional journalism in news in online journalism. To reach more audience news organizations are using social media such as Facebook, İnstagram, Twitter. WhatsApp is also used in Benin to spread news.

The second question about the basic trends that can be mentioned within the production and distribution of content in online journalism, has got answers that pointed out the fact that Turkey newspapers have gone online earlier than Benin newspapers. Although the process is the same, the pace is quite different.

To the question to know what kind of employment online journalism has created and if journalists need new skills or competence, interviewees in Turkey mentioned new positions such as SEO editor, social media editor, product development specialist, video editor. İn Benin, just community manager and webmaster have been mentioned.

Another research question aimed to know what the income and expense sources of online newspapers are. As income sources of online newspapers are concerned, findings showed that ads remain the most important, if not the only one source of income. And it can also be seen that staff and technical infrastructure is what is taking the most money from news organizations in online news production and distribution.

Asking if newspapers depend on ads, are editorial content under the influence of advertisers, some news organizations, ads influence the content because they have to comply to what advertisers want to get ads that is the main, if not the only source of income. But the majority of news organizations doesn't recognize that their contents are under influence of advertisers.

With the question, with the development of technology what are the new kinds of ads that appears and how does the content of ads change; we found that many kinds of ads have appeared with internet. Banner, native, programmatic, Google, retargeting are the most common ads that are used.

Resources

Ace Project. *Ace Project*. Retrieved June 23, 2020, from www.aceproject.org: https://aceproject.org/ace-en/topics/ve/vef/vef01/vef01a

AfroBarometer. (2019). *Dépêches 269, Sources d'informations au Bénin.* Bénin.

Aghaei Sareh, Nematbakhsh Mohammad Ali & Farsani Hadi Khosravi (2012, January 31). Evolution of the World Wide Web: From Web 1.0 to Web 4.0. *International Journal of Web & Semantic Technology, 3*(1), 3.

Aktaş, Celalettin. (2007). İnternet'in Gazeteciliğe Getirdiği Yenilikler. *Selçuk İletişim, 5*(1), 30-41.

Albarran, Alan (1996). *Media Economics, Understanding Markets, Industries and Concepts.* Ames , Iowa, USA: Iowa State Universty Press.

Albarran, Alan (2002). *Media Economics Understanding Markets, Industries and Concepts.* Iowa State Press.

Alexa. (2020). *Alexa*. Retrieved from www.alexa.com: https://www.alexa.com/topsites/countries/TR

Alexander Alison, Owers James, Carveth Rod, Hollifield C. Ann, & Greco Albert N. (2004). *Media Economics: Theory and Practice* (3 ed.). Mahwah, New Jersey, USA: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., Publishers.

Alexia Internet. (2018, April 8). *alexa.com/topsites/countries/BJ*. January 6, 2019 tarihinde www.alexa.com: https://www.alexa.com/topsites/countries/BJ adresinden alındı

Altin, Nur Cemelelioğlu (2017). Use of Interactive Infographics in News Sites. (S. A. Publishers, Ed.) *Scholars Journal of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, 5*(11C), 1749-1754.

Amoussou, Paul. (2021, April 27). Effet des mutations technologiques en cours dans le secteur des médias sur le business de la presse. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Andrews, Evan. (2019, October 28). *A Mavel Channel*. Retrieved May 4, 2020, from history.com: https://www.history.com/news/who-invented-the-internet

Apilioğulları, Lüfti. (2014, November 8). *Sektorel*. Retrieved November 30, 2019, from www.sektorel.com: https://www.sektorel.com/lutfi-apiligullari/olcek-ve-kapsam-ekonomileri

Atatürk Kültür, Dil Ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu. (2016). Türk Basin Tarihi. *INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM ON TURKISH.* Istanbul: ATATÜRK ARAŞTIRMA MERKEZİ YAYINLARI.

Bardoel Jo L. H. & Deuze Mark. (2001). Network Journalism: Converging Competences of Old and New Media Professionals. *Australian Journalism Review, 23*(2), 91-103.

Baseman, K. C. (2003). *Partial Consolidation: The Detroit Newspaper Joint Operating (1988).* Retrieved April 29, 2020, from https://www.semanticscholar.org/: https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/1-Partial-Consolidation-%3A-The-Detroit-Newspaper-(-)-Baseman/3bd88aef3dffac5648d92759fb296dba137ed01f

Baytar, Orhan (2006). 1992-2002 Yılları Arasında Türkiye'de Basın İşletmelerinin Maliyet ve Gelir Yapısının Faaliyet Sonuçları Açısından İncelenmesi. *PhD Thesis.* Istanbul, Turkey: Marmara University.

Baytar, Orhan (2013). *Teorik ve Pratik Açıdan Medya Ekonomisine Bakış.* Konya: Çizgi Kitap EVi.

Blumler Jay G. & Nossiter Thomas. (1991). *Broadcastng Finance in Transition: A Comparative Handbook.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Bromley, Michael (1997). The End of Journalism? Changes in Workplace Practices in the Press and Broadcasting in the 1990s. In T. O'Malley, & M. Bromley, *A Journalism Reader.* (pp. 330-350). London: Routledge.

Can, Orhan (2021, June 22). Medya Endüstrisinde Yaşanılan Değişimlerine Basın İşletmeleri Üzerine Etkisi. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Castells, M. (1999). *Infornation Age: Economy, Society and Culture.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Cawley, Anthony (2008). News Production in an Irish Online Newsroom: Practice, Process and Culture. In C. A. Paterson, D. Domingo, & P. Lang (Ed.), *Making online news: the ethnography of new media production.* (pp. 45-60). New York, USA.

Cern. Retrieved June 23, 2020, from www.home.cern.fr: https://home.cern/fr/science/computing/birth-web

Cern. Retrieved June 23, 2020, from www.home.cern.fr: https://cds.cern.ch/images/CERN-HOMEWEB-PHO-2019-004-1

Choudhury, Nupur (2014). World Wide Web and Its Journey from Web 1.0 to Web 4.0. *International Journal of Computer Science and Information Technologies, 5*(6).

Christiansen Bryan & Lechman Ewa. (2016). *Neuroeconomics and Decision-Making Process.* (B. S. Reference, Ed.) Hershey PA: IGI Global.

Colander, David. (2006). *Post Walrasian Macroeconomics: Beyond the Dynamic Stochastic General Equilibrium Model.* Cambridge University Press.

Çetinkaya, Aysel. (2016). Doktora Tezi. *Günümüz Medya Ekonomisi Çerçevesinde Çevrimiçi Gazetecilik ve Reklam Ilişkisi*. Istanbul, Istanbul, Turkey.

Çetinkaya, Aysel. (2019). *İçerik Üretiminden Reklama Çevrimiçi Gazetecilik.* Istanbul: Nobel Akademik.

Çoşkundeniz, Mehmet (2021, May 11). Medya Endüstrisinde Yaşanılan Teknolojik Değişmelerin Basın İşletmeleri Üzerine Etkisi. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Darpa. Retrieved November 28, 2020, from www.darpa.mil: https://www.darpa.mil/about-us/timeline/modern-internet

Deterding Sebastian, Björk Staffan, Nacke Lennart, Dixon Dan, & Lawley Elizabeth. (2013). Designing gamification: creating gameful and playful experiences. *Proceedings of CHI '13 Extended Abstracts on Human Factors* (pp. 3263–3266). New York: ACM.

Deuze, Mark (2001). Online Journalism: Modelling the First Generation of News Media on the World Wide Web. *BibTeX record journals*, 29-39. doi:10.5210/fm.v6i10.893

Deuze, Mark (2001, April). Online Journalism: Modelling the First Generation of News Media on the World. *Peer-Reviewed Journal on The İnternet*(doi.org/10.5210/fm.v6i10.893).

Deuze, Mark (2003). The web and its journalisms: Considering the consequences of different types of news media online. *New Media & Society, 5*(2).

Deuze, Mark (2004). What is Multimedia Journalism. *Journalism Studies, 5*(2), 139-152.

Deuze, Mark (2004). What is Multimedia Journalism? (Routledge, Ed.) *Journalism Studies, 5*(2), 139-152.

Dick, M. (2011, August). Search engine optimisation in UK news production. *Journalism Practice, 4*(5), 462-477.

Dimmick John., Chen Yen & Li Zhan. (2004). Competition Between the Internet and Traditional News Media: The Gratification-Opportunities Niche Dimension. *Journal of Media Economics*, 19.

Dimmick., John W. (2003). *Media competition and coexistence : the theory of the niche.* London: Routledge Communication Series.

Diogo, Pelu. (2011). *Connaissance des médias.* Cotonou.

Doyle, Gillian (2002). *Understanding Media Economics.* London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Espanel, E. (n.d.). *Briefme*. Retrieved from www.brief.me: https://www.brief.me/qui-sommes-nous/

Eşsiz, İsmail Selin. (2018, December 10). *Daily Sabah*. Retrieved October 31, 2020, from dailysabah.com: https://www.dailysabah.com/readers-corner/2018/12/10/how-newspapers-can-adapt-to-social-media-trends

Ferreira, Jennifer. (2014). Infographics: An introduction. (C. University, Ed.) *Centre for Business in Society*.

Foust, Jim (2011). *Online journalism: Principles and practices of news for the web.* (3rd ed.). Routledge.

Frère, Marie-Soleil. (2000). *Presse et démocratie en Afrique francophone : les mots et les maux de la démocratie au Bénin et au Niger.* Paris: Karthala.

Friedman, Thomas L. (2005). *Globalization.* (S. a. Farrar, Dü.) USA.

Gabszewicz Jean, Laussel Didier & Sonnac Nathalie. (2003). Concentration in the Press Industry and the Theory of the "Circulation Spiral". *INSEE Journal*.

Gottinger, Hans. (2003). *Economics of Network Industries.* New York: Routledge Publishing.

Göllu, Y. E. (2017, November 15). *dunden-bugune-internet-gazeteciligi*. November 7, 2018 tarihinde gorgondergisi.org: http://gorgondergisi.org/dunden-bugune-internet-gazeteciligi/ adresinden alındı

Gustafsson, Karl Eric. *The Umbrella Model-Upside Down.* Retrieved May 26, 2020, from www.nordicom.gu.se: https://www.nordicom.gu.se/sites/default/files/kapitel-pdf/41_KEG.pdf

HAAC. (2014). Décision No. 14-001/HAAC., (s. 6). Cotonou.

Hall, Jim. (2001). *Online Journalism: A Critical Primer.* Pluto Press.

Hamari Juho, Koivisto Jonna & Sarsa Harri (2014). Does Gamification Work? — A Literature Review of Empirical Studies on Gamification. *The 47th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* (pp. 3025-3034). Hawaii: İEEE.

Hang, Zhou (2016). *THE USE OF INFOGRAPHICS IN NEWSPAPERS' BUSINESS REPORTING ABOUT GLOBAL MARKET SWING.* Columbia: University of Missouri-Columbia.

Hiers, Mary (2014, March 5). *Pandologic*. Retrieved October 29, 2020, from https://www.pandologic.com/: https://www.pandologic.com/publishers/news-publishers/social-media-helps-newspapers-increase-website-traffic/

Hoskins Colin, Mcfadyen Stuart, & Fnn Adam (2004). Market Structure, Theory of the firm and industrial organization. *Media Economics*.

Houanho, Bertran. (2021, April 21). Effet des mutations technologiques en cours dans le secteur des médias sur le business de la presse. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Iglesias-García Mar, García-Carretero Lucia, Codina Lluis & Pedraza-Jimenez Rafael. (2016). Search Engine Optimization and Online Journalism: The SEO-WCP Framework. (UPF, Dü.) *Technical Report*.

Instapage. (2019). *instapage.com/blog/search-engine-advertising*. Retrieved January 9, 2019, from instapage.com/blog/search-engine-advertising: https://instapage.com/blog/search-engine-advertising

Internet New Zealand Inc. (2016). *Portal Internet Data*. November 23, 2018 tarihinde idp.nz: https://idp.nz/Global-Rankings/ITU-Key-ICT-Indicators/6mef-ytg6 adresinden alındı

Jdn. (2011). *Jornal du Net*. Retrieved June 10, 2020, from www.journaldunet.com: http://www.journaldunet.com/web-tech/chiffres-internet/benin/pays-ben

Journal du net. (2019, February 3). *Journal du net*. Retrieved from www.journaldunet.fr: https://www.journaldunet.fr/business/dictionnaire-du-marketing/1198325-newsletter-definition-traduction-et-synonymes/

Kaplan, Oliver. (2017, January 4). *slideshare*. Retrieved May 30, 2020, from fr.slideshare.net: https://fr.slideshare.net/oliverkaplan1/ownership-of-the-media-industry

Karaduman, Murad (2005). Internet ve Gazetecilik. In S. Alankuş, *Yeni İletişim Teknolojileri ve Medya.* Istanbul: Ips İletişim Vakfı Yayınları.

Karli İhsan & Çetinkaya Aysel (2018). Haberciliğin Değişen Pratikleri: Çoklu Ortam, Çoklu Yetenek,Çevrimiçi Gazetecilik. *Online Academic Journal of Information Technology, 9*(35), 18-30.

Karyotakis Minos-Athanasios & Antonopoulos Nikos (2020). Data Jourlanism. *The SAGE International Encyclopedia of Mass Media and Society*.

Kasatria. (2017). *www.kasatria.com*. Retrieved January 7, 2019, from www.kasatria.com/basics-of-online-marketing/what-is-display-advertising: https://www.kasatria.com/basics-of-online-marketing/what-is-display-advertising#.XDSlMFUzbIU

Kokemuller, N. (2017). *yourbusiness.azcentral.com/advertorial-advertising*. January 9, 2019 tarihinde yourbusiness.azcentral.com: https://yourbusiness.azcentral.com/advertorial-advertising-5061.html adresinden alındı

Labarbera, Kathryn (2019, June 25). *Disqus*. Retrieved October 31, 31, from blog.disqus.com: https://blog.disqus.com/a-bleak-future-for-online-news-subscriptions

Lacy Stephen, Walter E., & Nieubaeur. (1995). Developing and Using Theory for Media Economics. *The Journal of Media Economics*, 5.

Lavine, John M. & Wackman Daniel B. (1988). *Managing Media Organizations: Effective Leadership of the Media.* New York: Longman.

Lipsey Richard G. & Chrystal Alec K. (1995). *An Introduction to Positive Economics* (8th ed.). New York: Oxford University Pres.

Livan, B. (2016). *History of Turkish press.* Retrieved December 30, 2018, from www.academia.edu.

Lohinto, Ken (1999). *SciencesPo Bordeaux*. Retrieved June 14, 2020, from www.polis.sciencespobordeaux.fr: http://www.polis.sciencespobordeaux.fr/resultats/Livre_enjeux/LOHENTO.pdf

Loisel, Thomas (2019, October 7). *La newsletter revient au goût du jour*. Retrieved from www.e-marketing.fr: https://www.e-marketing.fr/Thematique/media-1093/Breves/newsletter-revient-gout-jour-341856.htm

Lopezosa Carlos, Noci Javier Diaz & Codina Lluis. (2020, April). SEO and the digital news media: From the workplace to the classroom. *Comunicar.*

Lund Research Ltd . (2012). *Laerd Dissertation*. Retrieved from www.dissertation.laerd.com: https://dissertation.laerd.com/purposive-sampling.php

Malaga, Ross (2008). Worst Practices in Search Engine Optimization. *Communications of the ACM, 12*(51), 147–50.

Mariani, Jessica. Publishing and Journalism. Verona, Verona, İtaly.

Martin, Chuck. (2018). *Digital Transformation 3.0: The New Business-to-Consumer Connections of The Internet of Things.* New York: CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform.

Martin, Nicole. (2018, November 30). *Forbes*. Retrieved October 29, 2020, from www.forbes.com: https://www.forbes.com/sites/nicolemartin1/2018/11/30/how-social-media-has-changed-how-we-consume-news/#47f8298a3c3c

Masouras, A., & Papademetriou, C. (2015). Understanding Online News: Uses and Gratifications of Mainstream News. *International Journal of Strategic Innovative Marketing*.

Mauboussin, Michael Jacques (2004). Exploring Network Economies. *Legg Mason Capital Management*.

Mbengue, Ababacar (2005). SCP paradigm, evolutionary theory and strategic management: old debates, old data, new results. *19th international conference of strategic management.* Rue de la loire, Nantes.: International Association of Strategic Management.

McQuail, Denis (1992). *Media Perfomance: Mass Communication and the Public Interest.* London: Sage Publications.

McQuail, Denis (1992). *Media Performance: Mass Communication and The Public Interest.* London: Sage Publication Ltd.

Mierzejewska, Bozena I. (2011). Media Management in Theory and Practice. *Sages Publications*, 15.

Mitchelstein Eugenia & Boczkowski Pablo J. (2009, October). Between Tradition and Change: A Review of Recent Research on Online News Production. *Journalism*, 562.

Moschandreas, Maria (1994). *Business Economics.* London: Routledge Publishing.

Muhammad , Abdul-Mageed M. (2008). Online News Sites and Journalism 2.0: Reader Comments on Al Jazeera Arabic. *Triple C, 6*(2).

Native Advertising Institute. (2018). *Native Advertising Institute*. January 10, 2019 tarihinde nativeadvertisinginstitute.com: https://nativeadvertisinginstitute.com/blog/what-is-definition-native-advertising/ adresinden alındı

Newman Nic, Dutton William H. & Blank Grant (2012). Social Media in the Changing Ecology of News: The Fourth and Fifth Estates in Britain. *International Journal of Internet Science, 7*(1), 6-22.

Nicholas David, Williams Peter, Cole Peter & Martin Helen (2000). The impact of the Internet on information seeking in the Media. *Aslib Proceedings, 52*(3), 98-114.

Nytimes. Retrieved from www.nytimes.com: https://www.nytimes.com/newsletters

Ofcom. (2017, June 29). *Ofcom.* Retrieved October 29, 2020, from www.ofcom.org.uk: https://www.ofcom.org.uk/__data/assets/pdf_file/0016/103570/news-consumption-uk-2016.pdf

Ofcom. (2018, July 13). *Ofcom*. Retrieved October 29, 2020, from www.ofcom.com : https://www.ofcom.org.uk/__data/assets/pdf_file/0022/115915/Scrolling-News.pdf

Ofcom. (2018). *Scrolling news: The changing face.* London: Ofcom.

Office Of The Prime Minister Directorate General Of Press And Information. (2013). *Turkish media at a glance.* Ankara: Office Of The Prime Minister Directorate General Of Press And Iinformation.

O'Hara, Sarah (2020). What can we learn from independent family-owned local media groups? Cases studies from the United Kingdom. In A. Guiyas, & D. Baines, *The Routledge Companion to Local Media and Journalism.* Oxfordshire: Routledge.

Open Source Center. (2008). December 14, 2018 tarihinde https://fas.org/irp/dni/osc/turkish-news.pdf adresinden alındı

Oran, B. (2017, October 6). *en-cok-tiklanan-siteler*. 2019 1, January tarihinde wpmavi.com: https://wpmavi.com/blog/en-cok-tiklanan-siteler.html adresinden alındı

O'Reilly, T. (2006, December 10). *O'Reilly*. Retrieved June 13, 2020, from radar.oreilly.com: http://radar.oreilly.com/2006/12/web-20-compact-definition-tryi.html

Pavlik, John V. (2001). *Journalism and New Media.* Columbia University Press.

Pew Research Center . (2019, July 23). *Pew Reasearch Center*. Retrieved October 25, 2020, from https://www.pewresearch.org/: https://www.journalism.org/fact-sheet/digital-news/

Picard, Richard. G. (1989). *Media Economics Concepts and Issues.* New York: Sage.

Picard, Richard G. (2003). The Economics of Daily Newspaper Industry. *Media Economics: Theory and Practice.*(3), 109-125.

Picard, Richard G. (2006). Historical Trends and Patterns in Media Economics. In A. Albarran, & S. Chan-Olmsted, *Handbook of Media Management and Economics* (pp. 23-37). Mahwah, New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.

Picard, Richard G. (2010, November). A Business Perspective on Challenges Facing Journalism. *Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism*.

Pickard, Victor. (2015). Media Ownership. (G. Mazzoleni, Ed.) *The international Encyclopedia of Political Communication*.

Pinto, Costa Julio (2017, August). The Relevance of Digital Infographics in Online Newspapers. (S. University of Santiago de Compostela, Ed.) *European Scientific Journal.*, 428-434.

Quandt, Thorsten. (2008). News Tuning and Content Management: An Observation Study of Old and New Routines in German Online Newsrooms. In C. Paterson , D. Domingo, & P. Lang. (Ed.), *Making Online News.* (pp. 77-97). New York.

Rafeeq, A. (2014). Online journalism: A case study of interactivity of mainstream online news websites of the Maldives. *The Maldives National Journal of Research., 2*(1), 29-47.

Ramstad, Georg O. (1997). A model for structural analysis of the media market. *The Journal of Media Economics*(3), 46.

Richmond, Shane (2008). How SEO is changing journalism. *British Journalism Review, 19*(4), 51-55.

Rosse, James N. (1975). Economic Limits of Press Responsibility. *Studies in Industry Economics.*(56).

Saçkan, Ozgan. (2021, June 24). Medya Endüstrisinde Yaşanılan Değişimlerine Basın İşletmeleri Üzerine Etkisi. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Sayımer, İdil. (2008). *Sanal Ortamda Halkla İlişkiler.* Istanbul: Beta.

Shearer Elisa & Matsa Katerina Eva. (2018, September 10). *Pew Resaerch Center*. Retrieved October 29, 2020, from journalism.org: https://www.journalism.org/2018/09/10/news-use-across-social-media-platforms-2018/

Sheehan, Alexandra (2019, June 29). *Shopify*. Retrieved May 26, 2020, from www.shopify.com: https://ru.shopify.com/blog/niche-markets

Sicart, Miguel (2008). Newsgames: Theory and Design. In Springer-Verlag (Ed.), *7th International Conference on Entertainment Computing*, (pp. 27-33). Pittsburgh, PA.

Siricharoen, Waralak Vangdoiwang (2013, May). The International Conference on E-Technologies and Business on the Web. *Infographics: The New Communication Tools in Digital Age.* (U. o. Commerce, Ed.) Bangkok, Thailand: School of Science and Technology.

Sjøvaag Helle & Ohlsson Jonas (2019). Media Ownership and Journalism. *Oxford Research Encyclopedias* .

Smartyads. (2018). *smartyads.com/blog/what-is-programmatic-advertising/*. January 10, 2019 tarihinde smartyads.com: https://smartyads.com/blog/what-is-programmatic-advertising/ adresinden alındı

Smiciklas, Mark (2012). *The Power of Infographics: Using Pictures to Communicate and Connect with your Audiences.* İndianapolis: QUE.

Söylemez, Alev (1998). *Medya Ekonomisi ve Turkiye Önergi.* Ankara: Haberal Egitim Vakfi.

Spivack, Nova (2007). *Lifeboat Foundation*. Retrieved June 22, 2020, from www.lifeboat.com: https://lifeboat.com/ex/web.3.0

Spyridou Paschalia & Veglis Andreas (2012). Sustainable Online News Projects: Redefining Production Norms and Practices. *Proceedings of the 10th World Media Economics and Management Conference.* Thessaloniki.

The Electoral Knowledge Network. (2013). *ACE Project*. 2019 2, January tarihinde aceproject.org: https://aceproject.org/ace-fr/topics/me/meb/mab02e adresinden alındı

The Guardian. *Email-Newsletters*. Retrieved from www.thegardian.com: https://www.theguardian.com/email-newsletters?INTCMP=DOTCOM_FOOTER_NEWSLETTER_US

The Washington Post. (n.d.). Retrieved from www.thewashingtonpost.com: https://subscribe.washingtonpost.com/newsletters/#/newsletters

Tossou, Blaise (2021, May 3). Effet des mutations technologiques en cours dans le secteur des médias sur le business de la presse. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Unesco. (2018). */uis.unesco.org/country/BJ*. November 9, 2018 tarihinde uis.unesco.org: http://uis.unesco.org/country/BJ adresinden alındı

Uognewspaper. (2019). *Is SEO changing the face of journalism?* Retrieved September 20, 2020, from www.uoguniversal.com: https://www.uoguniversal.com/general/is-seo-changing-the-face-of-journalism/

Valero Sancho, José (2001). La Infografía: Técnicas, Análisis y Usos Periodísticos. (U. A. Barcelona., Ed.)

Veglis Andreas, & Giomelakis Dimitrios (2015, March 31). Employing Search Engine Optimization Techniques in Online News. *Studies in Media and Communication, 3*(1).

W3newspapers. (n.d.). *W3newspapers*. Retrieved from www.w3newspapers.com: https://www.w3newspapers.com/benin/

Wang Youzhong, Zeng Daniel, Zhu Bin, Zheng Xiaolong & Wang Feijue. (2012). Patterns of news dissemination through online news media:A case study in China. *Information Systems Frontiers*, 557-570.

Watson, Amy (2019, October 17). *Statista*. Retrieved October 31, 2020, from www.statista.com: Online news subscription rate worldwide 2017

Wojdynski, Bartosz (2016). Games and Quizzes in Online Journalism: Reaching Users via Interactivity and Customization. In H. Gangadharbatla, & D. Davis, *Emerging Research and Trends in Gamification.* (pp. 329-355). Hershey PA, USA: İGİ Global.

Woo, Eugene (2015, March 29). *Venngage*. Retrieved September 24, 2020, from www.venngage.com: https://venngage.com/blog/evolution-of-infographics/

Xiaoge, Xu (2012). Online journalism. (C. University of Nottingham Ningbo, Ed.)

Yalçın Nursel & Köşe Utku. (2010). What is search engine optimization: SEO? *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*(9), 487-493.

Yavuz, Gülgün. (2021, May 19). Medya Endüstrisinde Yaşanılan Değişimlerine Basın İşletmeleri Üzerine Etkisi. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Yurtoğlu, Ozan. (2021, June 22). Medya Endüstrisinde Yaşanılan Değişimlerine Basın İşletmeleri Üzerine Etkisi. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)

Zoumenou, Marcel. (2021, April 30). Effet des mutations technologiques en cours dans le secteur des médias sur le business de la presse. (C. Hounton, Interviewer)